

Architectural Actions on the Religious Heritage after Vatican II

Architectural Actions on the Religious Heritage after Vatican II

Edited by

Esteban Fernández-Cobián

**Cambridge
Scholars
Publishing**



Architectural Actions on the Religious Heritage after Vatican II

Edited by Esteban Fernández-Cobián

This book first published 2020

Cambridge Scholars Publishing

Lady Stephenson Library, Newcastle upon Tyne, NE6 2PA, UK

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Copyright © 2020 by Esteban Fernández-Cobián and contributors

All rights for this book reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the copyright owner.

ISBN (10): 1-5275-6033-3

ISBN (13): 978-1-5275-6033-8

TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Abbreviations.....	vii
List of Figures.....	ix
List of Contributors.....	xvii
Editor's Preface	
<i>Sixteen Views of Vatican II from Architecture</i> Esteban Fernández-Cobián.....	xix
Contributions	
<i>People of God or Body of Christ? Towards a Temple of the Spirit. Dynamism in Church Architecture</i> Bert Daelemans sj.....	3
<i>The Process of Renewal of Catholic Sacred Architecture through Ecclesiastical Norms and Magisterium (1969-2008)</i> Fernando López-Arias.....	35
<i>The First Liturgical Adjustments in the Archive of the Central Pontifical Commission for Sacred Art in Italy</i> Bárbara Fiorini.....	57
<i>Requirements, Qualities and Solutions. Remodelling Liturgical Spaces after Vatican II in Hungary</i> Erzsébet Urbán.....	71
<i>Interventions in Heritage Sacred Architecture after the Second Vatican Council in Croatia</i> Zorana Sokol-Gojnik, Igor Gojnik & Marija Banić.....	91
<i>'Remodeling and Enlarging an Old Church is not Necessarily an Attack' Interventions by the Secretariat of the New Churches of the Patriarchate in the Architectural Heritage of the Diocese of Lisbon (1965-1985)</i> João Alves da Cunha.....	113

<i>Brazilian Religious Heritage: for Culture, for the Sacred. The Inculturation as the Architect's Mission in the Projects of the Indigenous Communities and those Originated by Immigration</i> Tobias Bonk Machado	137
<i>Stewardship and Renewal of Places of Worship in Australia</i> Ursula De Jong & Flavia Marcello	155
<i>Parish Churches, Patrimony of the Community or of the Diocese? Community Interventions and Supervision of the Dioceses</i> Carla Zito	177
<i>'Ancient Churches and Modern Needs'. Reordering Anglican Churches in Postwar Britain</i> Lorenzo Grieco	195
<i>Dümmerling's Guiding Manual for Transformation of Sacred Spaces. A Central-East-European Approach in an Atheistic Political Environment after WW2</i> Zorán Vukoszávlyev	211
<i>Interaction / Cooperation. Sacral Architecture and Art in Germany</i> Walter Zahner	227
<i>Two Speeds. Time of Three Opera and Time of Users</i> Francesca Leto	247
<i>Modernity and Contemporaneity in Dialogue with the Heritage. The Life of Two Worship Spaces in Lisbon: Santa Isabel's Church and Rato's Chapel</i> João Luís Marques	269
<i>'Wherever a Few Should Gather' The Liturgical Movement and Vatican II as a Source for Architectural Transformation of Churches in the Context of Adaptive Reuse</i> Nikolaas Vande Keere, Bie Plevoets & Samuel Goyvaerts	289
<i>Ecclesial Reuse of Decommissioned Churches</i> Andrea Longhi	313
Index	327

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

1Co	1 Corinthians
1P	1 Peter
1Tim	1 Timothy
AA	<i>Apostolicam actuositatem</i> , Decree of the Second Vatican Council on the Apostolate of the Laity (November 18, 1965)
AAS	<i>Acta Apostolicae Sedis</i> (Vatican City)
AG	<i>Arquivo Generale</i> (General Archive)
ASV	<i>Arquivo Segreto Vaticano</i> (Secret Vatican Archive)
CCC	Catechism of the Catholic Church (1997)
CEI	<i>Conferenza Episcopale Italiana</i> (Italian Episcopal Conference)
CIC	<i>Codex Ius Canonici</i> (Code of Canon Law, 1983)
Col	Colossians
EEMB	<i>Egyházmegyei Egyházművészeti és Műemléki</i> (Diocesan Committees for Church Arts and Monuments, Hungary)
ESBAP	<i>Escola Superior Belas Artes do Porto</i> (Porto Fine Arts School, Portugal)
Ex	Exodus
FFSU	Fit for Sacred Use (Australia)
GIRM	General Instruction of the Roman Missal (March 17, 2003)
Gn	Genesis
GS	<i>Gaudium et Spes</i> , Pastoral constitution of the Second Vatican Council on the Church in the Modern World (December 7, 1965)
ICCD	<i>Istituto Centrale per la Catalogazione e Documentazione</i> (Central Institute for Catalogue and Documentation, Italy)
ICCROM	International Centre for the Study of the Preservation and Restoration of Cultural Property
ICOMOS	International Council on Monuments and Sites
ICORP	International Committee on Risk Preparedness
Is	Isaiah
JEC	<i>Juventude Escolar Católica</i> (Catholic School Youth, Portugal)
Jn	John (Gospel)
LG	<i>Lumen Gentium</i> , Dogmatic constitution of the Second Vatican Council on the Church (November 21, 1964)
Lk	Luke
MiBACT	<i>Ministero per i Beni e le Attività Culturali e il Turismo</i> (Ministry of Cultural Heritage and Activities and Tourism, Italy)
Mk	Mark

MRAR	<i>Movimento de Renovação da Arte Religiosa</i> (Religious Art Renovation Movement, Portugal)
NCRG	New Churches Research Group (UK)
NLAAC	Australia's National Liturgical Architecture and Art Council
ODEA	<i>Ordo dedicationis ecclesiae et altaris</i> (1977)
OEMT	<i>Országos Egyházművészeti és Műemléki Tanács</i> (National Church Art and Monuments, Hungary)
OMF	<i>Országos Műemléki Felügyelőség</i> (National Monument Inspectorate, Hungary)
PCCASI	<i>Pontificia Commissione Centrale per l'Arte Sacra in Italia</i> (Central Papal Commission for Religious Works of Art in Italy)
PG	<i>Patrologia Graeca, Series Graeca</i> , Paris, J.-P. Migne (1841-1864)
PIDE	<i>Polícia Internacional e de Defesa do Estado</i> (International Police and State Defense, Portugal)
PL	<i>Patrologia Latina, Series Latina</i> , Paris, J.-P. Migne (1857-1886)
PO	<i>Presbyterorum Ordinis</i> , Decree of the Second Vatican Council on the Ministry and Life of Priests (December 7, 1965)
Prv	Proverbs
Ps	Psalm
RÉKE	<i>Régi Épületek Kutatóinak Egyesülete</i> (Association of Old Building Researchers, Hungary)
Rev	Revelation (Apocalypse)
Rom	Romans
SC	<i>Sacrosanctum Concilium</i> , Constitution of the Second Vatican Council on the Sacred Liturgy (December 4, 1963)
sj	Societas Iesu (Society of Jesus)
SNIP	<i>Secretariado das Novas Igrejas do Patriarcado</i> (Secretariat of the New Churches of the Patriarchate; Lisbon, Portugal)
ST	<i>Summa Theologica</i> , St Thomas Aquinas (1265-1274)
UNBCE	<i>Ufficio nazionale per i beni culturali ecclesiastici e l'edilizia di culto</i> (National Office for Ecclesiastical Cultural Heritage and Building of Worship, Italy)
WW2	Second World War (1939-45)

LIST OF FIGURES

- 1.1 Rudolf Schwarz, *The Way*, 1938.
- 1.2 John Nava, Tapestries of the *Communion of Saints* (detail), in the Cathedral of Our Lady of the Angels, Los Angeles (USA), by Rafael Moneo, 2002.
- 1.3 Allmann, Sattler and Wappner, Church of the Heart of Jesus (*Herz Jesu*), Munich (Germany), 2000. Sunday Eucharist, August 25, 2012.
- 1.4 Corinne Callies and Jean-Marie Duthilleul, St François de Molitor, Paris (France), 2005. Parish church, Eucharist at Pentecost, June 12, 2011; Penitential Rites.
- 1.5 Rudolf Schwarz, *The Ring*, 1938.
- 1.6 Corinne Callies and Jean-Marie Duthilleul, St François de Molitor, Paris (France), 2005. Parish church, Eucharist at Pentecost, June 12, 2011; Eucharistic Prayer.
- 1.7 Craig W. Hartman/SOM, Christ the Light Cathedral, Oakland (USA), 2008; inside.
- 1.8 Craig W. Hartman/SOM, Christ the Light Cathedral, Oakland (USA), 2008; inscription at the foot of the altar.
- 1.9 Heins & LaFarge, St James Cathedral, Seattle (USA), 1905-07—1994.
- 1.10 St John the Baptist, Leuven (Belgium), 1232. University parish, Sunday Eucharist, September 15, 2019; Liturgy of the Word.
- 1.11 St John the Baptist, Leuven (Belgium), 1232. University parish, Sunday Eucharist, September 15, 2019; Eucharistic Prayer.
- 1.12 Juan Carlos Deltell Armenta, Church of the Reconciliation, Monastery of the Conversion, Sotillo de la Adrada (Spain), 2019.
- 1.13 Rudolf Schwarz, *The Cathedral of All Times*, 1938; global view incorporating Schwarz's own illustrations.
- 2.1 Paul VI presides over the Eucharist in the Sistine Chapel during the III General Assembly of the Synod of Bishops (09/27/1974).
- 2.2 Pierre Fakhoury, Basilica of Notre-Dame-de-la-Paix, Yamoussoukro (Ivory Coast, 1985-90).
- 2.3 Wojciech Pietrzyk, *Arka-Pana* (Ark of the Lord), Nowa Huta (Poland, 1969-77).
- 2.4 Steven Holl, St Ignatius Chapel, Seattle (USA, 1994-97).
- 2.5 Rafael Moneo, *Iesu*, San Sebastián (Spain, 2007-11).
- 2.6 Pope Francis celebrates Holy Mass in the Sistine Chapel during the Feast of the Baptism of the Lord (01/08/2017).
- 2.7 Archicura Study, The Transfiguration, Mussotto d'Alba, Cuneo (Italy, 2008-10); the ambo is distinguishable in the foreground.

- 2.8 John Pawson, St Moritz, Augsburg (Germany, 2008-13).
- 2.9 Claudio Pastro, Sanctuary of Our Lady Aparecida (Brazil, 2000 ss); decoration of the crucifix and the dome.
- 3.1 First page of the article by Giovanni Fallani «In preparazione al Concilio Vaticano II. L'Arte Sacra e la liturgia». *Fede e Arte* 1-2 (1962): 18-25.
- 3.2 Cover of the book edited by Giovanni Fallani *Orientamenti dell'arte sacra dopo il Vaticano II* (1969).
- 4.1 The Hungarian translations of the Vatican II documents published as little booklets by St Stephen's Society, 1966-88.
- 4.2 Some pages from the illustrated appendix to the OEMT bulletin: stone altars, ambos, baptismal wells.
- 4.3 The manual entitled *Preservation of Ecclesiastical Buildings and Works of Art*; cover and details from the book.
- 4.4 Tamás Guzsik, variations of transforming an existing liturgical space.
- 4.5 Entrance to the Esztergom Castle Chapel, Esztergom (Hungary).
- 4.6 Foundation walls of the excavated basilica, ruin garden, Székesfehérvár (Hungary), 1936.
- 4.7 János Sedlmayer, St Michael the Archangel Roman Catholic Church, Tar (Hungary), 1978-84; reconstruction.
- 4.8 Major monument protection and architectural journals and periodicals of the Roman Catholic Church.
- 4.9 St Stephen's Roman Catholic Church, Nagybörzsöny (Hungary). Architectural restoration plans: Ferenc Erdei, Zsuzsa Sedlmayrné Beck, 1966-67; archaeologist, Ida Romhányiné Ratkai.
- 4.10 Roman Catholic Church of the Sorrowful Virgin, Nagybörzsöny (Hungary). Architectural restoration plans: Zsuzsa Sedlmayrné Beck, 1966-67; archaeologist, Ida Romhányiné Ratkai.
- 4.11 John Pawson, St Martin's basilica, Pannonhalma (Hungary); transformation, 2008-12; restoration, 2015.
- 5.1 Churches built in Zagreb before the First World War: Viktor Kovačić, Saint Blaise (1915); Juraj Denzler, St Anthony of Padua (1934); Juraj Denzler, Saint Mary of Sljeme, Queen of Croats (1932); Juraj Neidhardt, Most Sacred Heart of Jesus (1931); Marjan Haberle, St Marko Krizin (1940).
- 5.2 Friedrich von Schmidt, Cathedral of the Assumption of Mary, Saint Stephen and Saint Ladislaus, Zagreb (Croatia), 1880-1906; interior.
- 5.3 Cathedral of St Domnius, Split (Croatia), 4th century and ss; intervention after Second Vatican Council.
- 5.4 Cathedral of St Domnius, Split (Croatia), 4th century and ss; intervention in 2012.
- 5.5 Cathedral of the Assumption of the Virgin Mary, Dubrovnik (Croatia), 17-18th century; sanctuary after the intervention in 1985.
- 5.6 St Quirinus, Krk (Croatia), 12th century; intervention in 1985.
- 5.7 Cathedral of St Stephen I, Hvar (Croatia), 14-17th centuries; new doors, 1987-90

- 5.8 Cathedral of St Stephen I, Hvar (Croatia), 14-17th centuries; new altar, 1990-93
- 5.9 Cathedral of Saint Teresa of Ávila, Požega (Croatia), 1754-73; intervention in 2007.
- 5.10 Cathedral of Saint Teresa of Ávila, Požega (Croatia), 1754-73; new doors by Marija Ujević Galetović (2017).
- 5.11 Assumption of the Blessed Virgin Mary, Zagreb (Croatia), 1756; intervention by Siloueta architecture (2015).
- 5.12 Assumption of the Blessed Virgin Mary, Zagreb (Croatia), 1756; intervention by Siloueta architecture (2015); detail of the altar.
- 5.13 St George, Zagreb (Croatia), 1729; intervention by Siloueta architecture (2015).
- 5.14 St George, Zagreb (Croatia), 1729; intervention by Siloueta architecture (2015); detail of the sanctuary.
- 6.1 São João Baptista, Alfeizerão (Portugal), 1965-67; facade.
- 6.2 São João Baptista, Alfeizerão (Portugal), 1965-67; original and renovated plan.
- 6.3 São João Baptista, Alfeizerão (Portugal), 1965-67; inside.
- 6.4 Nossa Senhora da Vitória, Famalicão da Nazaré (Portugal), 1966-68; facade.
- 6.5 Nossa Senhora da Vitória, Famalicão da Nazaré (Portugal), 1966-68; renovated plan.
- 6.6 Nossa Senhora da Vitória, Famalicão da Nazaré (Portugal), 1966-68; inside.
- 6.7 São João Baptista, Runa (Portugal), 1968-75; facade.
- 6.8 São João Baptista, Runa (Portugal), 1968-75; inside.
- 6.9 São João Baptista, Runa (Portugal), 1968-75; original and renovated plan.
- 6.10 São Sebastião, Pedra (Portugal), 1979-81; facade.
- 6.11 São Sebastião, Pedra (Portugal), 1979-81; arch of the old chapel during the works.
- 6.12 São Sebastião, Pedra (Portugal), 1979-81; renovated plan.
- 6.13 Nossa Senhora da Ajuda e São Lourenço, Ramalhal (Portugal), 1980-83; facade.
- 6.14 Nossa Senhora da Ajuda e São Lourenço, Ramalhal (Portugal), 1980-83; original and renovated plan.
- 6.15 Nossa Senhora da Ajuda e São Lourenço, Ramalhal (Portugal), 1980-83; inside.
- 6.16 X2 Architettura (Silvia Fornaciari & Marzia Zamboni) S. Floriano, Gavassa (Italy), 2011; facade.
- 6.17 X2 Architettura (Silvia Fornaciari & Marzia Zamboni) S. Floriano, Gavassa (Italy), 2011; plan.
- 6.18 X2 Architettura (Silvia Fornaciari & Marzia Zamboni) S. Floriano, Gavassa (Italy), 2011; interior of the new liturgical room.
- 7.1 Victor Meirelles, *A primeira missa no Brasil*, oil on canvas, Paris, 1860.
- 7.2 Yanomami Indians, *Shabono* Building Module, Maturacá Village (Brazil), 2016.
- 7.3 Mother Church of Saint Joseph, São José dos Pinhais (Brazil), 1905-20.

- 7.4 Mother Church of Saint Joseph, São José dos Pinhais (Brazil), 2007; after being elevated to a cathedral.
- 7.5 Mother Church of Saint Joseph, São José dos Pinhais (Brazil), 2010; with definitive furniture after being elevated to a cathedral.
- 7.6-7.9 Tobias Bonk Machado and Teresa Cristina Cavaco Gomes, New Mother Church and a Parish Complex of Our Lady of Guadalupe, São José dos Pinhais (Brazil), 2014.
- 7.10 Felipe de Campos Bicudo, Mother Church Sant'Ana, Itapeva (Brazil), 1785; with changes (1986).
- 7.11 Claudio Pastro, Sant'Ana's Mother Church after being elevated to a cathedral, Itapeva (Brazil), 1992.
- 7.12 Tobias Bonk Machado and Teresa Cristina Cavaco Gomes, Mother Church of Our Lady of Lourdes (*Yanomami Cathedral*), Maturacá Village (Brazil), 2016; external view.
- 7.13 Tobias Bonk Machado and Teresa Cristina Cavaco Gomes, Mother Church of Our Lady of Lourdes (*Yanomami Cathedral*), Maturacá Village (Brazil), 2016; constructive scheme.
- 7.14 Tobias Bonk Machado and Teresa Cristina Cavaco Gomes, Mother Church of Our Lady of Lourdes (*Yanomami Cathedral*), Maturacá Village (Brazil), 2016; section.
- 7.15 Tobias Bonk Machado and Teresa Cristina Cavaco Gomes, Mother Church of Our Lady of Lourdes (*Yanomami Cathedral*), Maturacá Village (Brazil), 2016; the interior.
- 8.1 William Wardell, St Patrick's Cathedral, Melbourne (Australia), 1858-97 (spire 1939); exterior view with Roy Simpson's diocesan offices in the foreground, 1970s.
- 8.2 William Wardell, St Patrick's Cathedral, Melbourne (Australia), 1858-97 (spire 1939); schematic plans before (left) and after (after) the interior re-ordering.
- 8.3 William Wardell, St Patrick's Cathedral, Melbourne (Australia), 1858-97 (spire 1939); interior view of the 1990s reordering, showing position of the permanent sanctuary in the crossing of the cathedral.
- 8.4 Harry J. Marks, SS Peter and Paul, Bulimba-Brisbane (Australia), 1926; worship according to the Tridentine model—a Latin Mass celebrated in a pre-Vatican II longitudinal church.
- 8.5 Harry J. Marks, SS Peter and Paul, Bulimba-Brisbane (Australia), 1926; interior view of 2015 Dion Seminara Architecture reordering: note change in orientation of seating, relocation of altar, ambo and baptismal font.
- 8.6 John Cyril Hawes, St Francis Xavier Cathedral, Geraldton (Australia), 1916-18.
- 8.7 John Cyril Hawes, St Francis Xavier Cathedral, Geraldton (Australia), 1916-18; overview of John Taylor architect's work on the ecclesiastical building and its precinct, opened in 2018.
- 8.8 John Cyril Hawes, St Francis Xavier Cathedral, Geraldton (Australia), 1916-18; interior reordering by John Taylor architect, opened in 2018.

- 8.9 John Mockridge (Mockridge Stahle & Mitchell), Mary Immaculate Church, Ivanhoe (Australia), 1960-62; exterior view not long after opening.
- 8.10 John Mockridge (Mockridge Stahle & Mitchell), Mary Immaculate Church, Ivanhoe (Australia), 1960-62; original plan.
- 8.11 John Mockridge (Mockridge Stahle & Mitchell), Mary Immaculate Church, Ivanhoe (Australia), 1960-62; interior view of fan shaped plan, looking towards sanctuary.
- 8.12 John Mockridge (Mockridge Stahle & Mitchell), Mary Immaculate Church, Ivanhoe (Australia), 1960-62; interior view of the Lady Chapel, original altar, statue and glass. Unsympathetic altar table and furnishings.
- 8.13 Romaldo Giurgola et al., St Patrick's Cathedral, Parramatta (Australia), 1997-2003; exterior view of rebuilt original building dating from 1857 and the new cathedral in the foreground, opened in 2003.
- 8.14 Romaldo Giurgola et al., St Patrick's Cathedral, Parramatta (Australia), 1997-2003; schematic plan, repurposed historic building on the right, provides entry to the new cathedral space on the left.
- 8.15 Romaldo Giurgola et al., St Patrick's Cathedral, Parramatta (Australia), 1997-2003; interior view of rebuilt and repurposed original building dating from 1857, now Cathedral entry, baptistery and Blessed Sacrament Chapel.
- 8.16 Romaldo Giurgola et al., St Patrick's Cathedral, Parramatta (Australia), 1997-2003; interior view of new cathedral featuring a light-filled open space, with seats facing the centrally located altar, ambo and cathedra.
- 9.1 Luigi Pratesi, San Nicola Vescovo, Turin (Italy), 1960-63.
- 9.2 Michele Berardo, San Giovanni Maria Vianney, Turin (Italy), 1962-70.
- 9.3 Gianfranco Fasana and Giuseppe Abbate, Gesù Crocifisso e Madonna delle Lacrime, Turin (Italy), 1959-65.
- 9.4 Oreste Dellapiana, San Giuseppe Benedetto Cottolengo, Turin (Italy), 1930-58.
- 9.5 Mario Bianco (eng.), San Paolo Apostolo, Turin (Italy), 1965-67.
- 9.6 Michele Berardo, San Giovanni Maria Vianney, Turin (Italy), 1962-70; the weekday chapel was built in 2008-09.
- 9.7 Silvio Ferrero, San Benedetto Abate, Turin (Italy), 1971-78; remodelling by Giorgio Comoglio, 2017-18.
- 9.8 Piero Contini and Marco Ghiotti (engs.), Santissimo Nome di Maria, Turin (Italy), 1955-72.
- 9.9 Santa Maria delle Grazie, Bruscianno-Naples (Italy), 18th century, remodelling 2017-18.
- 9.10 Antonino Tripodi, San Michele Arcangelo, Turin (Italy), 1966-71.
- 9.11 Felice Bardelli (eng.), Santa Famiglia di Nazareth, Turin (Italy), 1950-62.
- 10.1 Rudolf Schwarz, St Anna, Düren (Germany), 1954-56.
- 10.2 St Giles church, Sheldon (UK), 14th century; plan of the existing situation and the reordering proposal.
- 10.3 Holy Trinity church, Hotwells (UK), 1829; reordering.

- 10.4 St Andrew's church, Avonmouth (UK), 1893-1934, 1957; before the 2018 restoration.
- 10.5 Robert Potter, All Saints' church, Clifton (UK), 1967; axonometric cutaway.
- 10.6 John Piper, Interior of Coventry Cathedral, 1940.
- 10.7 George Pace, Holy Redeemer church, York (UK), 1962-64; interior view.
- 10.8 Burrough & Hannam, Holy Cross church, Filwood Park, Bristol (UK), 1949-50.
- 11.1 Siklós (Hungary), remodelling gothic interior; Pilisszentlélek (Hungary), remodelling baroque interior, 1960 ca.
- 11.2 Samples of the manual of Dümmerling, 1966.
- 11.3 Ilona Schönerné Pusztai, Roman Catholic Church of Our Lady, Nógrádsáp (Hungary), 1965-70; renovation.
- 11.4 Roman Catholic Church of Holy Trinity, Velemér (Hungary), 1963-70; before and after renovation.
- 11.5 Ágnes Vladár, Roman Catholic Church of St Michael the Archangel, Zalaszentmihályfa (Hungary), 1966-71; renovation.
- 11.6 Ágnes Vladár, Roman Catholic Church of Mary Magdalene, Sopronbánfalva (Hungary), 1969; renovation.
- 12.1 George Resenberg and Walter Zahner, eds. *Zusammenspiel—Kunst im sakralen Raum*, 2018; cover.
- 12.2 Technical Office of the Archdiocese of Freiburg, St Martin, Meckesheim, (Germany), 2015-16; main facade.
- 12.3 Technical Office of the Archdiocese of Freiburg, St Martin, Meckesheim, (Germany), 2015-16; ground plan.
- 12.4 Technical Office of the Archdiocese of Freiburg, St Martin, Meckesheim, (Germany), 2015-16; side facade.
- 12.5 Technical Office of the Archdiocese of Freiburg, St Martin, Meckesheim, (Germany), 2015-16; section.
- 12.6 Technical Office of the Archdiocese of Freiburg, St Martin, Meckesheim, (Germany), 2015-16; inside.
- 12.7 Staab Architekten, *Kolumbarium Liebfrauenkirche*, Dortmund (Germany), 2011; main façade.
- 12.8 Staab Architekten, *Kolumbarium Liebfrauenkirche*, Dortmund (Germany), 2011; plants.
- 12.9 Staab Architekten, *Kolumbarium Liebfrauenkirche*, Dortmund (Germany), 2011; inside.
- 12.10 Staab Architekten, *Kolumbarium Liebfrauenkirche*, Dortmund (Germany), 2011; detail.
- 12.11 Martin Weber, St Bonifatius, Frankfurt (Germany), 1926-27; reconfiguration, 2015 ca; facade.
- 12.12 Martin Weber, St Bonifatius, Frankfurt (Germany), 1926-27; reconfiguration, 2015 ca; inside.
- 12.13 Martin Weber, St Bonifatius, Frankfurt (Germany), 1926-27; reconfiguration, 2015 ca; ground plan.

- 12.14 John Pawson, reconfiguration of St Moritz, Augsburg (Germany), 2008-13; aerial view.
- 12.15 John Pawson, reconfiguration of St Moritz, Augsburg (Germany), 2008-13; presbiterial area.
- 12.16 John Pawson, reconfiguration of St Moritz, Augsburg (Germany), 2008-13; plan.
- 12.17 John Pawson, reconfiguration of St Moritz, Augsburg (Germany), 2008-13; church nave.
- 13.1 Vincenzo Scamozzi y Andrea Tirali, San Nicola da Tolentino, Venice (Italy), 1590-1714; façade.
- 13.2 Vincenzo Scamozzi y Andrea Tirali, San Nicola da Tolentino, Venice (Italy), 1590-1714; inside.
- 13.3 Alberto Gianfreda and Francesca Leto, San Nicola da Tolentino, Venice (Italy), 2016; first plain of provisional liturgical adaptament.
- 13.4 Alberto Gianfreda and Francesca Leto, San Nicola da Tolentino, Venice (Italy), 2016; first provisional liturgical adaptament.
- 13.5 Alberto Gianfreda and Francesca Leto, San Nicola da Tolentino, Venice (Italy), 2016; second plain of liturgical adaptament.
- 13.6 Alberto Gianfreda, San Nicola da Tolentino, Venice (Italy), 2016; study sketches of new liturgical places.
- 13.7 Alberto Gianfreda and Francesca Leto, San Nicola da Tolentino, Venice (Italy), 2016; interior view of liturgical adaptament.
- 13.8 Alberto Gianfreda, San Nicola da Tolentino, Venice (Italy), 2016; new altar, and antique altar of Baldassare Longhena with Giusto Le Court and ceiling.
- 13.9 Alberto Gianfreda, San Nicola da Tolentino, Venice (Italy), 2016; new altar in relationship with the tomb of the Patriarch Francesco Morosini, by Filippo Parodi.
- 13.10 Alberto Gianfreda, San Nicola da Tolentino, Venice (Italy), 2016; new ambo.
- 14.1 Santa Isabel church, Lisbon, ca. 1959.
- 14.2 Samuel Quinilha, project to change the church of Santa Isabel and its annexes, Lisbon, 1958.
- 14.3 António Freitas Leal and Diogo Lino Pimentel, renovation project for the church of Santa Isabel, Lisbon, 1960.
- 14.4 Presbytery of the church of Santa Isabel, Lisbon; original situation in 1958. António Freitas Leal and Diogo Lino Pimentel, refurbishment of the presbytery, 1960.
- 14.5 António Freitas Leal and Diogo Lino Pimentel, wind guard and confessionals of the church of Santa Isabel, Lisbon, 1960.
- 14.6 Gastão Cunha Ferreira, arrangement of the presbytery of the church of Santa Isabel, Lisbon; Holy Thursday celebration, 2019.
- 14.7 The sky of the church of Santa Isabel, Lisbon, before the 1960 renovation. The sky of Michael Birberstein, 2010.
- 14.8 Santa Isabel church, Lisbon, at present, 2019.

- 14.9 The new palace with chapel, at *Largo do Rato*, Lisbon, 1900 ca.
- 14.10 The rotation of the liturgical organisation in *Capela do Rato*, Lisbon, 1970 ca.
- 14.11 The interior of *Capela do Rato*, Lisbon; the heritage of a student chapel.
- 14.12 Interventions in the presbytery and assembly of *Capela do Rato*, Lisbon, by Pedro Cabral (furniture and designs), Pedro Ressano Garcia (carpet), Lourdes Castro (*Berlin Angel*), 2012.
- 15.1 Magdalena church, Bruges (Belgium); Popp map with situation of the church and the Astrid park around 1860.
- 15.2 Magdalena church, Bruges (Belgium); aerial view with current situation.
- 15.3 St Josef, Köln-Nippes (Germany), 1906-32-58; spatial rearrangement of choir and transept in time.
- 15.4 *Liebfrauen Kirche*, Trier (Germany), 1951; plan.
- 15.5 *Liebfrauen Kirche*, Trier (Germany), 1951; view.
- 15.6 Rudolf Schwarz, *Rittersaal*, Rothenfels (Germany), 1930; different forms of gathering.
- 15.7 Rudolf Schwarz, *Rittersaal*, Rothenfels (Germany), 1930; inside.
- 15.8 Rudolf Schwarz, *The open ring*, 1938.
- 15.9 Ottokar Uhl, Student chapel, Abbey of Melk (Austria), 1966; 1. Adoration; 2. Liturgy of the Word; 3. Offertory; 4. Eucharist (large group); 5. Eucharist (small group).
- 15.10 Ottokar Uhl, Student chapel, Abbey of Melk (Austria), 1966; a spatial choreography for the liturgy.
- 15.11 Franz-Xaver Lutz, Liturgical centre Rattenbach (Germany), 1979.
- 15.12 Aloys Goergen, Liturgical centre Rattenbach (Germany), 1979; the table for the Eucharist on the first floor. Goergen was a student at Rothenfels and assistant of Guardini in Berlin.
- 15.13 Magdalena Church, Bruges (Belgium); the agora space in the nave for various socio-cultural activities.
- 15.14 Magdalena Church, Bruges (Belgium); extension.
- 15.15 Magdalena Church, Bruges (Belgium); silent space.
- 15.16 Magdalena Church, Bruges (Belgium); exhibition.
- 15.17 Magdalena Church, Bruges (Belgium); café.
- 15.18 Magdalena Church and Astrid Park, Bruges (Belgium); the ambulatory activates the 19th century park and follows its formal language: undulating paths, circular kiosk and children's playground.
- 15.19 Magdalena Church, Bruges (Belgium); longitudinal section with the indication of the agora in the nave (emphasised by a curtain) and the liturgical space in and around the choir.
- 16.1 Front of the symposium brochure «*Dio non habita più qui?*», celebrated on November 28-29, 2018, at the Pontifical Gregorian University in Rome (Italy).

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

- ALVES DA CUNHA, João. PhD Architect, Universidade Católica Portuguesa (Lisbon, Portugal)
- BANIĆ, Marija. Architect, University of Zagreb (Croatia)
- BONK MACHADO, Tobias. Architect, Independent researcher, Curitiba (Brazil)
- DAELEMANS sj, Bert. PhD Theologian, Architect and Civil Engineer, Universidad Pontificia Comillas (Madrid, Spain)
- DE JONG, Ursula. PhD Architectural Historian, Deakin University (Geelong, Australia)
- FERNÁNDEZ-COBÍAN, Esteban. PhD Architect, Universidade da Coruña (Spain)
- FIORINI, Barbara. Architect, Independent researcher, Rome (Italy)
- GOJNIK, Igor. PhD Architect, University of Zagreb (Croatia)
- GOYVAERTS, Samuel. PhD Theologian, Tilburg University (Netherlands)
- GRIECO, Lorenzo. PhD Architect, University of Rome Tor Vergata (Rome, Italy); University of Kent (Canterbury, United Kingdom)
- LETO, Francesca. PhD Architect, Independent researcher, Camposampiero (Padova, Italy)
- LONGHI, Andrea. PhD Architect, Politecnico di Torino (Italy)
- LÓPEZ-ARIAS, Fernando. PhD Theologian and Architect, Pontificia Università della Santa Croce (Rome, Italy)
- MARCELLO, Flavia. PhD Architectural Historian, Swinburne University of Technology (Melbourne, Australia)
- MARQUES, João Luís. Architect, Universidade do Porto (Portugal)
- PLEVOETS, Bie. PhD Architect, Hasselt University (Belgium)
- SOKOL-GOJNIK, Zorana. PhD Architect, University of Zagreb (Croatia)
- URBÁN, Erzsébet. PhD Architect, BME-Faculty of Architecture (Budapest, Hungary)
- VANDE KEERE, Nikolaas. PhD Architect, Hasselt University (Belgium)
- VUKOSZÁVLYEV, Zorán. PhD Architect, BUTE-Budapest University of Technology and Economics (Hungary)
- ZAHNER, Walter. PhD Theologian, DG Deutsche Gesellschaft für christliche Kunst, Regensburg (Germany)
- ZITO, Carla,. PhD Architect, Independent researcher (Turin, Italy)

EDITOR'S PREFACE

SIXTEEN VIEWS OF VATICAN II FROM ARCHITECTURE

Esteban Fernández-Cobián

In the mid sixties, a process of renewal of the Catholic churches began, which sought to respond to the liturgical modifications implemented during the Second Vatican Council (1962-65). Fifty years later, this process continues to be problematic in buildings with a high heritage or historical value. The renovation of the places of worship—of its presbyteries, but also of the baptisteries and other sacramental spaces—has hardly been treated by the scientific literature, despite its enormous importance for the old buildings. In fact, we still wonder if there really existed general rules on the subject—or, in any case, suggestions or recommendations—that could have guided the different actors involved.

Perhaps it is convenient to distinguish between various concepts that emerged after the Council and that have now lost some brightness, such as provisional reform or definitive reform, ordinary or extraordinary action, etc. The evolution of the general post-conciliar liturgical norms, as well as the progressive taking into consideration of the local communities that used each space, incorporated additional factors of uncertainty. In these actions there are always dichotomies that provoke tensions often irresolvable: between the provisional and the definitive, between the new and the old, between what must be conserved and what the community demands, between tourist consumption and daily events, between the urban and the rural, etc. Thus, it is essential to know the criteria that support interventions, whether legal (both ecclesiastical or civil), architectural, artistic, liturgical or pastoral.

In different countries there were authorised voices that fostered paradigmatic experiences, created study commissions, published reference manuals or criticised excesses. Many of them have not received enough public recognition, or their contribution to the debate has not been disclosed. From

an operational point of view, it is stimulating to revisit the most relevant architectures at the international level, those high-impact works that were generated thanks to an open and serene dialogue between principals, architects, users, artists and patrimonial leaders. In this sense, what references could be used at a time like ours, dominated by conceptual liquidity? How to reform what has already been reformed? What is the role of art, archaeology, technology or lighting, heating or acoustic installations?

This book shows a selection of the papers that were presented at VI International Conference on Contemporary Religious Architecture, that was held in Porto from October 10 to 12, 2019.

The opening session, here entitled «People of God or Body of Christ? Towards a Temple of the Spirit. Dynamism in Church Architecture» was delivered by the architect, civil engineer and theologian Bert Daelemans sj, from Madrid (Spain). For Daelemans, there are two apparently contrasting ideas for thinking about the Church: People of God and Body of Christ. More than underlining the demotic or hierarchic character of the Church, their Biblical embedding allows recognising other complementary aspects, such as the historical insertion, the eschatological orientation, the centrality of the Eucharist, and the configuration with Christ. Concerning the repercussions on church architecture, the idea of Temple of the Spirit not only strengthens the experience of communion and the synaesthetic dimension of the building, but also allows combining the two aforementioned ideas in a dynamic use of the liturgical space, hence avoiding reductions to static church models. To live the liturgical space as an organic succession of communitarian configurations emphasises the celebrating assembly in its active participation. The three ecclesiological ideas express different attitudes to God's mystery: therefore, they must be understood as complementary configurations of one Eucharistic assembly during a celebration.

Another architect and theologian, Fernando López-Arias, from Rome (Italy), presented the paper «The Process of Renewal of Catholic Sacred Architecture through Ecclesiastical Norms and Magisterium (1969-2008)». From his view, the reform of the Liturgy after the Second Vatican Council (1962-65) implied a renewal of the criteria for the construction of buildings for worship in the Catholic Church. In a first phase (1969-88) this renovation was quickly assimilated by the sacred architecture of the time. Subsequently, a series of historical processes of the Catholic Liturgy and contemporary architecture gradually determined the development of a new period for contemporary sacred architecture (1988-2008). His paper concludes trying to identify the dynamics of evolution of Catholic sacred architecture

in the last fifteen years, in which some recent documents of the Papal Magisterium have had a special relevance: valorisation of the iconic dimension of church-building; sacredness; orientation; prominence of the ambo; relevance of the place where the Eucharist is reserved; extraliturgical; and devotional use of the temple and iconography and moderation of abstraction.

Since 1924, The Central Papal Commission for Religious Works of Art in Italy, an organ of The Holy See, with advisory and executive functions, has been operating with the aim of protecting and promoting sacred art. More than 6000 projects have been submitted to the Commission over about 60 years. Giovanni Fallani was the president of this Papal Commission during the Second Vatican Council. He is the drafter of the chapter included in the document *Sacrosanctum Concilium*, concerning the art into the liturgy. In her paper «The First Liturgical Adjustments in the Archive of the Central Pontifical Commission for Sacred Art in Italy», the researcher at the recently declassified and inventoried Vatican Secret Archive, Barbara Fiorini (Grosseto, Italy), reconstructs an unpublished cross-section regarding the ways of churches adaptation in the aftermath of the Council. In detail her researches focused on the compliance level of the projects with the liturgy and sacred art precepts by those who had actively participated into the provisions drafting.

After the Second World War the ecclesiastical property was drastically reduced in Hungary. However, Vatican II gave an intense motivation and impulse to the spiritual-psychical revival for the communities and by this time, the preservation of religious heritage also received professional and state attention. The restoration or reconstruction works were often linked with the acute interior transformations according to Vatican II. Although the Hungarian publication and interpretation of the reforms were relatively slow, still a few essential informative discussions were born. The Venice Charter (1964) also had a significant effect on the monument preservation methodology in this period. Analysing the theoretical approach of the Vatican II Constitution and Instruction, Erzsébet Urbán, from Budapest (Hungary), identifies a close parallelism with the architectural aspects of the Venice Charter: respect the old parts with the obviously distinguishable, new supplements, and create modern artworks with high artistic quality. The end of her paper «Requirements, qualities and solutions. Remodelling liturgical spaces after Vatican II in Hungary» cites some brief case studies to present the practical implementation of the directives.

Three researchers from Zagreb—Zorana Sokol-Gojnik, Igor Gojnik & Marija Banić, tell about «Interventions in Heritage Sacred Architecture af-

ter the Second Vatican Council in Croatia». In the period of the Second Vatican Council Croatia was part of Yugoslavia. A new political system promoted an atheistic worldview. The result of that process was a hostile relationship between the Church and the official government and a profound division of the Church and the society. It resulted in very rare interventions in the field of sacred architecture. Most of the interventions occurred in the adaptations of sanctuaries after the Second Vatican Council. Most of them were reflecting the lack of co-operation between experts. The change of political system has occurred in 1990. The new democratic system brought religions freedom but the new war destabilised society again. The result is a boom in the construction of sacred buildings reflecting the crisis of that moment. In the last decade, the situation is changing due to the initiatives that bring together theologians, liturgists, architects, architectural conservators, and artists in work on sacred buildings.

The pastoral renovation that the Second Vatican Council brought to the liturgy became a program to which architects sought to respond with new forms and solutions. In the Diocese of Lisbon, this work was led by SNIP—Secretariat of the New Churches of the Patriarchate, a small technical office created by Cardinal Cerejeira in 1961 to support the planning and construction of the many dozens of churches and chapels needed to be built throughout the diocese. But its work would not be limited to the new buildings. As SNIP recalled in 1968, in a time of renovation it became also necessary to remodel the old churches, adapting them to the needs and demands triggered by the conciliar liturgical Reform. Through five works carried out by SNIP between 1965 and 1985, the architect João Alves da Cunha, from Lisbon (Portugal), intend to reveal the formal and programmatic options adopted by this office in its interventions in the heritage of the diocese of Lisbon. His work is titled, provocatively, «‘Remodelling and enlarging an old church is not necessarily an attack’. Interventions by the Secretariat of the New Churches of the Patriarchate in the architectural heritage of the diocese of Lisbon (1965-1985)».

Let us now turn our gaze to Brazil, that immense majority Catholic country, led by Tobias Bonk Machado, architect from Curitiba. Civilised by Christianity, Brazil, with over than 500 years of history, built temples under the influence and inspiration of its colonisers that contributed to the Culture of this country of continental dimensions. Indigenous brothers in Christ, although numerically diminished, have a constructive identity and also play a key role in the evaluation of Brazilian architecture. After five centuries, the relationship of the Brazilian people with their temples goes through a mo-

ment of uncertainty with questionable architectural productions and most of the religious heritages degraded. Nevertheless, the mystagogical understanding of the sacred space after Vatican II is still a clearly evolving subject. Through this scenario, this article «Brazilian religious heritage: for Culture, for the sacred. The inculturation as mission of the architect in the projects of the indigenous communities and originated by the immigration» promotes debate about the role of the missionary architect in the interventions of the Brazilian sacred heritage and brings four case studies that demonstrate both the realities of inculturation for the implantation of an indigenous Church and those inherited from the architecture of immigration.

The National Liturgical Architecture and Art Council (NLAAC) is an advisory body to the Bishops' Commission for Liturgy of the Australian Catholic Bishops Conference, mandated to provide advice in the areas of liturgical architecture, art and heritage. The NLAAC has prepared Guidelines for use throughout the Catholic Church in Australia. The most recent of these documents, *Fit for Sacred Use: Stewardship and Renewal of Places of Worship* (2018) focuses on existing church buildings with particular reference to cultural heritage, and is the subject of the paper presented by architects Ursula de Jong and Flavia Marcello, from Geelong (Australia), and titled «Stewardship and renewal of places of worship in Australia». Vatican II sought the full and active liturgical participation of all the people and so existing churches were reordered to foster inclusion. It is timely to consider questions around what constitutes our heritage and how it is valued. *Fit for Sacred Use* sets out the liturgical and heritage principles which are fundamental to conserving, renovating and reordering a church building. Its holistic approach considers how we renew our churches while honouring our heritage.

Carla Zito's intervention «Parish Churches, Patrimony of the Community or of the Diocese? Community Interventions and Supervision of the Dioceses», was born as a reflection on the Census of churches of her diocese, Turin, organised by the CEI (Italian Episcopal Conference). Through her studies, Zito observed the case of Turin ecclesiastical heritage built in the second half of the 20th century. A great number of places of worship have changed their historical validity due to arbitrariness of choices and interventions. This architect has always supported the thesis that this religious buildings are an important patrimony for the urban history and expression of the pastoral liturgy of the diocese in Italy and that the community is fundamental to the birth and the management of a parish centre. Now, she thinks that it is necessary to consolidate project strategies and fix best-prac-

tices to preserve the ecclesiastic heritage from everyone's action. And therefore, she wonders: Generally speaking, what contemporary buildings can be part of the Church heritage? How far can priests and communities decide, independently, to intervene?

In the second Post-war, the discussion on liturgy and architecture in Britain suffered a certain delay, as denounced in *Liturgy and Architecture* (1960) by the Anglican priest Peter Hammond. An entire chapter of the book was dedicated to renovations of existing churches, underlining the importance of function over aesthetics. Among the many examples cited, the Victorian chapel at Blundell's School was readapted around 1938 with a central altar on the design of sculptor Eric Gill, invited by the headmaster Neville Gorton. Bishop of Coventry from 1943, Gorton sat in the judging board for the reconstruction of the bombed St. Michael's cathedral. The construction (1951-62) of the winning proposal by Basil Spence, with the new addition facing the relics of the medieval church, inaugurated a British way to deal with memory in the reconstruction and adaptation of old churches. In his paper «'Ancient Churches and Modern Needs'. Reordering Anglican Churches in Postwar Britain», Lorenzo Grieco, Italian researcher from Canterbury (UK) stand out the names of George Pace and Robert Potter, two of the most brilliant rearrangers of churches of the time within the vast post-war reconstruction program.

On his paper «Dümmerling's guiding manual for transformation of sacred spaces», Zorán Vukoszávlyev (Budapest, Hungary), claims that the *Sacrosanctum Concilium* approaches the artistic aspects of architecture from the liturgy, while the Charter of Venice approaches the architectural space from the principles of heritage protection, and that both emphasised simplicity, functionality and readability. The significance and the combined effect of the two documents in the practice of church construction in Eastern Europe can be considered significant, since the possibility of redesigning the liturgical space arose mainly in the context of the renovation of historic buildings in the atheist political environment. The proof of this statement is presented in the manuscript of the architect Ödön Dümmerling. The architect—a practitioner of monument restorations and an admirer of the spirit of modern architecture—was called upon to draw up design guide after the Second Vatican Council was closed, making recommendations for new equipment for liturgical spaces.

The theologian and Director of the German Society for Christian Art in Munich (Germany), Walter Zahner, presents the text «Working Together. Sacred Space(s) and Contemporary Art(work)». Since 2000, in Germany

there are both new built churches (around one hundred, sixty for the Catholic dioceses) and abandoned churches (around 500-600 Catholic churches, as well as some 500 Protestants). The reconverted churches are a reality in the north and east of Germany, up to half the country, while in the south, both in the Catholic dioceses and in the Protestant regional churches, there are only some first examples and initial debates on these issues. Most of the relevant works of architecture and art within ecclesiastical organisations are churches reorganised from the point of view of the postconciliar liturgy and for smaller parish groups. At present, there are already very good examples of all the indicated types of church architecture.

For Francesca Leto, architect and researcher from Padova (Italy), the form of faith is a living form, starting from a Urform, according to an aesthetics manner. On her paper «Two Speeds. Time of Three Opera and Time of Users», she explains that art and architecture have the same virtual capacity of ritual to create the counterintuitive world. There are two ways of transmitting faith: repetition and emotion. Repetition is the form of the ritual and emotion is what all the three opera must have in common. Liturgy, Art and Architecture are understood as opus. There is a temporal relationship between vital becoming of this three opera and the user. Forms change over time and they should continue communicating on the basis of a positive relationship with users. In the Italian context there is a fracture between some users and the making of the form. The fracture needs to be reconciled through an appropriate education of principals and worshippers. The methodological process for Alberto Gianfreda's liturgical adaptation of Tolentini's church in Venice is brought to attention.

Since the 1960s, the artistic and architectural interventions carried out in the church of Santa Isabel and Rato chapel, in Lisbon, brought to the debate the overlap of different narratives in these two different spaces of worship: the first, is a parish church preserved by the earthquake of Lisbon (1755), which had its liturgical space redesigned before the Second Vatican Council; the second, is a private chapel annexed to a 18th century palace that became a symbolic worship space for students and engaged young professionals since the 1970s. Enriched with the work of either well-known artists or, sometimes, anonymous architects, the paper «Modernity and contemporaneity in dialogue with the heritage. The life of two worship spaces in Lisbon Santa Isabel's church and Rato's chapel» shows us two case studies where Modern and Contemporary Art and Architecture participate in preserving and enhancing their cultural value. At the same time, the liturgical

and pastoral activities are shown by João Luis Marques (Porto, Portugal) to be the engine behind successive interventions.

Due to a process of secularisation many parish communities need to redefine their church use, reducing the liturgical space and bringing in other functions. In their contribution «‘Wherever a few should gather’. The Liturgical Movement and Vatican II as a source for architectural transformation of churches in the context of adaptive reuse», architects Nikolaas Vande Keere and Bie Plevoets, from Hasselt University (Belgium), and theologian Samuel Goyvaerts, from Tilburg University (Netherlands) elaborate on the process of adapting existing churches to this reality. We argue that the spatial concepts developed by the Liturgical Movement in the context of Vatican II can become sources of inspiration. First, they define the relevant characteristics of the reform, instigated by figures like theologian Romano Guardini and architect Rudolf Schwarz. Second, they show how these characteristics can be applied in the case study of the Magdalena church in Bruges (Belgium). Rather than restoring the 19th century Gothic Revival church, they tried to translate its typology and layered quality into a contemporary space for liturgy and community, while at the same time opening up the church to its environment.

The volume is closed with the text by Professor Andrea Longhi, from Turin (Italy), entitled «Ecclesial reuse of decommissioned churches. Historical and critical issues in the recent document by the Pontifical Council for Culture (2018)» on the abandonment and reuse of redundant or underused churches, a topic that involves both the scientific debate and the ecclesial communities. For the first time ever, the Vatican institution dedicated to cultural heritage has promoted an investigation among Episcopal conferences in Europe, North America and Australia, in order to formulate common Guidelines concerning reuse of decommissioned churches. A final document was discussed and approved by the official delegations of 23 Episcopal conferences, and published by cardinal Gianfranco Ravasi 17th December 2018. This paper underlines certain aspects of the document, in particular: the relationship between identity and adaptivity of historic buildings; the role of historical investigations in defining transformation possibilities of decommissioned churches; the resilience of religious heritage; the involvement of local communities and new heritage communities in heritagization and reuse processes; and the need for regional planning in the definition of strategies shared between the ecclesial communities and civil society.

A Coruña, June 18, 2020

CONTRIBUTIONS

PEOPLE OF GOD OR BODY OF CHRIST?

TOWARDS A TEMPLE OF THE SPIRIT-DYNAMISM IN CHURCH ARCHITECTURE

Bert Daelemans sj

INTRODUCTION

How does the way Eucharistic assemblies use their liturgical spaces influence their way of thinking about God and about the Church? In the past, two major ecclesiological ideas, namely Body of Christ and People of God, have been (and are often still) used in a contrasting way, in order to highlight differing ways of considering the Church (demotic or hierarchic). However, by recovering their Biblical embedding, it is my intention to highlight their *complementary* nature in emphasising on the one hand the Church's *historical* insertion and *eschatological* orientation, and, on the other, the centrality of the *Eucharist* and the Church's configuration with *Christ*. This opens the view to the third and necessarily complementary idea, that of Temple of the Spirit, which not only accentuates the strengths of both models, but is also in the first place creative and *dynamic* and thus allows all of these images to be applied together.

In this contribution, I visit and analyse some recent church buildings where local communities demonstrate a rich and profound theological and mystagogical use of their liturgical space. In this way, the architecture and especially its communitarian appropriation not only contribute to bring to light the nature of the Church as People of God, Body of Christ, and Temple of the Spirit, but even more play an essential role in *configuring* the local community into People of God, Body of Christ, and Temple of the Spirit. Those few examples, among others, reveal how the three complementary ecclesiological ideas do not imply necessarily a static use of the liturgical space but a *dynamic* one that is in creative and faithful conformity with the intuitions of the Liturgical Movement and of the Second Vatican Council.

A TENT ON THE MOVE

In the last chapter of the book of Exodus, while the People of God are travelling through the desert towards the Promised Land, Moses builds the sanctuary according to the instructions of the Lord. This sanctuary is known as the *tabernacle* or tent of Encounter. At its completion, a cloud overshadows the tent in a similar way that the Holy Spirit later would overshadow the Virgin (Lk 1:35). The glory (*kabôd*) of the Lord filled the tent «so that Moses could not enter» (Ex 40:34-35).

This is a sign of the absolute *sacredness* of this holy place in the midst of the pilgrim People of God. It is a *domus Dei*, a house of God, set apart for the divine encounter. This sacredness is so absolute that even Moses, the Mediator between God and His People, could not enter the tent. In every age it is important, and today perhaps more than ever, to continue building holy places *set apart* for the encounter with the transcendent God.

However, the very last sentence of Exodus adds some dynamism to this reality. The book does not finish with the construction of the holy place, but it ends in *movement*, with a People and their God—or rather God and His People—together on the move. When the cloud—a sign of God’s presence—rose above the Tent, only then the People would continue their journey (Ex 40:36-38). They did not move if the cloud remained where it was: there was no point in overtaking the Lord in their rush to reach the Holy Land. This means that God journeyed with the People and could always be encountered in the midst of them, in their *Tent on the move*.

In *theological* terms, this ancient text speaks about the paradoxical transcendence within immanence, of the absolute sanctity that is made present to us *within* the visible signs relative to the familiarity and nearness of God. In the midst of us can be found the One who is beyond, according to God’s sanctity and transcendence. Even though near, God remains an ungraspable Mystery (Is 12:6).

In *spatial* terms, this transcendence-in-immanence could be translated in the paradoxical *distance* within nearness, as if an unfathomable abyss were opened at the very place where we stand (Tuan 2011). Thus, the text speaks about *three types* of space: the vast, indefinite *space* of the surrounding desert, where every location seems similar to another; the concrete and inhabited *place* of the Tent of Encounter, moving at the speed of the pilgrim people; and the promised and utopian *horizon* of the culmination of