

Choir Stalls and their Workshops

Choir Stalls and their Workshops:

*Proceedings of the Misericordia
International Colloquium 2016*

Edited by

Anja Seliger and Willy Piron

Cambridge
Scholars
Publishing



Choir Stalls and their Workshops:
Proceedings of the Misericordia International Colloquium 2016

Edited by Anja Seliger and Willy Piron

This book first published 2017

Cambridge Scholars Publishing

Lady Stephenson Library, Newcastle upon Tyne, NE6 2PA, UK

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Copyright © 2017 by Anja Seliger, Willy Piron and contributors

All rights for this book reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the copyright owner.

ISBN (10): 1-4438-7901-0

ISBN (13): 978-1-4438-7901-9

CONTENTS

List of Illustrations	viii
List of Tables	xvii
Abbreviations	xviii
Introduction	1
ANJA SELIGER, WILLY PIRON	
<i>PART I: WORKSHOP PRACTICES</i>	
Getting the Idea: The Role of Drawings in the Manufacturing Process of Choir Stalls	6
ANJA SELIGER	
Module as Model for Early Modern Choir Stalls	25
ANGELA GLOVER	
Big Seats for Fat Benedictines, Small Ones for Slender Cistercians? Some Statistics on Choir Stall Sizes	42
KRISTIANE LEMÉ-HÉBUTERNE	
<i>PART II: EARLY MODERN CHOIR STALLS – TRADITIONS OR RESTART?</i>	
The Choir Stalls of 1537 from Tobsdorf/Dupuş in Transylvania, Romania: Aspects of the Workshop Technique and Connections to Master Johannes Reychmut of Schäßburg/Sighişoara	64
RALF BUCHHOLZ, SUSANNE KARIUS, GERDI MAIERBACHER-LEGL	
The Choir Stalls of the Cistercian Abbey at Salem from 1588–1593: Aspects of their Creation in the Context of Liturgical and Economic Reform	79
ULRICH KNAPP	

PART III: STALLS OF STONE – A FORGOTTEN FURNITURE

Set in Stone: The Stone Bench of Burs in its Social, Functional
and Historic Context..... 110
JÖRG WIDMAIER

Liturgical Activation of the Stone Choir in Santiago de Compostela:
Looking at Material through the Immaterial..... 128
ERIKA LOIC

Materiality and Reflexivity between Sedilia and Choir Stalls in Medieval
England..... 144
JAMES ALEXANDER CAMERON

PART IV: TRAVELLING CRAFTSMEN

The Role of Choir Stalls made by Foreign Craftsmen in Spanish
Renaissance Sculpture 166
MARÍA TERESA RODRÍGUEZ BOTE

An International Entrepreneur in Spain around 1500:
The Carver Rodrigo Alemán and his Choir Stalls 179
DOROTHEE HEIM

Jan Borchman and his Fellow Craftsmen: The Creation of Choir Stalls
in the Low Countries 211
CHRISTEL THEUNISSEN

PART V: GROUP OF WORKS

The Choir Stalls of the Monasteries of Pöhlde and St Alexander's
in Einbeck: Observations on their Time of Origin from an Epigraphical
and Historical Point of View 226
JÖRG H. LAMPE

Choir Stalls and Other Thirteenth Century Furnishings in the Cistercian
Monastery of Doberan 243
KAJA VON COSSART

The Anklam Stall-Ends: An Example of Stalls in Parish Churches in Pomerania.....	263
DETLEF WITT	
The Bilobate Misericords of the Lower Rhine Area: A Local Phenomenon?	282
WILLY PIRON	
Contributors.....	299
Indices	304

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

Cover image: Choir stall in Cuiseaux, bench-end: craftsman preparing partitions. © Kristiane Lemé-Hébuterne.

Anja Seliger, “Getting the Idea: The Role of Drawings in the Manufacturing Process of Choir Stalls”

- Fig. 1: Villard de Honnecourt. Folio 27v. © taken from Carl F. Jr. Barnes, *The Portfolio of Villard de Honnecourt (Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS Fr 19093): A New Critical Edition and Color Facsimile, with a glossary by Stacey L. Han.* Farnham (Burlington: Ashgate, 2007), plate 57.
- Fig. 2: Villard de Honnecourt. Folio 29r. © taken from Barnes 2007, plate 60.
- Fig. 3: Reims Palimpsest, reconstruction of the drawing. © taken from Robert Branner, “Drawings from a thirteenth-century architect’s shop: the Reims Palimpsest”, *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians*, Vol. 17, No. 4 (1958), Fig. 5.
- Fig. 4: Vespertolium, Syrlin-Workshop 1475, overall size of 115cm by 28cm. © Civic archiv Ulm, Inv.-Nr. 18.
- Fig. 5: Statues of the Vespertolium, destroyed in WW II. © taken from Gerhard Weilandt, “Der wiedergefundene Vertrag Jörg Syrlins des Älteren über das Hochaltarretabel des Ulmer Münsters. Zum Erscheinungsbild des frühesten holzsichtigen Retabels”, *Zeitschrift für Kunstgeschichte*, Vol. 59, No. 4 (1996), Fig. 14.
- Fig. 6: Cistercian Abbey of Blaubeuren, sedilia. © Anja Seliger.
- Fig. 7: Reims Palimpsest MS 2G 661 Martyrologe et necrologe, fol. 93r under UV-Light. © Archives de la Marne, Reims.

Angela Glover, “Module as Model for Early Modern Choir Stalls”

- Fig. 1: Three upper choir stalls, elevation drawing, pen and ink on paper, Kunstmuseum Basel, ca. 1517. © taken from Tilman Falk, *Katalog der Zeichnungen des 15. und 16. Jahrhunderts im Kupferstichkabinett Basel.* Vol. 1 (Basel: Schwabe & Co. AG Verlag, 1979), Kat.-Nr. 697, 161f. and plate 146.
- Fig. 2: Two lower choir stalls, elevation drawing, pen and ink on paper, Kunstmuseum Basel, Switzerland, ca. 1517. © taken from Tilman

Falk, *Katalog der Zeichnungen des 15. und 16. Jahrhunderts im Kupferstichkabinett Basel*. Vol. 1 (Basel: Schwabe & Co. AG Verlag, 1979), Kat.-Nr. 698, 161f. and plate 146.

- Fig. 3: Choir stall end, elevation drawing, pen and ink on paper, Kunstmuseum Basel, Switzerland, ca. 1517. © taken from Falk 1979, Kat.-Nr. 699, 161f. and plate 146.
- Fig. 4: Terminal choir stall, elevation drawing, pen and ink on paper, Kunstmuseum Basel, Switzerland, ca. 1517. © taken from Falk, Kat.-Nr. 700, 161f. and plate 146.
- Fig. 5: Terminal choir stall, elevation drawing, pen and ink on paper, Kunstmuseum Basel, Switzerland, ca. 1517. © taken from Falk 1979, Kat.-Nr. 701, 161f. and plate 146.
- Fig. 6: North choir stalls with integrated king's stall, Rodrigo Alemán, Catedral Nueva de Santa María de la Asunción, Plasencia, Spain, 1497-1508. Reproduced with the permission of the Vicario General Diócesis Plasencia. © Angela D. Glover.

Kristiane Lemé-Hébuterne, “Big Seats for Fat Benedictines, Small Ones for Slender Cistercians? Some Statistics on Choir Stall Sizes”

- Fig. 1: Les Andelys, misericord: two craftsmen carving a misericord. © Kristiane Lemé-Hébuterne.
- Fig. 2: Cuiseaux, bench-end: craftsman preparing partitions. © Kristiane Lemé-Hébuterne.
- Fig. 3: Amiens, gusset. The small piece has been cut so that it suits exactly to the partition. © Kristiane Lemé-Hébuterne.
- Fig. 4: Scheme with measurements. © Anja Seliger and Kristiane Lemé-Hébuterne.
- Fig. 5: Amiens, choir stalls: wooden rail on the floor to prevent canons' feet from sliding. © Kristiane Lemé-Hébuterne.

Ralf Buchholz, Susanne Karius, Gerdi Maierbacher-Legl, “The Choir Stalls of 1537 from Tobsdorf/Dupuș in Transylvania, Romania: Aspects of the Workshop Technique and Connections to Master Johannes Reychnut of Schäßburg/Sighișoara”

- Fig. 1: Left: 3-seated choir stalls before disassembly in 2002, Dupuș, Romania. © Mihály Ferenc. Right: Photomontage, digital reassembly of the 6-seated Dupuș choir stalls. © Christine Fiedler, Susanne Karius.
- Fig. 2: Variations of an intarsia pattern on choir stalls and sacristy doors, same tower motif on objects at different places, Biertan, Băgaciu, Ațel, Richiș, Sighișoara, Dupuș. © Susanne Karius.

- Fig. 3: Above: flat-cut ornament on the cornice of the 3-seated Dupuş choir stalls, left side. Below: flat-cut ornament on the cornice of the 4-seated Băgaciu choir stalls, left side. © HAWK Hildesheim.
- Fig. 4: Above: flat-cut ornament on the cornice of the 3-seated Dupuş choir stalls, left side, digital drawing with the vines marked in colour. © Karen Riemann, 2013, 29, Fig. 19. Below: flat-cut ornament on the cornice of the 8-seated Băgaciu choir stalls, digital drawing with the various vine trajectories marked in colour. © Jennifer Stabenow, 2016, 21, Fig. 10.
- Fig. 5: Above: red chalk marks for gluing, veneer and support, parapet panels, 6-seated choir stalls, Dupuş. © HAWK Hildesheim. Below: summarized digital representation of the red chalk gluing marks, parapet panels, 6-seated Dupuş choir stalls. © Christine Fiedler.
- Fig. 6: Examples of numeration on accoutoir, stall-ends and dividers, detail of the seat area, 6-seated choir stalls, Dupuş. © Nicole Berger, *Das Chorgestühl von 1537 aus der Kirche von Tobsdorf/Duş/Rumänien: Dokumentation der Restaurierungsmaßnahmen von 2010–2015*, unpublished MA thesis, Hildesheim 2016, 60, Fig. 54.
- Fig. 7: Impressed stripes above Johannes Reychmut's signature, canopy, 4-seated choir stalls, Băgaciu, Romania. © Ralf Buchholz.

Ulrich Knapp, “The Choir Stalls of the Cistercian Abbey at Salem from 1588–1593: Aspects of their Creation in the Context of Liturgical and Economic Reform”

- Fig. 1: Salem, choir stalls, northern section. Photo by Wilhelm Kratt showing the condition before restoration, 1910. © GLA Karlsruhe.
- Fig. 2: Salem, choir stalls, southern section. Photo by Wilhelm Kratt showing the condition before restoration, 1910. © GLA Karlsruhe.
- Fig. 3: Salem, choir stalls, northern section. Chart showing replacements. © Ulrich Knapp 2016.
- Fig. 4: Salem, choir stalls, southern section. Chart showing replacements and alterations. © Ulrich Knapp 2016.
- Fig. 5: Salem, choir stalls, northern section, seen from the back. Chart showing the markings. © Ulrich Knapp 2016.
- Fig. 6: Jakob Carl Stauder, portrait of Abbot Christian II, in the background the assembly of the choir stalls. © Ulrich Knapp.

Fig. 7: Melchior Binder, St. Donatus on the northern section, dated 1594.
© Ulrich Knapp.

Jörg Widmaier, “Set in Stone: The Stone Bench of Burs in its Social, Functional and Historic Context”

- Fig. 1: Burs (Gotland), church, thirteenth and fourteenth century. © Jörg Widmaier 2015.
- Fig. 2: Burs (Gotland), stone bench in the southern wall of the chancel, first half of the fourteenth century. © Jörg Widmaier 2015.
- Fig. 3: Fide (Gotland), sedilia niche with piscina, fourteenth century. © Jörg Widmaier 2015.
- Fig. 4: Eskilstuna, Scandinavian type of an early Christian grave monument, so-called “Eskilstunakista” (Eskilstuna cists), eleventh century. © Pål-Nils Nilsson; published by kind permission of the Swedish National Heritage Board.
- Fig. 5: Burs (Gotland), tympanum of the chancels portal showing Christ flanked with Mary and John, on the outer part: male figures, one a Franciscan friar, fourteenth century. © Jörg Widmaier 2015.
- Fig. 6: Vamlingbo (Gotland), chancel arch as a specific form of architecture connected to the activities of preaching friars on Gotland, fourteenth century. © Jörg Widmaier 2015.
- Fig. 7: Wooden seat, so-called “Korstol” (choir stall), originally in the church of Burs; now in the collection of the Swedish History Museum, Stockholm. © Katarina Nimmervoll 2016; published by kind permission of the museum.

Erika Loic, “Liturgical Activation of the Stone Choir in Santiago de Compostela: Looking at Material through the Immaterial”

- Fig. 1: Interior of the Cathedral Museum of Santiago de Compostela with model (foreground) and partial reconstruction (background). © Erika Loic (by permission of the Cathedral Museum).
- Fig. 2: Interior of the stone choir reconstruction (1999) with pieces from Master Mateo’s choir (c. 1200). Cathedral Museum of Santiago de Compostela. © Erika Loic (by permission of the Cathedral Museum).
- Fig. 3: Exterior of the stone choir reconstruction (1999) with pieces from Master Mateo’s choir (c. 1200). Cathedral Museum of Santiago de Compostela. © Erika Loic (by permission of the Cathedral Museum).
- Fig. 4: Two prophets from the stone choir (c. 1200) incorporated into the Puerta Santa. Cathedral of Santiago de Compostela. © Erika Loic.

- Fig. 5: Epiphany fragment from Master Mateo's choir (c. 1200). Cathedral Museum of Santiago de Compostela. © Erika Loic (by permission of the Cathedral Museum).
- Fig. 6: Six choirboys from the stone choir (c. 1200) incorporated into the Puerta de las Platerías. Cathedral of Santiago de Compostela. © Erika Loic.

James Alexander Cameron, “Materiality and Reflexivity between Sedilia and Choir Stalls in Medieval England”

- Fig. 1: South wall of chancel with sedilia, and choir stalls, Hospital Church of St Mary, Chichester (Sussex), c.1290. © James Alexander Cameron.
- Fig. 2: South wall of chancel with sedilia, and choir stalls, collegiate church (dependent chapel) of Nantwich (Cheshire), c.1330s and c.1370s. © James Alexander Cameron.
- Fig. 3: Bench (former sedilia of eleventh-century apse?), south nave aisle, Winchester Cathedral, probably thirteenth century. © James Alexander Cameron.
- Fig. 4: Stone choir seating, parish church of Campsall (West Yorkshire), late thirteenth or early fourteenth century. © James Alexander Cameron.
- Fig. 5: Sedilia in chancel, prebendal parish church of Sandiacre (Derbyshire), possibly 1342–7. © James Alexander Cameron.
- Fig. 6: Wooden sedilia, parish church of St Oswald, Durham, c.1340s–50s. © James Alexander Cameron.
- Fig. 7: Wooden sedilia, north chancel chapel of the parish church of Sheffield, now Sheffield Cathedral (South Yorkshire), fifteenth century. © James Alexander Cameron.
- Fig. 8: Sedilia in chancel, parish church of Southwold (Suffolk), c.1430–60. © James Alexander Cameron.

María Teresa Rodríguez Bote, “The Role of Choir Stalls made by Foreign Craftsmen in Spanish Renaissance Sculpture”

- Fig. 1: Juan de Juni, Guillén Doncel, Juan de Angés, Charles and Robertete (and others), retrochoir of the Cathedral of León, 1534–77 © María Teresa Rodríguez Bote.
- Fig. 2: Juan de Juni, St Anne, from the retrochoir screen of Salamanca, 1540 (Acknowledgements to the S.I.B. Catedral de Salamanca). © María Teresa Rodríguez Bote.
- Fig. 3: Rodrigo Alemán, choir stalls of the cathedral in Ciudad Rodrigo, 1498–1503 © María Teresa Rodríguez Bote.

Fig. 4: Choir stall of the Cathedral of Zamora, 1502–05. © María Teresa Rodríguez Bote.

Dorothee Heim, “An International Entrepreneur in Spain around 1500: The Carver Rodrigo Alemán and his Choir Stalls”

- Fig. 1: Choir stalls, 1489–96, Toledo, cathedral. © Dorothee Heim.
- Fig. 2: Predella of the Retablo mayor (detail), 1499–1504, Toledo, cathedral. © Dorothee Heim.
- Fig. 3: Choir stalls, 1497–1508, Plasencia, cathedral. © Dorothee Heim.
- Fig. 4: Choir stalls, 1503–1505/06, Ciudad Rodrigo, cathedral. © Dorothee Heim.
- Fig. 5: Archangel Gabriel, Plasencia, cathedral, choir stalls. © Dorothee Heim.
- Fig. 6: Israhel van Meckenem, Judith beheading Holofernes, engraving. © Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam.
- Fig. 7: Rodrigo Alemán, Judith beheading Holofernes, Plasencia, cathedral, choir stalls. © Dorothee Heim.
- Fig. 8: Juan de Bruselas, St Paul, Zamora, cathedral, choir stalls. © Dorothee Heim.
- Fig. 9: Martin Schongauer, St Paul, engraving. © Bildarchiv Preußischer Kulturbesitz / Jörg P. Anders.
- Fig. 10: Apostle, Plasencia, cathedral, choir stalls. © Dorothee Heim.
- Fig. 11: Prophet, Toledo, cathedral, retablo mayor. © Dorothee Heim.
- Fig. 12: St Peter, Toledo, cathedral, retablo mayor. © Dorothee Heim.
- Fig. 13: St Dorothy, Toledo, cathedral, retablo mayor. © Dorothee Heim.
- Fig. 14: St Dorothy, Plasencia, cathedral, choir stalls. © Dorothee Heim.
- Fig. 15: St Andrew, Plasencia, cathedral, choir stalls. © Dorothee Heim.
- Fig. 16: St Francis, Plasencia, cathedral, choir stalls. © Dorothee Heim.
- Fig. 17: Guiliano da Maiano, St Eugene, Florence, cathedral, vestry, 1463–65. © Dorothee Heim.
- Fig. 18: Door of the virtues (detail), Urbino, Palazzo Ducale. © Dorothee Heim.
- Fig. 19: St Peter, Plasencia, cathedral, choir stalls. © Dorothee Heim.
- Fig. 20: Pedro Berruguete, St Ambrose, Avila, cathedral, retablo mayor, 1499–1503. © Dorothee Heim.
- Fig. 21: St Ildefonsus (detail), Plasencia, cathedral, choir stalls. © Dorothee Heim.
- Fig. 22: Pedro Berruguete, St Mark, Avila, cathedral, retablo mayor, 1499–1503. © Dorothee Heim.
- Fig. 23: St Luke (detail), Plasencia, cathedral, choir stalls. © Dorothee Heim.

Christel Theunissen, “Jan Borchman and his Fellow Craftsmen: The Creation of Choir Stalls in the Low Countries”

- Fig. 1: List of contracts for choir stalls in the Low Countries, 1481–1519. © Christel Theunissen.
- Fig. 2: Map with the locations mentioned in this chapter. © Christel Theunissen.
- Fig. 3: Oirschot, St Peter’s church, choir stalls, 1508–11 (situation in 1944). © CKD.
- Fig. 4: Aarschot, Church of Our Lady, choir stalls, 1515. © Geert Zaal.
- Fig. 5: Aarschot, Church of Our Lady, choir stalls (north wall), 1515. © Geert Zaal.
- Fig. 6: Reigate (Surrey), Gatton Park, St Andrew’s church, choir stalls. © Paul Clarke.

Jörg H. Lampe, “The Choir Stalls of the Monasteries of Pöhlde and St. Alexandri in Einbeck: Observations on their Time of Origin from an Epigraphical and Historical Point of View”

- Fig. 1: Moses, dorsal panel from the former choir stalls; St John and Servatius, Pöhlde, c.1290. © Jörg Lampe.
- Fig. 2: King Henry I, stall-end from Pöhlde, Landesmuseum Hanover, c.1290. © C. Wulf.
- Fig. 3: Synagogue, stall-end from Pöhlde, Landesmuseum Hanover, c.1290. © C. Wulf.
- Fig. 4: Reconstruction of the Pöhlde choir stalls. Design: Grape 2003, 71, modifications: Jörg Lampe.
- Fig. 5: Dorsal panel, choir stalls; St Alexanders, Einbeck, 1288. © Göttingen Academy of Science, Die Deutschen Inschriften, photo archive.
- Fig. 6: Matthew, dorsal panel from the former choir stalls; St John and Servatius, Pöhlde, c.1290. © J. Lampe.
- Fig. 7: Daniel, dorsal panel from the former choir stalls; St John and Servatius, Pöhlde, c.1290. © J. Lampe.

Kaja von Cossart, “Choir Stalls and Other Thirteenth Century Furnishings in the Cistercian Monastery of Doberan”

- Fig. 1: Doberan, abbey church, view into the western nave. © Martin Heider.
- Fig. 2: Doberan, abbey church, choir stalls for the monks, northern row, western stall-end with subsequently installed pulpit. © Martin Heider.

- Fig. 3: Doberan, abbey church, choir stalls for the monks, southern row, western stall-end, upper section from parts of the former novice chair (Lily added in 1995). © Kaja von Cossart.
- Fig. 4: Doberan, abbey church, sedilia, condition after 1899. © Martin Heider.
- Fig. 5: Doberan, abbey church, *Ministerium*. © Martin Heider.
- Fig. 6: Doberan, abbey church, liturgical cupboard. © Kaja von Cossart.
- Fig. 7: Doberan, abbey church, stalls for the lay brothers, southern row, western stall-end, detail. © Kaja von Cossart.
- Fig. 8: Doberan, abbey church, console of stucco in the nave. © Kaja von Cossart.
- Fig. 9: Doberan, abbey church, sedilia, original gablet (obverse) during restoration in Ludwigslust, St. Helena, around 1998. © Jörg Schröder.

Detlef Witt, “The Anklam Stall-Ends: An Example of Choir Stalls in Parish Churches in Pomerania”

- Fig. 1: Anklam, St Mary, choir stalls on the north side, view from the southwest. The stall-ends were re-used in 1946–47. The painted wings of the destroyed *Sippenretabel* and the Meybauer-epitaph from the church of St James in Szczecin (Stettin) appear in the background. © Detlef Witt 2016.
- Fig. 2: Stall-ends from St Mary in Anklam, now in the Stralsund Museum, inv. nos. 1868:116 and 1868:117. Sent in 1868 as a loan to what was then the Provinzialmuseum für Neuvorpommern und Rügen. © Bildarchiv Caspar-David-Friedrich-Institut der Ernst-Moritz-Arndt-Universität Greifswald.
- Fig. 3: Anklam, St Mary, stall-end with a holy bishop and a prophet bust in the gable, first third of the fifteenth century. © Detlef Witt 2016.
- Fig. 4: Anklam, St Mary, St John the Evangelist, stall-end, first third of the fifteenth century. © Detlef Witt 2016.
- Fig. 5: Stralsund, St Nicholas, stall-end with St Jerome and a prophet bust. © Detlef Witt 2016.
- Fig. 6: Anklam, St Mary, griffin on the inner face of a bench-end depicting St Stephen on the outer face, mid-fifteenth century. © Detlef Witt 2016.
- Fig. 7: Anklam, St Mary, stall-ends on the north side, seen from the east, depicting St John the Evangelist and St Stephen, mid-fifteenth century. © Detlef Witt 2016.

- Fig. 8: Anklam, St Mary, St Ursula, detail of a stall-end on the south side, seen from the east, around 1500. © Detlef Witt 2016.
- Fig. 9: Anklam, St Nicholas, choir stalls on the north side, view from the southwest before the reconstruction of 1907–09. © Bildarchiv Museum im Steintor Anklam, no. 216.
- Fig. 10: Anklam, St Mary, Madonna with Child, detail of a stall-end original from the Church of St Nicholas, around 1500. © Detlef Witt 2016.

Willy Piron, “The Bilobate Misericords of the Lower Rhine Area: A Local Phenomenon?”

- Fig. 1: Misericord with the fox and the crane, Johannes Gruter, 1487, Kempen, St Mary, Stalla no 01678. © Willy Piron.
- Fig. 2: Misericord with angel bust, 1450, Xanten, Dom St Victor, Stalla no 01838. © Willy Piron.
- Fig. 3: Misericord with dog, 1486, Emmerich, St Martin, Stalla no 01628. © Willy Piron.
- Fig. 4: Dissemination of the bilobate misericords. © Willy Piron.
- Fig. 5: Misericord with bearded man, 1509-1520, Cappenberg, St Johann, Stalla no 01467. © Willy Piron.
- Fig. 6: Misericord with head of a man, Johan Kuper, 1535-1540, Münster, St Ludgeri, Stalla no 06618. © Willy Piron.
- Fig. 7: Misericord with acanthus leaf, 1475, Monastery of Steinfeld, Stalla no 06491. © Willy Piron.

LIST OF TABLES

Kristiane Lemé-Hébuterne, “Big Seats for Fat Benedictines, Small Ones for Slender Cistercians? Some Statistics on Choir Stall Sizes”

Table 1: Number of sets of choir stalls by community.

Table 2: Mean, median and extreme width dimensions of choir stalls ranked by kinds of religious communities.

Table 3: Mean, median and extreme height dimensions of choir stalls ranked by kinds of religious communities.

Table 4: Comparative width of choir stalls according to date of manufacture.

Table 5: Comparative height of choir stalls according to date of manufacture.

Table 6: List of studied choir stall sets.

Ralf Buchholz, Susanne Karius, Gerdi Maierbacher-Legl, “The Choir Stalls of 1537 from Tobsdorf/Dupuș in Transylvania, Romania: Aspects of the Workshop Technique and Connections to Master Johannes Reychnut of Schäßburg/Sighișoara”

Table 1: Overview of the group of objects, with decorative technique block intarsia and flat-cut ornament.

Ulrich Knapp, “The Choir Stalls of the Cistercian Abbey at Salem from 1588-1593: Aspects of Their Creation in the Context of Liturgical and Economic Reform”

Table 1: Working days of all sculptors and carpenters involved.

Table 2: Choir stalls (1588/93), busts on the dorsals.

Table 3: Choir stalls (1588/93), small figurines under tabernacles.

ABBREVIATIONS

<i>Ben</i>	Benedictines
<i>C</i>	Cistercians
<i>Cath</i>	Cathedral
<i>Dep</i>	Department
<i>G</i>	Geselle (journeyman)
<i>J</i>	Junge (young unskilled employee)
<i>M</i>	Meister (master)
<i>MrG</i>	Meistergeselle (master journeyman)
<i>N.B.</i>	Notes
<i>N seats</i>	Number of seats
<i>N sets</i>	Number of sets
<i>Nor</i>	Norbertines
<i>Par</i>	Parish church
<i>R.C.</i>	Regular Canons
<i>S.C.</i>	Secular Canons

INTRODUCTION

ANJA SELIGER AND WILLY PIRON

Choir stalls represent one of the most important and complex artistic assignments that could be commissioned by medieval cathedrals, monastic churches, and even parishes. Due to their highly complex image programs research on choir stalls has focused primarily on iconographic aspects and formal and stylistic analysis. Religious and profane iconography, as starting points for investigations of the artistic design, have mainly been studied in relation to other artistic elaborations, such as book painting, and their proliferation both in the Middle Ages and more recent times. Additionally, the research of *Misericordia International*, an international multidisciplinary network for broad-based research on choir stalls, was mainly focused on iconography.

Symptomatic of this approach – and not only restricted to choir stalls but in general – is that “art historians traditionally focus on the finished work, yet attention to the creative process of making allows us to consider how medieval builders and artisans constructed monuments, made objects, and planned workflow for large-scale projects. Furthermore, this line of inquiry allows us to consider spatial planning and haptic encounters.”¹

In regard to choir stalls, complex questions arise: If inscriptions give names, then whose? Is the executive craftsman himself listed, or is it the contracting entrepreneur, who stands as a substitute for his workshop? Or perhaps the sculptor who was responsible for figurative sculpture is also to be conceived therein? In any case, it is certain that choir stalls could not be produced by a single individual artist; rather they were created by a group of craftsmen. What division of labour took place in the medieval workshop? And how can we reconstruct the works of a workshop, apart from stylistic criticism?

¹ Quoted from the call for papers for the session “Material processes and making in medieval art” of the latest International Congress on Medieval Studies (ICMS) in Kalamazoo (12–15 May 2016), which was devoted to the material economic mechanisms of art production.

Studies dedicated to choir stall workshops and their working conditions are absolute exceptions. One of these exceptions is Barbara Rommé's article on the Sürlin workshop in Ulm (Germany); her research answered many social and economic questions on the basis of tectonic comparisons of various stalls. Rommé's analysis of the methods of production has shown that the younger Sürlin carpentry workshop was already structured at the beginning of the sixteenth century in such a way that it was able to manufacture stalls in a kind of small series production.² Whether and to what extent these more efficient forms of work influenced the demands of consumers with less financial power for representative furnishings and founding behaviour in general is only one of the remaining discussion points.

Regarding other European workshops, information about their working conditions and the work flow was mentioned more incidentally at the edge of monographic studies or published sporadic in the frame of articles.³ Research on choir stalls benefits from the intensive exchange within *Misericordia International*, with scientists of neighbouring disciplines opening new interfaces between disciplines and subjects of investigation, and giving new impetus to the exploration of choir stalls. The basis for scientific exchange is the bi-annual international conference.

To remedy the relative lack of research in this area, it was a logical consequence to dedicate the latest *Misericordia International* colloquium to the workshops. Held from 23 to 26 June 2016 at the Ernst-Moritz-Arndt-University in Greifswald, it was the very first conference to focus on the workshop context of the choir stalls; it covered an obvious need for research and therefore included much hitherto unknown research material, and additional first results based on initial research. All approaches were characterised by considering the production of choir stalls as a holistic process.

It is a great pleasure for us to present the contributions to the public as an impetus to a broader and a more comprehensive knowledge on the topic

² Barbara ROMMÉ, "Die Chorgestühle von Jörg Sürlin d.J. Produktionsformen einer spätgotischen Schreinerwerkstatt in Ulm", *Jahrbuch der staatlichen Kunstsammlung in Baden-Württemberg*, 27 (1990), 52–72, 70. The younger Sürlin, when signing his works, always wrote his name with a "ü", in contrast to his father who preferred Syrlin with a "y".

³ The most influential article is Thomas COOMANS, "From Flanders to Scotland: The Choir Stalls of Melrose Abbey in the Fifteenth Century" in: Teryl N. Kinder (ed.) "*Perspectives for an Architecture of Solitude. Essays on Cistercians, Art and Architecture in Honour of Peter Fergusson*" (Medieval Church Studies, vol. 11; Studia et Documenta, vol. 13), Turnhout 2004, 235-252.

of workshops. Our sincere thanks go to all the conference speakers, who contributed greatly to the success of the meeting with their enthusiasm and discussion. We regret that due to the very tight publication timetable, unfortunately not all of the speakers could submit their texts to this volume. We have therefore added one additional contribution to the conference proceedings.

The chapters in this volume represent the wide range of the conference's topics of the workshop and art production. In several case studies the colloquium in Greifswald investigated the substantive and economic mechanisms of medieval and early modern art production and the process of manufacturing choir stalls. The papers explore questions such as the role of migrant craftsmen in the merger of regional characteristics, as well as the mechanisms for the spread of new styles and techniques such as marquetry, and which workshops they mediated. The new material also examines various collaborations between carpenters, sculptors and painters during work in progress. New archival materials are presented that answer business-related questions and illuminate the problem of art centre and periphery. An often-discussed phenomenon is the relation between travelling craftsmen and both monastery and urban immobile workshops. Technical drawings and models still play an important role in carpentry and cabinet-making today, just as they did in the process of choir stall manufacturing.

Mecklenburg-Western Pomerania, although only little known, is rich in the number of choir stalls and could be described as a flowering choir stall landscape at the beginning of the fourteenth century as well as in the later Middle Ages. The articles on Doberan and Anklam testify to the fact that Pomerania has always attracted innovative and well-skilled craftsmen.

A section on stone chairs explores the relationship of choir stalls to related seating furnishings such as sedilia, and examines differences in the attachment of the iconographic image programs. An aspect of choir stalls that has never been thoroughly researched is the inscriptions. Choir stalls are, of course, not situated in a vacuum, but are linked to a wide variety of clients' conditions and requirements. Therefore, the question of the role of contracting entities and other influences and demands appears in all investigations.

We would like to thank Prof. Dr. Frédéric Billiet, the chairman of Misericordia International. Many thanks to Prof. Dr. Gerhard Weilandt, who hosted and presided the conference at the Ernst-Moritz-Arndt-University in Greifswald. We would like to express our gratitude for his

full support, and especially for the acquisition of third-party funds. The German Research Foundation (DFG) generously supported the conference.

This publication was made possible by the Image Knowledge Gestaltung. An Interdisciplinary Laboratory Cluster of Excellence at the Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin (sponsor number EXC 1027/1) with financial support from the German Research Foundation as a part of the Excellence Initiative.

The translation of selected contributions (WITT, MAIERBACHER-LEGL, KNAPP) was carried out by Caitlin Brass from the office of LS Anderson (Berlin), and Diane Winkler (VON COSSART), and the copy-editing by Catherine Hanley from Hanley Editorial (Coventry); all three deserve the greatest thanks. We are also grateful to Cambridge Scholars Publishers, particularly Victoria Carruthers, Theo Moxham and Amanda Millar for professional publishing services.

Berlin and Nijmegen, Winter 2016/17

PART I:
WORKSHOP PRACTICES

GETTING THE IDEA: THE ROLE OF DRAWINGS IN THE MANUFACTURING PROCESS OF CHOIR STALLS

ANJA SELIGER

Introduction

Due to their highly complex imaging systems, choir stalls are categorised among the most important and complex furniture in medieval churches. The artistic challenge of creating new stalls needed to begin long before the first tree was cut down and the manufacturing process started. Both client and craftsman needed to make several decisions: on general aspects such as size, number of seats and overall shape, but also on the design of details and the iconographic program. The purchasing client – normally a monastic congregation, a chapter or the parish council – and the craftsman might have individual conflicting requirements, ideas, and maybe even a different preconception of how the stalls should look. Their initial mental images of the finished product might vary considerably, so it was important to transform these different points of view into an acceptable compromise.

There were several means by which a design could be created that would be agreeable to all parties. Sometimes client and craftsman visited existing choir stalls of a similar design to those planned,¹ the intention of these visits was to clarify requirements and to avoid misunderstandings.

¹ For example, the churchwardens of Saint Nicolai in Kalkar and the craftsman “Kistemeker” Henrik Bernts from Wesel went to Cleves in order to visit the stalls of the Franciscan priory there, which would serve *ad exemplum* as a model for the new set. Guido DE WERD, *Die St. Nikolaikirche zu Kalkar* (München/Berlin: DKV, 1983), 26. Account books from St Martin in Memmingen contain records of payments for travelling in advance of the fabrication of new stalls. See Günther BAYER, *Memmingen* (Memmingen, 1983), 19.

Moreover, building a set of stalls *ad exemplum* (or, in modern terms, copying) was common practice in medieval art production, and it was a valid way to demonstrate a certain level of aspiration. A second design technique was to build models, either full size or small scale, before the manufacturing process was initiated. The principal advantage of such prototypes was their haptic, three-dimensional form, which, when posed at the intended place, established an authentic test environment.²

Somewhere in between these two modes, and by far the easiest practice for specifying a design, was a drawing: an initial rough draft followed by a more detailed or final draft, similar to a technical drawing. From the examination of written sources we can deduce that drawings were central and regularly used in the production process of medieval choir stalls, either with or functioning as models. Despite their importance, they are little known and under-investigated within the scope of choir stalls research. A survey of the research material reveals that, in comparison to the manifold choir stalls which remained *in situ*, medieval drafts of choir stalls are very few and far between.

In this chapter I will draw attention to three drawings dated to the thirteenth century: two sketches in the portfolio of Villard de Honnecourt [Fig. 1 and Fig. 2], and the so-called Reims Palimpsest [Fig. 3]. None of them shows an entire choir stall, but rather individual components, the reasons for which will be explained in the following investigation. In addition I will examine the only drawing showing a whole seating furniture, dated to the late fifteenth century. It shows a *sedilia*, or *Vespertolium*, consisting of three seats for the priests who celebrated mass at the main altar [Fig. 4].

The size of all drawing types could range from small scale to full size, although no examples of the latter have survived the passage of time. The functions of the drawings examined in this chapter are in many ways equivalent to medieval architectural elevations, but as the number of both maintained drawings and archival sources about their use is very poor – especially from the earlier period – we cannot assign to them one single function. As a result, a number of interpretive problems occur, problems that I will attempt to clarify in the course of the following pages.

The use of drawings in written sources

Written documents confirm the important role of drawings, and occasionally elucidate their usage. One of these archival sources belongs to the Utrecht

² For more information on models, see Angela Glover's chapter in this volume.

Cathedral in the Netherlands. Master Jan Gossaert van Mabuse, the designer of the new choir, was paid in 1522 for two drawings: a small-scale design, probably on paper, and a full-size drawing on wood.³ The full-size drawing was definitely a working drawing, used directly in the workshop or on the construction site. The Utrecht source gives the reason why these working drawings were maintained: the craftsmen cut the wooden panel along the outlines of the drawn stall and then used it as template for all identical components. Most likely the panels were reused for another set of stalls, as was the case for the group of work in Stendal (Germany). They were usually only destroyed once they were no longer needed or once their condition had deteriorated.

The Utrecht source gives us the additional information that Master Jan was called *pictor* – not “joiner” or “carpenter”, as was common at that time in German-speaking regions. This fact may mirror a changing workshop practice at the outset of early modern times, characterised by a stricter division of working fields. The design was developed by an artist: carpenters and carvers were not involved in the artistic process. And although the carvings were executed under the leadership of Jan Gossaert, the manufacturing process failed due to the new style, unfamiliar to the craftsmen and compounded by the high artistic level postulated by the artist.⁴ This shows that it was necessary to develop the design in conjunction with the construction process; both artist and craftsman needed to work together in order to create the new stalls successfully.

The *Vespertolium*

Within the practice of the fifteenth century, the so-called *Visierung* was the most important drawing. In German the vernacular term *Visierung* indicates large-scale elevations of architectural structures or seating furniture consisting of only a couple of seats. The technical term also indicates “the final design, executed by the artist (who is in this case the carpenter, N.B. author) and approved by the client, which was to be followed closely by the artist and his assistants during the execution of the work itself”.⁵ By this definition the *Visierung* was usually a part of the contract.⁶

³ W. H. VROOM, “Jan Gossaert van Mabuse als ontwerper van koorbanken in de Dom van Utrecht”, *Oud Holland*, Vol. 79, No. 3 (1964), 172–75, 173.

⁴ VROOM 1964, p. 175. This may indicate a first glimmering of the separation of the arts from the *artes mechanicae*, the crafts.

⁵ Robert W. SCHELLER, *Exemplum, Model-Book Drawings and the Artistic Transmission in the Middle Ages (ca. 900 – ca. 1470)* (Amsterdam: University

The best-known correlation of contract and *Visierung* is probably that documented for Ulm Minster and the well-known workshop of the Syrlin family. According to the contract for the choir stalls in the parish church of Ulm, which Jörg Syrlin the elder signed in June 1469, a drawing had to be submitted in advance. This “*visierung, so er denne in furgehalten geben*”⁷ was the basis for the manufacturing process. Unfortunately this drawing is no longer in existence, so the choir stalls in Ulm are not central to this investigation.

A second example also related to Ulm Minster and the Syrlin family is a *Visierung* of Jörg Syrlin the younger, called the *Vespertolium* [Fig. 4]. This *Visierung* is now preserved in the civic archives of Ulm.⁸ It shows seating furniture for priests and deacons to be used during certain phases of worship when they were not celebrating mass at the main altar. The drawing of the *Vespertolium* is finished in brown ink on two sheets of parchment, with an overall size of 115cm by 28cm. The inscription at the front of the central seat dates it to the year 1475, but there is no signature.

The body of the seat was constructed on a hexagonal floor plan crowned with a canopy and three slender spires. The seat is frontal barred by a parapet. Each seat is built into a deep niche with figurines on its back panels. The one in the centre represents a priest from the Old Testament, with the outer back panels each depict an apostle.

Due to the contract for the *Vespertolium*, which explicitly mentions this *Visierung*, older research attributed the drawing to Jörg Sürilin the younger,⁹ who manufactured the seat and completed the work by 1484

Press Amsterdam, 1995), 10, emphasises that in Italy the terms *modello* and *esempio* are used with the same meaning as *Visierung*.

⁶ Günther BINDING: *Baubetrieb im Mittelalter* (Darmstadt: Primus-Verlag, 1993), 206. Drawing studies could include elevations of whole structures, and details as well as copies of other drawings (floor plans and elevations), as is assumed for five sheets in Basel and two others in Vienna associated with the stalls of 1517 in the Fugger chapel at Augsburg, Germany. See Tilman FALK, *Katalog der Zeichnungen des 15. und 16. Jahrhunderts im Kupferstichkabinett Basel*. Vol. 1 (Basel: Schwabe & Co. AG Verlag, 1979), Kat.-Nr. 697–701, 161f. and plate 146. Thanks to Angela Glover for this reference.

⁷ Hans ROTT, *Alt-Schwaben und die Reichsstädte*, Quellen und Forschungen zur südwestdeutschen und schweizerischen Kunstgeschichte im XI. und XVI. Jahrhundert, Vol. 2, (Stuttgart: Strecker & Schröder, 1934), 51: “*do er denne arbeiten wirdet, der visierung, so er denne in furgehalten geben*”.

⁸ Ulm Civic Archive, Inv.-Nr. 18.

⁹ The younger Sürilin, when signing his works, always write his name with a “ü”, in contrast to his father who prefers Syrlin with a “y”. Barbara ROMMÉ, *Serielle oder nur Massenhafte Produktion? Rationalisierungstendenzen in der Kunst der*

seven years after the design of the furniture was drawn. In later years the question of attribution was reopened, with the result that Syrlin the elder may also be considered as potential author of the drawing. A co-operation between father and son is also possible. The main argument of this attribution to the father is the drawing technique, which corresponds very well to Syrlin's architectural drawings and the *Visierung* of a retable, characterised by hair-thin lines.¹⁰ In addition, deep niches in the dorsal are defining characteristics in both the *Vespertorium* and the choir stalls, finished in 1474; therefore, the drawing is assigned to the initial design of the Münster furnishings. However, as this drawing technique was very common in workshops of this time, authorship cannot be definitively assigned. In addition, further formal characteristics show the hand of the young Sürlin, who adopted new stylistic developments such as heavily overcut gables and pinnacles curved into the space, which also includes the use of tree-like gables and pinnacles.¹¹ Although this chapter is not the best place to settle the question of attribution definitively, the most logical conclusion to draw from the collected evidence is that the drawing seems to be a collaboration between father and son.

Returning to the question of function, the *Vespertorium* is a *Visierung* in its proper sense. As pellucid as possible, the *Visierung* illustrates the spatial arrangement of the components. The top or slight bird's-eye-view of pedestal, parapet and bench indicates that these components are in the lower part; their overlapping indicates its depth and that the components are located in different layers. The figurines are also shown in slight top view since they are in the lower zone. Deeper spatial parts are marked by shadows, characterised by short parallel lines as though they have been used extensively in the canopy.

Unfortunately it is hard to prove to what degree the drawing and seat match, since the *Vespertorium* was destroyed in 1766. The only evidence

Spätgotik und Renaissance, in Ann MORATH-FROMM, Gerhard WEILANDT (eds.), *Unter der Lupe, neue Forschungen zu Skulptur und Malerei des Hoch- und Spätmittelalters*. FS für Hans Westhoff zum 60. Geb. (Stuttgart: Südt. Verl.-Ges., 2000), 277–90, p. 279.

¹⁰ Johann Josef BÖKER et al., *Architektur der Gotik, Ulm und Donauraum. Ein Bestandskatalog der mittelalterlichen Architekturzeichnungen aus Ulm, Schwaben und dem Donauegebiet* (Salzburg: Wien Müri Salzmann, 2011), 109 N° 37, assigns the drawing to Syrlin the elder. See also Barbara ROMMÉ, “Das Schaffen von Jörg Sürlin dem Jüngeren”, *Ulm und Oberschwaben*, Vol. 49 (1994), 61–110, p. 69.

¹¹ The sedilia in the monastery church in Blaubeuren, executed by Sürlin the younger in 1495/96, shows similar characteristics. It is also possible that he copied the *Vespertorium*. The choir stalls, which are a few years older than the sedilia, already show more developed ornamentation.

for the realia in terms of manufactured furniture is an old photograph showing three wooden statues [Fig. 5], reused in another piece of furniture and destroyed in World War II. The photograph shows that the overall structure of the figurines was determined by the *Visierung*,¹² but artistic freedom – or, more precisely, iconographic freedom – was still possible. The side figurines planned as apostles have been executed as prophets. Also the formal composition of the central figure differs from the drawing: the priest holds a banderole and indicates the inscription with his left hand, instead of having empty hands held in front of the body ready for prayer, as was planned in the drawing. This iconographic program refers strictly to a typological juxtaposition. But while in the drawing the typological idea is represented by images from Old and New Testament, in the wooden *Vespertorium* the anti-typological part has been transferred to the minster clergy by reducing the auxiliary figures to the Old Testament.

Thanks to the figurines it is possible to reconstruct the size of the wooden *Vespertorium*: the scale of 1:12 means that the overall height of the piece of furniture was 12.5m.¹³ The huge canopy and its spires, which reach as high as the vault springers, are the artistic highlight within the liturgical furnishings. An idea of the overall impression of the *Vespertorium* can be given by another furnishing which was also manufactured by Jörg Sürin the younger in the year 1496: the sedilia in the Cistercian monastery in Blaubeuren, Germany [Fig. 6], which, although it is not comparable in height, also mediates the main properties and reflects the overwhelming charisma that was exuded by the *Vespertorium*.

Villard de Honnecourt

Of a totally different nature but no less impressive are the drawings of the choir stalls in the so-called portfolio of Villard de Honnecourt, now preserved in the Bibliothèque nationale de France, Paris, MS Fr 19093. As they have been reprinted several times in related key literature they are probably the best-known drawings of choir stalls.¹⁴ The portfolio consists

¹² Gerhard WEILANDT, “Der wiedergefundene Vertrag Jörg Sylrins des Älteren über das Hochaltarretabel des Ulmer Münsters”, *Zeitschrift für Kunstgeschichte*, Vol. 59, No. 4 (1996), 437–60, p. 455.

¹³ BÖKER et al. 2011, p. 109.

¹⁴ Examples are: Walter LOOSE, *Die Chorgestühle des Mittelalters*, Heidelberg kunstgeschichtliche Abhandlungen, vol. 1 (Heidelberg: Winter, 1931), Tafel 37 & 38; Martin URBAN, “Lemma Chorgestühl”, in *Reallexikon zur deutschen Kunstgeschichte*, Otto SCHMITT (ed.), vol. III (1954), Sp. 515, Fig. 2; Hannelore

of a collection of thirty-three parchments showing a wide range of architectural elevations, designs for figurines, ornaments, animals, and three drawings of components belonging to choir stalls. The average size of the parchments is 24cm by 16cm.

The drawings consists of two elevations of decorated stall-ends (called *poppet* by Villard), a large and rich one on folio 29v covering almost the whole sheet, and a smaller, simple one on folio 27v supplemented by a section of an intermediate divider of the choir stall seats.¹⁵

All components are drawn with light sepia ink and then gone over with a darker sepia to reinforce the lines. Selected lines such as the vertical and main horizontal lines (which indicate for example the substructure or the level of the *accoudoir*), are executed with drypoint as preliminary drawings. In addition, extensive use of preliminary drawing with graphite and reinforcement with darker ink can be observed on folio 29v.

The shape of the stall-ends is based on an upright rectangle, divided into a two-part composition: the lower register is filled with architectural elements such as blind gemel niches and attached columns. An architrave supports two semi-circular stems fusing in the centre of the design. All components are characterised by a more or less extensive combination of floral elements. Leaves and berries cover the volute as well as the knob (*appiu-main*) on the *parclose*.

The scientific community is united in judging that the stall-end on folio 29r is a masterpiece and “by far the most detailed non-figurative drawing in the portfolio”.¹⁶ Furthermore, the open leaf-volutes are called “among the most successful and sensitive design of the Middle Ages”.¹⁷ This shape was used widely during the whole of the thirteenth century and later, especially in the Lower Rhine region.

Although older research named the portfolio *lodge-book*, which implies that it was not only drawn but also used by architects, it is not known whether Villard was an architect, a carpenter or a woodworker. We

SACHS, *Mittelalterliches Chorgestühl* (Leipzig: Köhler & Amelang, 1964), Fig. 1–3.

¹⁵ Folio 27v. also contains a figurative drawing covering one side of the parchment in full height.

¹⁶ Carl F. BARNES Jr., *The Portfolio of Villard de Honnecourt (Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS Fr 19093): A New Critical Edition and Color Facsimile*, with a glossary by Stacey L. Han. Farnham (Burlington: Ashgate, 2007), 186.

¹⁷ Francios BUCHER, *Architector. The Lodge Books and Sketchbooks of medieval Architects*. Vol. 1 (New York: Abaris Books, 1979), 158.