

Critical Thoughts on Contemporary Turkish Media

Critical Thoughts on Contemporary Turkish Media

Edited by

Nigar Pösteki

Cambridge
Scholars
Publishing



Critical Thoughts on Contemporary Turkish Media

Edited by Nigar Pösteki

This book first published 2019

Cambridge Scholars Publishing

Lady Stephenson Library, Newcastle upon Tyne, NE6 2PA, UK

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Copyright © 2019 by Nigar Pösteki and contributors

All rights for this book reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the copyright owner.

ISBN (10): 1-5275-3093-0

ISBN (13): 978-1-5275-3093-5

TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Figures.....	vii
List of Tables.....	ix
Acknowledgments	xi
Introduction	1
Section I: Studies in Cinema	
Chapter One.....	8
Between the Past and the Present: The Non-Places in Cinema <i>Nigar Pöstecki</i>	
Chapter Two	31
Muted Women: Female Characters and the Masculine Language of Mainstream Turkish Cinema <i>İren Dicle Aytaç</i>	
Chapter Three	70
I'm In, Too! From Those Who Are Desired to Those Who Desire: Image of Women in İrfan Tözüm Films <i>Özgür Veliöğlü Metin</i>	
Section II: Studies on Television	
Chapter Four.....	108
Representation of Young People in Television News <i>Ebru Turanlı</i>	
Chapter Five	124
Analyzing the Symbolic Status Concept in the Program "Society Housewives" with the Content Analysis Method <i>Nihan Dönmez</i>	

Section III: Studies on New Media

Chapter Six.....	156
New Influencers, Influencer Marketing and Impacts on Marketing and Public Relations <i>Aybike Pelenk Özel</i>	
Chapter Seven.....	175
The Common Language of Consumption: A Reading of Conspicuous Consumption Through the Instagram Accounts of the “Rich Kids of the Countries” <i>S. Zeynep Varlı Gürer</i>	
Chapter Eight.....	202
Fact-Checking Websites as New Media's New Gatekeepers: The Example of “Teyit.Org” <i>Neslihan Yolçu</i>	
Conclusion.....	224
Contributors.....	225

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1-1. The 25th letter of the Arabian alphabet, "Nun" (the missing letter)	18
Figure 1-2. Malik Hodja's unfinished writing and the dot as himself. Still from <i>Dot</i> directed by Derviş Zaim. Photo courtesy: Maraton Filmcilik.....	19
Figure 1-3. Ahmet (now), Malik Hodja (past) and the heterotopia of the film. Still from <i>Dot</i> directed by Derviş Zaim. Photo courtesy: Maraton Filmcilik	22
Figure 1-4. Still from <i>Dot</i> directed by Derviş Zaim. Photo courtesy: Maraton Filmcilik	24
Figure 3-1. Stills from <i>Wax-scented Women</i> directed by İrfan Tözüm. Photo courtesy: Muhteşem Film	83
Figure 3-2. Stills from <i>Codename: Blossom</i> directed by İrfan Tözüm. Photo courtesy: Hakan Film.....	85
Figure 3-3. Stills from <i>Codename: Blossom</i> directed by İrfan Tözüm. Photo courtesy: Hakan Film.....	87
Figure 3-4. Stills from <i>Hera Leandros</i> directed by İrfan Tözüm. Photo courtesy: Muhteşem Film	88
Figure 3-5. Stills from <i>Codename: Blossom</i> directed by İrfan Tözüm. Photo courtesy: Hakan Film.....	89
Figure 3-6. Stills from <i>Daylight Reveries of Miss Cazibe</i> directed by İrfan Tözüm. Photo courtesy: Muhteşem Film	89
Figure 3-7. Stills from <i>Hera Leandros</i> directed by İrfan Tözüm. Photo courtesy: Muhteşem Film	90
Figure 3-8. Stills from <i>Wax-scented Women</i> directed by İrfan Tözüm. Photo courtesy: Muhteşem Film	94
Figure 3-9. Stills from <i>Wax-scented Women</i> directed by İrfan Tözüm. Photo courtesy: Muhteşem Film	95
Figure 3-10. Stills from <i>Daylight Reveries of Miss Cazibe</i> directed by İrfan Tözüm. Photo courtesy: Muhteşem Film	97
Figure 5-1. Günsel Ülkü is playing guitar	135
Figure 5-2. Neslihan Kozanoğlu is wearing a fur	135
Figure 5-3. Neslihan Kozanoğlu's luxurious home.....	137
Figure 5-4. Neslihan Kozanoğlu's fireplace and decorative objects in her luxurious home	137

Figure 5-5. Some decorative objects in a cafe	137
Figure 5-6. Esra Tekgöz and Günsel Ülkü's jewelry shopping	138
Figure 5-7. Esra Tekgöz's jewellery bracelet.....	138
Figure 5-8. The physical appearance of the society housewives	139
Figure 5-9. Elif Sağlamyürek's dream	140
Figure 5-10. Elif's high-heeled shoes in mud	140
Figure 5-11. Elif's motorcross coach	141
Figure 5-12. Neslihan, Başar and Melis doing off-road	143
Figure 5-13. Ezgi Dargı's singing lesson	143
Figure 5-14. Ezgi Dargı's dog	146
Figure 5-15. Neslihan gives information about society life and rules of politeness	148
Figure 5-16. Günsel and Dilan shopping	149
Figure 5-17. Neslihan Kozanoğlu gives an English lesson to the village children	149
Figure 6-1. Vlogger PewDiePie.....	160
Figure 6-2. Influencer and YouTuber Yannick Merckx	161
Figure 6-3. Instagram influencer Zeynep Zor.....	161
Figure 6-4. Instagram influencer Elvin Levinler	162
Figure 6-5. Vlogger Enes Batur Sungurtekin	163
Figure 7-1. Posts regarding leisure time	199
Figure 7-2. Posts on conspicuous consumption in the context of accessories	199
Figure 7-3. Posts on conspicuous consumption in the context of transportation vehicles	200
Figure 7-4. The body presented as a commodity	200
Figure 7-5. Animals shown as conspicuous consumption items	200
Figure 7-6. Places presented	201
Figure 8-1. The photo claiming a banner writing "Damn Sharia. No Headscarf, Long Live Secularism."	214
Figure 8-2. The actual banner writing: "Mezitli Worker Women's Associations." (2016).....	214
Figure 8-3. The photo claiming that an Israeli soldier is committing violence against a teen	215
Figure 8-4. The original photo taken in Chile	215

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1-1. Findings.....	24
Table 2-1. Sample of the study.....	37
Table 2-2. Female characters as speech actors in <i>The Mountain 2</i>	40
Table 2-3. Characteristics of dialogs involving female interlocutors in <i>The Mountain 2</i>	42
Table 2-4. Female characters as speech actors in <i>Recep İvedik 4</i>	47
Table 2-5. Characteristics of dialogs involving female interlocutors in <i>Recep İvedik 4</i>	49
Table 2-6. Female characters as speech actors in <i>Recep İvedik 5</i>	53
Table 2-7. Characteristics of dialogs involving female interlocutors in <i>Recep İvedik 5</i>	54
Table 2-8. Female characters as speech actors in <i>Unconventional Wedding</i>	59
Table 2-9. Characteristics of dialogs involving female interlocutors in <i>Unconventional Wedding</i>	60
Table 2-10. Female characters as speech actors in <i>Unconventional Wedding 2</i>	63
Table 2-11. Characteristics of dialogs involving female interlocutors in <i>Unconventional Wedding</i>	65
Table 3-1. Binary oppositions regarding patriarchal ethics and oppression of honor upon women in films.....	99
Table 4-1. Number of news items in which young people were represented.....	114
Table 4-2. Content of the news.....	115
Table 4-3. Content of young people's messages in television news.....	115
Table 4-4. Representation of young people in the messages given in television news.....	118
Table 5-1. Representation of social classes on television between 1882 and 2005.....	130
Table 5-2. Characters who are in the program.....	133
Table 5-3. Usage of particulars relating to symbolic status in the messages.....	134
Table 5-4. Usage of visual particulars belonging to symbolic status in the messages.....	136
Table 5-5. Values relating to physical images with respect to symbolic status in the messages.....	139

Table 5-6. Values presented in messages relating to society culture.....	141
Table 5-7. Economic values in the messages relating to symbolic status	142
Table 5-8. Designing of society characters having symbolic status	144
Table 5-9. Designing of the other one according to society characters owning symbolic status.....	147
Table 6-1. Most-used influencers by the companies in Turkey.....	167
Table 6-2. Participants' usage rate of social media tools	170
Table 6-3. Frequency of the use of social media tools by participants	170
Table 6-4. Participants' level of obtaining information from the influencer before buying a product or service.....	171
Table 6-5. The medium where the influencers are followed	171
Table 6-6. Effect of influencers on purchasing decisions of participants...	172
Table 7-1. The follower numbers of rich kids accounts	184
Table 7-2. Posts shared on Instagram accounts	184
Table 7-3. Genders of the actors on Instagram accounts	185
Table 7-4. Posts on Instagram accounts that are directed towards leisure time.....	185
Table 7-5. Posts considering leisure time on Instagram accounts	186
Table 7-6. Posts on conspicuous consumption in the context of transportation vehicles on Instagram accounts	188
Table 7-7. Posts on conspicuous consumption in the context of food and drinks on Instagram accounts	188
Table 7-8. Posts on conspicuous consumption in the context of accessories on Instagram accounts.....	189
Table 7-9. The body to be presented as a commodity among Instagram posts	191
Table 7-10. Animals shown as conspicuous consumption items among Instagram accounts.....	192
Table 7-11. Places presented on Instagram accounts.....	193
Table 8-1. Distribution of claims according to domestic / foreign contents	211
Table 8-2. Distribution of claims according to subjects	212
Table 8-3. Distribution of political news according to subtopics	213
Table 8-4. Accuracy distribution of claims according to domestic/ international levels	215
Table 8-5. Accuracy distribution of claims according to topics	216
Table 8-6. Distribution of claims according to producer	217

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to thank the Centre for Political, Economic and Social Research (PESA) for the conference they organized in Venice in June 2018. This insightful conference provided researchers from various fields with a platform to meet and discuss their studies. It brought together precious studies from the field of Turkish Media, which laid the foundation of this book. Also, I am indebted to colleagues Assoc. Prof. Furkan Beşel and Assist. Prof. Cihat Atar, who have always supported the efforts to bring this book together. I am also indebted to the contributing authors for their valuable contributions and collaboration: İren Dicle Aytaç, Dr. Özgür Veliöđlu Metin, Dr. Ebru Turanlı, Dr. Nihan Dönmez, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Aybike Pelenk Özel, Dr. Zeynep Varlı Güreer, Dr. Neslihan Yolçu. I also appreciate the constant, coherent and professional help the staff of Cambridge Scholars Publishing has offered me throughout the publishing process.

INTRODUCTION

The chapters in this book are composed of revised versions of the papers presented at the ICPESS 2018 Venice Congress that aimed to bring together valuable researchers and studies in political, economic and social fields. In this book, qualified and innovative studies in the field of communication studies were selected with the purpose to make a contribution to the media studies literature. Thus, this book aims to spotlight the topics within the scope of cinema, television and the new media in Turkey. This book is a valuable source for readers who are interested in current debates related to the field of communication in Turkey. Studies in this book inquire into different aspects of contemporary Turkish media ranging from cinema to the new media. Thus, this collection presents an interdisciplinary, critical and holistic view.

This book has three main purposes: The first one is to inform scholars and researchers in international academia of communication studies about the current discussions on contemporary Turkish media. The second purpose of the book is to offer a reference source to researchers around the world studying communication. The last is to provide data on Turkish media for comparative communication studies.

The book is a collection of original studies with findings obtained with different methodological approaches, varying from content analysis to semiotics. The collection consists of studies on three main groups: Cinema, Television and New Media. A total of eight chapters attempt to shed light on different issues in mass communication in Turkey.

The first chapter in the field of cinema is titled "Between the Past and Present: The Non-places in Cinema." The chapter explores *Nokta* (*Dot*, 2008), directed by Derviş Zaim, one of the main actors that shaped the period of change after 1990 in Turkish cinema. Within the context of *Dot*, this study focuses on the non-places and heterotopias that can be defined as forms of public places in the cinema. According to Augé, non-places are living spaces that have no relation to history or identity. They are the crossroads for temporarily living. *Dot* is a significant example that differs from other films due to its portrayal of non-spaces. Instead of using the conventional portrayal of non-spaces, this film designs the diegetic world as a unique non-space with a soul and identity of its own. Foucault claims that heterotopias occur in real space. In this respect, a certain film may

take cinema, which is defined as a heterotopia (place of otherness) by Foucault, closer or further away from utopia depending on the consideration area it offers spectators. In this context, *Dot* was examined in terms of explaining the structure of the heterotopia and the hallucinated utopia/dystopia.

The second chapter, written by İren Dicle Aytaç, is about gender and cinema. "Muted Women: Female Characters and the Masculine Language of Mainstream Turkish Cinema" focuses on the mainstream film industry in Turkey, which is largely a male-dominated system. Through an analysis of contemporary Turkish blockbusters, this study aims to explore how women's "power to talk" is suppressed by implicit discriminatory practices. Within the scope of the study, the Bechdel Test, a popular method used to examine the representation of women in films, extended with the main categories that socio-linguistic studies consider crucial in the formation of relational positions of speaking actors, was applied to Turkish movies that gained the most box office revenues in the last five years. In this context, the dialog of female characters in *Recep İvedik 5* (2017), *Dağ 2 (The Mountain)*, 2016), *Düğün Dernek 2 (Unconventional Wedding 2)*, 2015), *Recep İvedik 4* (2014) and *Düğün Dernek (Unconventional Wedding)*, 2013) were analyzed in terms of quantity, addressees, motivation, content, and control over starting and ceasing the conversation. As a result, it can be seen that the female characters are not represented as subjects of either the narrative or the dialogs within the movies; they are not allowed to develop any discourse beyond the limits of the masculine representation system; and the order of the speeches in films reproduces the codes of the patriarchal linguistic system.

In the chapter "I'm In, Too! From Those Who Are Desired to Those Who Desire: Image of Women in İrfan Tözüm Films", Özgür Velioglu Metin focuses on the representation of women in Turkish cinema. In the post-1980 period, female representation in Turkish cinema began to transform in the films of directors such as Atif Yılmaz, İrfan Tözüm, Ömer Kavur, and Yavuz Turgul. The transformation that took place with the contribution of the feminist movement, which started to show its effects in Turkey in this period, is an important turning point in terms of the representation of women in Turkish cinema. These directors took women, who previously had the duty of being good chaste wives and mothers, and transformed them into questioning individuals who realized their own desires and who could object to social norms.

Although İrfan Tözüm was one of the first directors to feature this transformation in his films, he wasn't able to make it beyond being only occasionally discussed at the academic level. For this reason, this study

aims to reveal the female characters in İrfan Tözüm movies, who often object to the patriarchal morality and the oppression of honor on women by noticing their sexual desires. The female characters in the analyzed films are striving to survive under the oppression of honor shaped in Turkish society with the effect of the traditional lifestyle on gender norms. Films such as *Rumuz Goncağül (Codename: Blossom, 1988)*, *Cazibe Hanımın Gündüz Düşleri (Daylight Reveries of Miss Cazibe, 1992)*, *Kız Kulesi Aşıkları (Hera Leandros, 1994)*, and *Mum Kokulu Kadınlar (Wax-scented Women, 1996)*, which were selected from his filmography as samples, were analyzed in terms of the basic binary oppositions about social gender norms using the semiological paradigmatic method. In the analyses, the female characters' resistance against oppression through realizing love and sexual desires and their ways of rebellion are presented.

The second section of the book, which is on television, begins with the chapter "Representation of Young People in Television News" by Ebru Turanlı. The media plays an active role in the context of meaningful production in the political, economic and socio-cultural areas of individuals with messages sent to the public in the contents they produce in the context of the dominant ideology. At the same time, the media categorizes individuals and attributes various features to these categories. Thus, the individual's understanding of himself/herself and the social structure through categories become compatible with the representations in the media. Identities built by the media are accepted by the social structure after a period of time and can create various judgments. Young people, who are an important part of the social structure, are represented in various ways in the media. The media conveys some qualitative features specific to the youth design it creates in the content it produces, thereby making an identity design. Television news is accepted as a reflection of real events by the public. Many political, social and economic factors, particularly the dominant ideology, play an active role in the production phase of television news, which is, in fact, a fictional reality. In this study, an attempt is made to determine what kind of youth representation is made in the prime-time news broadcast every day at 7:00 pm on FOX TV, Kanal D and ATV, the three television channels whose different broadcasting policies are analyzed. According to the findings, there are different designs related to youth representation on all three channels. It was observed that the ideology of the broadcasting organization, along with the dominant ideology, shaped the identity designs presented to the public by the media.

In the chapter "Analyzing the Symbolic Status Concept in the Program 'Society Housewives' with the Content Analysis Method," Nihan Dönmez examined the program *Sosyetik Ev Kadınları (Society Housewives)*

qualitatively and quantitatively by using the content analysis method. After modernism, factors such as food & beverage culture, consumption habits, clothing codes, leisure activity, and forms of entertainment gained importance in the foundation of social identities. At the end of this process, the meanings of objects and practices are constantly being recreated and the identity of the individual is defined by the symbolic status they have. The symbolic status mentioned in the study is an expression that corresponds to lifestyle, which includes concepts such as leisure activity, consumption habits, food & beverage culture, entertainment forms, home life and decoration, clothing codes, body, appearance, and image. The symbolic status includes a number of value indicators. These are indicators such as money, power, luxury, magnificence, consumption, and wealth. These value indicators satisfy the individual's desire to be distinguished, different or privileged. Moreover, the individual with these value indicators marginalizes others who do not by categorization, exclusion and devaluation. The mass media, especially television, set status differences with their contents, design status and determine the ideal status. They include visual, written and verbal messages that idealize symbolic status and present them to the audience with different program types. In the program called *Society Housewives*, the way in which the symbolic status is designed and idealized and how the sub-class individuals who do not have the upper-class value indicators are marginalized are revealed in the context of messages and visuals.

In the chapter "New Influencers, Influencer Marketing and Impacts on Marketing and Public Relations," Aybike Pelenk Özel switches to the new media area. Public relations professionals and marketers are now faced with rapidly changing channels of communication. One of them is people who use these environments effectively, creating attitude and behavior patterns and continuous and flowing content; they are followed by many users and therefore are called "influencers." These influencers became new opinion leaders in contemporary conditions by developing a new generation of language in transferring products and services to consumers. In this study, the effects of the influencers as opinion leaders are discussed in relation to public relations and marketing professions. For this purpose, this study examines sectoral developments in marketing practices and attitudes of consumer groups by giving examples of influencer marketing.

In the chapter "The Common Language of Consumption: A Reading of Conspicuous Consumption Through the Instagram Accounts of the 'Rich Kids of the Countries'," Zeynep Varlı Gürer addresses the accounts called "rich kids of the countries," specifically the USA, China, Iran, and Turkey. In the consumer society, the individual is not only the person who uses the

product but also one marketing it. In particular, there is a close relationship between the self-presentation of the individual in social media and conspicuous consumption. With conspicuous consumption items, consumers follow the way of being accepted by society, raising themselves above the crowd and attracting attention. In addition, societies' production systems and economic structures are in direct relation with their lifestyles. Economic systems and political structures that shape lifestyles vary from country to country. Indicators of conspicuous consumption are a common language of similar elements in almost every society. In this chapter, conspicuous consumption items mentioned in the posts of "the rich kids" living in different countries economically and socially were determined with the content analysis method. The main result is that the messages about conspicuous consumption items shared in the accounts of the rich kids are similar. In the examination, the common language of the conspicuous consumption items was determined while reading the cultural differences in the messages. In this context, the interpretation of the consumption elements of different societies can be considered as various dialects of the same language. The chapter "Fact-Checking Websites as New Media's New Gatekeepers: The Example of 'Teyit.Org'" by Neslihan Yolçu examines the news verification site "Teyit.Org", and is the eighth and the last chapter of the study. One of the biggest problems of new media-mediated journalism is that the "news verification principle", which is one of the basic principles of journalism, can be skipped and fake news spreads in social media very quickly. Studies show that Turkey is the second most-vulnerable country to fake news. With decreasing confidence in traditional media, users prefer alternative media and especially social media, thus they are more exposed to fake news. In this context, the content, producers, spreading rate, and sphere of influence of the fake news in Turkey are examined via the news verification site, "Teyit.Org", with a one-month period content analysis method.

SECTION I:
STUDIES IN CINEMA

CHAPTER ONE

BETWEEN THE PAST AND THE PRESENT: THE NON-PLACES IN CINEMA

Analysis of the Movie *Dot* Among the Montages of Cinematic
Location in the Context of Non-Placeness

Nigar PÖSTEKİ

*The heterotopia is
capable of juxtaposing in a single real place several spaces,
several sites that are in themselves incompatible.*
—Michel Foucault

Introduction

The term "everyday life" used by Adorno and Horkheimer in the *Dialectic of Enlightenment* refers to the transformation of a human into an object and the object into a product. The culture industry, rapidly changing life since the 19th century, has also standardized and put people into certain molds. The most important area used by the culture industry for change is art. The uniqueness of the work of art has deteriorated; it has become temporary, able to be transported everywhere, and easily available. The art movements that try to overthrow conventional artworks by perceiving them in an ironic perception have used and reproduced ready-made objects and made high art part of everyday life. This situation can be summarized by the words of Andy Warhol: "Everything is pop, pop is everything."

However, Lefebvre discussed the concept of everyday life in the context of urbanism and space. Space is reproduced for the continuation of social life. The order to urban space desired by scientists, architects and power elites is necessary for the sustainability of knowledge and power. Space is unsteady, as is the life that started to flow rapidly with modernity.

Alvin Toffler says that permanence is dead, that there are so many changes and we live in temporary concepts.

In this fast-paced life of 'modern' cities that have been surrounded by multi-storey skyscrapers, and lifestyles squeezed into a triangle of work-malls-traffic, expecting people who are constantly consuming to stay "strong" without losing their memory will be a very good-intentioned perception. As well as memories not being recorded, they are not even allowed to occur. Instead, we live in a fake "memory world" and try to establish a solid foundation for those lost lives. (Pösteki, 2017, p. 25)

The relationship between the representations of the space (designed space), the space of representation (living space) and the spatial practices (interpreted space) make space a product that is both produced and consumed. *The representation of the space* expresses itself. The production of space in cities reflects the current ideology. *The space of representation* is the form of the living space setting itself forth. Cities have become an obstacle between nature and human. The buildings, roads, squares, and the necessity of living together have been reinforced by artificial spaces. The perception of place-space has changed and identity and belonging problems began to occur as people become detached from nature.

The humankind who tries to change nature in his own way has created a simulated, parallel universe in a world of 'images' created by variables and indicators, as Baudrillard underlines. Nature has been tried to be tamed. The cities, which were overwhelmed by museums and skyscrapers, have become symbolic indicators of man's disengagement with nature and its past. With these spaces, which are the cemetery of the past, the "lost past" was wailed upon. What false tears hide is the fact that we live within consumed lives without even thinking. We have been transformed into beloved consumers of the capitalist system with objects of desire that we can easily access throughout social media, television, or fashion that enters right into our houses and so, of which the value has been fleet and quickly forgotten. (Pösteki, 2017, p. 30)

It is also important to define the space that is felt. We must first see the space physically then combine it with our past experiences and store it in our memory. In this way, we can make sense of the place we see in a photograph, postcard or movie. This situation also strengthens the feeling of belonging somewhere. The emotional integration with the place of belonging provides identification with the identity of that place. The space of existence, which is a very important part of the identification, is where the meaning of life is questioned and understood. The person understands that they are not alone among the space/sky interaction and they belong

somewhere. Whether it is on the scale of a city or an object, the most important thing is that the individual always feels the same security in their own house.

The space objectifies the world that is created in the cinema. It is the scene of cinematic action. Events, stories and characters exist physically within a space. The interaction of the story with the place and the identification of the characters by spaces add realism and credibility to the movie. It convinces the audience about the flow of events. Even though it is real, it becomes a part of the new universe that is created and transferred to the film. There is no landscape that is seen for the first time in the cinematic universe. İstanbul's famous skyline creates a cityscape. It takes place in the physical universe that was created, from the moment it was filmed. It becomes the scene of the movie. In this way, the viewer will combine the view of the city with İstanbul which was formed in his brain and identify the story with the space. What concerns us is the social relations and physical space. The artwork contains the temporal-spatial relationships of the concerning period while carrying out its message. Although they are independent from each other, temporal and spatial relations are internally connected. This internal commitment completes time and space and creates meaning in the mind of the viewer.

Like every cinematic image, it can be said that space also has historical, social, and cultural ties, and that without such ties, the interpretation of the cinematic representation of space will be incomplete. The spaces are made sensible when memory images complete the screen images. The subject of our study is non-spaces and heterotopias, which we can describe as a form of public space or public spaces themselves. Within the framework of these two concepts, non-spaces and heterotopias will be questioned and one of the most riveting directors of Turkish cinema Derviş Zaim's film *Nokta (Dot, 2008)* will be examined.

Space and beyond: A brief overview

Foucault says that the era we are in is the space age. The notion of heterotopia¹ attributed to it means that lots of time and many spaces are accommodated in one real space. Foucault's heterotopia is a place where

¹ Medical term. It means that an organ in the human body being somewhere other than where it should be. In the study, Foucault's definition "other place" is considered as Hetero-Topos. "People not only experience the space but also think and dream through it. Hence the space only... shapes the other possible social worlds that could express collective dreams... which are experienced and understood..." (Kulak, 2016). Therefore, heterotopia is multilayered.

space and time are experienced differently than the conventional ones. It is a heterogeneous space, such as museums, cemeteries, libraries, prisons, retirement homes, resorts, zoos, sites, festivals, cinemas, and theaters. They are places that have more than one time and space among the real space. It is also a break from the routine of everyday life. For example, when you go to places that have been created later, such as Disneyland or Las Vegas, you will encounter spaces that are isolated from the reality, i.e. "altered suspended spaces" (Stavrides, 2016, p. 155). Growing cities, skyscrapers, framed parks, and arranged roads isolate the people who create these artificial living spaces without them realizing it. They also facilitates their control. Within these control areas, there are fiction spaces as escape areas. Heterotopia is the space where different spaces that hold many functions within come together, and that is connected to the present time; the space of the others that have been left out. The reason these places that cannot be fully explained by the first utopia concept that comes to mind are called heterotopia is hidden in its relationship with reality. They are defined as utopias performed by society, but they are spaces from which the "others" have been secluded. It is possible to say that the ideal of the utopia of modernity has prepared the birth of heterotopias.

Utopia is a world order that is not going to be realized. The living beings are happy. The order functions well. The aim is to explain the control and exploitation of power. However, dystopia tries to reach the same goal by describing ugliness, wickedness and oppression. Heterotopia is the area of freedom among the real spaces for those who were isolated from their surroundings.

...they are born as non-intrusive spaces, as cracks in the molding classifications of space and time; as erratic time and space fragments that have come together at the processes that open up space for newborn social relations... Thus, we can think of heterotopias not as areas of otherness, but as transitions to otherness. (Stavrides, 2016, pp. 158-159)

Utopias are places that are unreal.

These are positions that maintain a general analogy relationship, either directly or in reverse with the real space of society. This is either the perfected society or the opposite of society; but in any case, these utopias are intrinsically unrealistic spaces. (Foucault, 2016, p. 295)

The relationship concerning the reality-fiction between utopias as spaces alive in fiction within the framework of the absolute good idea and heterotopias as in the real-life spaces is important. Utopia is a dream of a seamless system. Dystopia is the expression of the rebel conflict in the

fantastic world. The name of real spaces that are outside of all areas on Earth, marginalized, implemented and realized, is heterotopia. In other words, it is to create "liberated" areas without distorting the system. The life that has been offered is cultural, spatial and organizational, and heterotopias can be the common experience that mirror society. Foucault claims that heterotopias exist in the real space, contrary to utopias, and he draws an analogy with the mirror. While he describes the reflection in the mirror as the projection, the shadow and the utopia of reality, he emphasizes that it can be the heterotopia of being aware that there is a reflection when looking at the mirror.

The mirror is, after all, a utopia, since it is a placeless place. In the mirror, I see myself there where I am not, in an unreal, virtual space that opens up behind the surface; I am over there, there where I am not, a sort of shadow that gives my own visibility to myself, that enables me to see myself there where I am absent: such is the utopia of the mirror. But it is also a heterotopia in so far as the mirror does exist in reality, where it exerts a sort of counteraction on the position that I occupy. From the standpoint of the mirror, I discover my absence from the place where I am since I see myself over there. Starting from this gaze that is, as it were, directed toward me, from the ground of this virtual space that is on the other side of the glass, I come back toward myself; I begin again to direct my eyes toward myself and to reconstitute myself there where I am. The mirror functions as a heterotopia in this respect: it makes this place that I occupy at the moment when I look at myself in the glass at once absolutely real, connected with all the space that surrounds it, and absolutely unreal, since in order to be perceived it has to pass through this virtual point which is over there. (Foucault, 2016, pp. 295-296)

We see ourselves in the mirror where we're not. In a non-realistic image, in a space in which the presence behind the surface is not accepted; and in a place where the virtuality is attributed but in a de facto setting. It is both real and absolutely unreal. Foucault divides heterotopias into two large groups: *heterotopias of crisis*, created for people in crisis situations; they are heterotopias in which people are placed outside the norms of society that point to nowhere (i.e. have no geographical coordinates). The places where the women in the primitive ages were sent to; military services and honeymoon hotels are among these heterotopias. *Heterotopias of perversion* in modern society are places such as hospitals, psychiatric clinics and prisons. The two important heterotopias that Foucault mentioned in his work are the museum and library. These are heterotopias that function as archives where a certain period has been recorded. Within these heterotopias, time passes differently. Foucault defines this time with

different progress as *heterochronia*. Spaces have an impact that stores time within or changes its progress² (Foucault, 2016, pp. 12, 213, 299). Heterotopia gives a place to that which has no place. It is the "otherness" (Kaplan, n.d.).

When viewed from the perception of utopia and heterotopia, the audience will not let themselves get caught up in the projection of the truth within the mirror, will realize that it is just a shadow, and question their own position. Catharsis also makes audience interrogate the world the movie offers them. But Foucault limited it to the world of the film. The method of alienation gives the audience a more free-thinking space. They are aware that the world they are watching is a created universe. Therefore, questioning the world of the film and presenting a utopic, dystopic or heterotopic world should also be connected to the audience's perception. In this respect, it can be seen that the function of convergence or suspension to the utopia in the movie theater, which is one of the places described by Foucault as a place of heterotopia (*the space of otherness*), may vary according to this thinking area.

Cinema is inherently heterotopic. It's a heterotopy capable of allowing the presence of more than one area overlapping another: *A two-dimensional room where a three-dimensional world can exist*. For this reason, films increase the number of spaces and thus question the reality of these worlds (*The Funambulist*, n.d.). They produce universes that are not real but are connected with reality differently. The secret of a successful film in the cinema is to use the sense of space and time factor well.

² Foucault explains heterotopia in six principles. First principle: heterotopias exist in every culture but in different norms and divide into two types: crisis heterotopias and heterotopias of deviation. Boarding schools, honeymoon hotels, rest homes and psychiatric hospitals are among the examples. Second principle: each society produces the heterotopias of some functions in different ways with time. Cemeteries is the example. Third principle: heterotopia is in one real place several different spaces in themselves. Cinemas and theaters and Persian gardens are the examples. The fourth principle is about time. Museums and libraries, festival sites, the fairgrounds, vacations and leisure villages are the examples. The fifth principle is about determined time. Military quarters and prisons are among the examples. The sixth principle is about creating illusion spaces, at the same time it is the space for otherness.

From the soul of the space to non-place: Place turning into space and heterotopic area in cinema

The transformation of space into "a place" can be possible by a culture taking root in time. The concept of "genius loci" (*the soul of time*), which Norberg-Schulz has updated with reference to the myth of the "guardian spirit" in Roman culture, describes the distinguishing atmosphere of a building or a place.

...according to the belief, every being has a protective soul that appears to protect them throughout their lives, to help them survive and to give them a certain character, felt by the senses and can give meaning to one's own perception. (Aras, 2012, p. 27)

Heidegger explains the place where people can live safely, using the distance between the sky and the earth, throughout their life. The production of space corresponds to the production of social relations in that space. A place of production, it also indirectly shapes social relationships and everyday life.

Space is a general definition. However, the place contains dimensions such as existence and belonging. The bond that man establishes with a space transforms the space into a place and gives the space an identity. The feelings and thoughts that arise with the experience of the place make it meaningful. Spaces are defined as a means of memory because they are defined by their historicity and their relations with identity. So, where are we going to put the "non-place" of Marc Augé? Marc Augé claims that modernity produces "non-place" spaces. According to Augé, places that have no relation with history or identity are "non-places." In other words, these are places where temporary lives exist. There is no history of non-places. They are used and let go. They don't create a sense of a place; such as airports, shopping malls. What we call everyday life is a colonial sector occupied by technology, consumption and the demonstration society. Can't we think of the same thing in terms of its relationship to memory?

At the present time in which the depths of identities are not considered/required, instant encounters are predominant, the fictitious groups being concentrated within mass communication; within the virtual world of the Internet, our whole lives have become non-places. And this lack has resulted in amnesia. Humans wandering in "non-places" don't interact with their environment. The space itself is an area that operates with its own surroundings, parking lots, and controlled entrances and exits. Particularly closed ones are independent of day and night differences or from climate conditions. It lives its own abstract time. The main aim is to

eliminate the feeling of "belonging to a place," meaning timelessness and placelessness. The human-place relationship in these places integrates with the feeling of abandonment/alienation/loneliness. In terms of cinema, for example, in science-fiction, the space is heterotopic. It's outer space. It's hollow.

The airport in which the main character was stuck in the movie *Terminal* (Steven Spielberg, 2004)³ can be an example of the relationship between non-place and heterotopia. According to Augé's definition, airports are non-places. However, the situation turns into a heterotopia due to the fact that the character must remain there. In other words, the space veers away from its definition as an airport where people just visit temporarily, such as the duty-free, passport control and x-ray devices that are almost the same all over the world. In *Terminal*, it has become a place where the main character has to live, that he has acquired as a home, has transformed into a place that has a different meaning for him. For this reason, he creates his own safe space by artificially establishing the non-existent space.

The difference between the type of production of the space (i.e. whether it is the actual space or a setup) and the way it is used is important. The place in cinema is where the event takes place. It can be natural or artificial. But even though it is natural, it contains artificiality because the camera comes between the space and the audience. Connerton mentions this precisely; in his view, the new spaces produced in modern life create a cultural amnesia that is unique to modernity. These places work as forgetfulness centers. The director, as in the concept of the representation of the space (*designed space*) of Lefebvre, is designing the space as he would like to see it. The spaces in the film are reproduced according to the experiences of the character. In this sense, the places produced can be places that do not exist while the audience accepts the space created in the world of film; Cinema-based heterotopias are created

³ *The Terminal* tells the story of Viktor Navorski, who came to New York from one of the Eastern European countries. Viktor is stranded at New York's JFK International Airport on his way to America because a military coup took place in his country and his passport is no longer valid, so he lost the right to enter the United States. He must wait in the transit passenger hall of the airport terminal until the war in his country is over. Viktor's wait at the airport lasts for weeks. He witnesses various events. In this world, compressed into the terminal building, human events took place, such as drama, entertainment, unexpected coincidences. He starts a romantic relationship with a stewardess called Amelia. However, there are those who do not like the existence of Viktor there, like airport authority Frank Dixon.

which are not real but accepted as they are. Therefore, the spaces presented in the film narrative are not only an element of the narrative but also affect the story and the characters, and have an effect that questions the creation of alternative spaces. Foucault states that heterotopias bring the most incompatible spaces together. Cinema complies with this feature but the heterotopic area of cinema is more complex. In this area, the unique time divisions that Foucault calls "heterochronias" are found:

From a general standpoint, in a society like ours, heterotopias and heterochronies are structured and distributed in a relatively complex fashion. First of all, there are heterotopias of indefinitely accumulating time, for example, museums and libraries. These places have become heterotopias in which time never stops building up and topping its own summit... By contrast, the idea of accumulating everything, of establishing a sort of general archive, the will to enclose all times, all epochs, all forms, all tastes in one place, the idea of constituting a place of all times that is itself outside of time and inaccessible to its ravages, is the project of organizing in this way a sort of perpetual and indefinite accumulation of time in an immobile place... (Foucault, 2014, p. 299)

The fact that vision and perception can change creates the basis of phenomenology⁴ as well. It is to perceive "the essence" by seeing, attributing some meaning and feeling with the help of other senses. It is seen that cinema presents the space both visually and sensually. Space is not only the place where the event takes place but also the atmosphere that is experienced by the characters, which represents the interactions between the event and the character. In cinema, space refers to social and cultural values beyond physical reality. As real spaces can be used, there are also fictional spaces created especially for the film. For this reason, the way they are created and used and the impression they get in the target group are important. For example, in Tarkovsky's *Stalker* (1979), "the Zone" is a space isolated from external reality. The independent structure of the space was used to reflect the mood of the characters.

⁴The subject discussed in Phenomenology is the essence of objects in the world of perceptual and experimental objects. We perceive a table with our senses. If we isolate the table from all the sensory data, the only thing that would be left is the table ideal. This phenomenon is called the intellectual essence. The world is variable, depending on the meanings that people attach to it.

An example from Turkish cinema: Heterotopia in the film *Dot*

Dot has aimed to set up film aesthetics by structurally and content-wisely making use of calligraphy,⁵ which is one of the Turkish traditional arts. It is Derviş Zaim's second film about the adaptation of the Ottoman arts inspired by ancient arts. Inspired by miniature art in *Waiting for Heaven* (2006), Zaim refers to shadow play in the last film of the trilogy, *Shadows and Surrogates* (2010). The film begins with a vow by a miniature craftsman Calligraph Eflatun Efendi, one of the characters in the director's film *Waiting for Heaven*: "*Writing beautiful words of infringement means capturing life more broadly.*"

The young calligrapher Ahmet, who was reluctantly involved in stealing the manuscript of a historical Qur'an and selling it illegally, is trying to get rid of his guilt. The incident caused the death of three people, including the grandson of the person who owned the Qur'an. The problem of the film is Ahmet's purification and the atonement of his sins. *Dot* takes place entirely outdoors. Throughout the film, the camera does not enter into an interior, even in a single take, and nor do the characters of the film. Turkey's second-largest lake, Salt Lake, and the sky form the background of the film. The outdoors is used as an element of symbolism. The aim of the analysis is to show how criticism of the concept of "non-place" was formed by the modernist society and its way of life; and how heterotopia was addressed within the setting of the space. The spaces in *Dot* have been analyzed according to various representation types such as the theme, event fiction, and real space/fictional space.

Therefore, the relationship between the subject of the film and calligraphy, calligraphy technique and the space and time of the film necessitated shooting the film in a single take. The event is explained in a sequence of 75 minutes in accordance with the logic of *ihcam*.⁶ The director was able to create a continuous and uninterrupted sense of time. It is seen that the characters are not created based on space and time. The story moves from the 13th century to the present day with camera movements. In order to protect Konya from the Mongol attack in the 13th century, Malik Hodja wants to write *Afvallahü'anh* (Allah forgive him!) on Salt Lake. However, as the ink has been depleted, he cannot write the dot

⁵Calligraphy is a calligraphic writing system made up of signs since ancient times. It can also be said that it is the art of creating letters in different ways. In Islam, it is often used as a type of writing created with Arabic letters, with an artistic value.

⁶Writing a letter or a motif in one move. The pen is not removed from the paper until the end of the motif and the writing is finished in one move.

of one letter, *nun*⁷, and sends the apprentice to buy some ink. But the apprentice does not return and so he can't write the rest. At the opening of the film, on a black surface, the camera, which approaches the dot at the end of the sentence of Eflatun Efendi, written in Latin letters reminiscent of calligraphy, passes over to a white paper; with Arabic letters written on white paper. The white background turns into the floor of the Salt Lake. The Arabic word *Afvallahü'anh* is written on the ground. Instead of the missing letter, there is the calligrapher Malik Hodja, with no ink left for the letter. With the flow of the title sequence, a different time takes place in the same space; from Malik Hodja (13th century) to the present time and calligraphist Ahmet.

Figure 1-1. The 25th letter of the Arabian alphabet, "Nûn" (the missing letter)



Throughout the film, we watch Ahmet try to find redemption for his sins. Just as Malik Hodja couldn't complete the dot of the missing letter, Ahmet cannot escape his sense of guilt. For this reason, he can't perform calligraphy. If a dot is necessary to end a sentence and start another sentence, Ahmet also needs to continue his life and reprimand himself with his conscience. In order to create beauty, it is necessary to be good and righteous. However, Ahmet has lost his purity. Therefore, he cannot do his art. The film begins with the missing dot of the letter and ends when Ahmet falls into the infinite whiteness and becomes a dot himself. This transformation can be read as a symbol of the lack of human will, and atonement the penance for the crime. This reading is hidden in the meaning of Malik Hodja's writing, which was completed with the death of

⁷ In Aristotle, the essence of time is Now and its Greek equivalent is 'nun'. 'Now' (nun), according to Aristotle, is the dot (stigma). In Hegel, it is represented by a dot (Yavuz, 2009). In the conception of Sufism, the dot in Nun refers to the human. The man carries the soul and the self, which is entrusted to him.