

Dreaming across Languages and Cultures

Dreaming across Languages and Cultures:
A Study of the Literary Translations
of the *Hong lou meng*

By

Laurence K. P. Wong

**CAMBRIDGE
SCHOLARS**

P U B L I S H I N G

Dreaming across Languages and Cultures: A Study of the Literary Translations of the *Hong lou meng*
By Laurence K. P. Wong

This book first published 2014

Cambridge Scholars Publishing

12 Back Chapman Street, Newcastle upon Tyne, NE6 2XX, UK

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Copyright © 2014 by Laurence K. P. Wong

All rights for this book reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the copyright owner.

ISBN (10): 1-4438-5887-0, ISBN (13): 978-1-4438-5887-8

CONTENTS

Preface	vi
Acknowledgements	ix
Note on Romanization	xi
Note on Abbreviations	xii
Note on Glossing	xvii
Introduction	1
Chapter One.....	75
Problems Arising from Linguistic Differences	
Chapter Two	157
Problems Arising from Cultural Differences	
Chapter Three	230
Idiolect	
Chapter Four	256
Dialect	
Chapter Five	280
Register	
Chapter Six	308
Style	
Chapter Seven.....	389
The Limits of Literary Translation	
Chapter Eight.....	487
Conclusion	

PREFACE

Originating from my Ph. D. thesis completed in the Graduate Department of East Asian Studies, University of Toronto in 1992, *Dreaming across Languages and Cultures: A Study of the Literary Translations of the Hong lou meng* is a dream in two senses. First, it signifies the most famous dream in Chinese literature being re-dreamed in five major European languages, namely, English, French, German, Italian, and Spanish. Second, it discusses, analyses, and compares in detail from the perspectives of translation studies, linguistics, literature, and culture fourteen literary translations in English, French, German, Italian, and Spanish of the *Hong lou meng* 紅樓夢 (*Dream of the Red Chamber* or *Red Chamber Dream*)—also known as *Shitou ji* 石頭記 (*The Story of the Stone*)—by the great Qing writer Cao Xueqin 曹雪芹, which is generally recognized as the greatest Chinese novel, and which has, for more than two centuries, fascinated millions of readers, whether in China or in the West. It is a dream that has cast the most irresistible spell on the Chinese reading public, and will continue to do so as long as Chinese literature is going to last; it is a dream which men and women, whether old or young, constantly enjoy wandering into.

In the Chinese-speaking world as well as in the world of sinology, the scale of *Hong lou meng* studies has no parallel. Over the past century, literally hundreds of thousands of articles, collections of essays, and monographs have been published on the subject, complemented by many scholarly journals and countless academic conferences held within and outside China; thousands of scholars have spent their lives debating the novel's authorship, tracing the author's genealogy, studying the work as a *roman-à-clef*, and trying, in vain, to find *la clef* (the key). Surely such an "enterprise" is without parallel in the humanities, that is, except in Bible, Shakespeare, and Dante studies.

Given the scale of the "enterprise," one would have thought that no *Hong lou meng* stone could have been left unturned. Yet, looking back upon more than a century of *Hong lou meng* studies—also called "*Hongxue* 紅學" or "Redology" from the colour signified by the first character of the novel's Chinese title—I found one such stone being overlooked: the possibility of a comprehensive book-length study of the

English, French, German, Italian, and Spanish translations of the masterpiece. The moment I became aware of this anomaly, I thought to myself: “Like translations of Shakespeare’s plays and of Dante’s *Commedia*, translations of the *Hong lou meng* are legion, encompassing a staggering number of languages. With so many translators having decoded Cao Xueqin’s *Dream* for English, French, German, Italian, and Spanish readers, why is there still no one coming up with a book-length ‘Interpretation of *Dreams*?’”

In the original *Hong lou meng*, the story begins as follows:

Long ago, when the goddess Nü-wa was repairing the sky, she smelted down a great quantity of rock and, on the Incredible Crags of the Great Fable Mountains, moulded the amalgam into thirty-six thousand, five hundred and one large building blocks, each measuring seventy-two feet by a hundred and forty-four feet square. She used thirty-six thousand five hundred of these blocks in the course of her building operations, leaving a single odd block unused, which lay, all on its own, at the foot of Greensickness Peak in the aforementioned mountains.

Now this block of stone, having undergone the melting and moulding of a goddess, possessed magic powers. It could move about at will and could grow or shrink to any size it wanted. Observing that all the other blocks had been used for celestial repairs and that it was the only one to have been rejected as unworthy, it became filled with shame and resentment and passed its days in sorrow and lamentation.

One day, in the midst of its lamentings, it saw a monk and a Taoist approaching from a great distance, each of them remarkable for certain eccentricities of manner and appearance. When they arrived at the foot of Greensickness Peak, they sat down on the ground and began to talk. The monk, catching sight of a lustrous, translucent stone—it was in fact the rejected building block which had now shrunk itself to the size of a fan-pendant and looked very attractive in its new shape—took it up on the palm of his hand and addressed it with a smile:

‘Ha, I see you have magical properties! But nothing to recommend you. I shall have to cut a few words on you so that anyone seeing you will know at once that you are something special.’¹

¹ David Hawkes’s translation. See David Hawkes, trans., *The Story of the Stone: A Chinese Novel by Cao Xueqin*, collated by Fan Shengyu, Vol. 1, “The Golden Days,” 1st ed. 1973 (Shanghai: Shanghai Foreign Language Education Press 上海外語教育出版社; Penguin Books; July 2012), 3; five vols.; Vols. 1-3 translated by David Hawkes; Vols. 4-5 translated by John Minford. The number of building blocks in the latest edition tallies with that in the original Renmin wenxue chubanshe 人民文學出版社 edition of 1964; it differs from the number in the 1973 edition of Hawkes’s own translation, which reads: “three hundred and six thousand, five hundred and one.” See David Hawkes, trans., *The Story of the Stone*:

Seeing “a single odd” stone left unturned “in the midst of its lamentings” at the foot of *Hong lou meng* Studies Peak, I, too, became a monk, “took it up on the palm of [my] hand,” and “cut a few words on” it. Then, about a year ago, more words began to be added. Now, “GENTLE READER,”² lying in yours hands is the stone with a name: *Dreaming across Languages and Cultures*. As “a single odd” stone with words cut on it, it is intended to fill a gap in the sky of *Hong lou meng* and translation studies, a gap which has long been felt, but which has not yet been filled. With this “single odd” stone, I hope to be able to share my findings with scholars and students of the following disciplines: translation studies, *Hong lou meng* studies, linguistics, Chinese literature, comparative literature. In examining, analysing, comparing, and evaluating fourteen translations from the perspective of both theory and practice, I also hope to be able to shed some light on the Chinese masterpiece, on the art and craft of translation, on Chinese culture, and on the Chinese language *vis-à-vis* five major European languages.

Since I completed my piece of research at the University of Toronto in 1992, a lot has happened in translation studies in general and in *Hong lou meng* translation in particular. In translation studies, many new theories have been put forward. In *Hong lou meng* translation, three new complete versions of the novel have appeared, thereby doubling the number of complete translations which I looked at more than twenty years ago. In this thoroughly revised and totally updated study, I have dealt at great length with many more translation theories—whether old or new—and included for detailed analysis the three new complete versions, which are as voluminous as the original *Dream* and their counterparts published in the 1970s and 1980s. In terms of scope, then, this book is almost double my Ph. D. thesis, which is entitled *A Study of the Literary Translations of the Hong lou meng: With Special Reference to David Hawkes’s English Version*.

Laurence K. P. Wong
May 2014

A Chinese Novel by Cao Xueqin in Five Volumes, Vol. 1, “The Golden Days” (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1973), 47.

² David Hawkes, trans., *The Story of the Stone: A Chinese Novel by Cao Xueqin*, collated by Fan Shengyu, Vol. 1, “The Golden Days,” 1st ed. 1973 (Shanghai: Shanghai Foreign Language Education Press 上海外语教育出版社; Penguin Books; July 2012), 3.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express once again my gratitude to Professor Wayne Schlepp and Professor Milena Doleželová of the Department of East Asian Studies, University of Toronto, from whose advice and insights I have benefited so much. The days I spent with them on the St. George Campus of the University of Toronto discussing language, literature, and translation as well as general academic matters will always remain a delightful and memorable part of my Canadian experience.

My gratitude is also due to the following professors of the University of Toronto, from whose learning I have benefited in various ways: Professor A. H. C. Ward, of the Department of East Asian Studies, Professor Raymond Chu, of the Department of East Asian Studies, Professor P. W. Nesselroth, of the Centre for Comparative Literature; and to Professor Don Holoch and Professor Shu-ying Tsau, my former colleagues in the Department of Languages, Literatures and Linguistics at York University, Canada, whose support has meant a lot to me.

In preparing my manuscript, particularly in trying to solve problems with scanning and formatting as well as with fonts relating to rare Chinese characters, I received immense help from Ms. Willie Chan of the Department of Translation, Lingnan University. In the Department of Translation, The Chinese University of Hong Kong, I received similar help from Mr. Andy Liu and Ms. Jessica Liu. To all of them I would like to say a warm “Thank you!”

My warm thanks also go to Ms. Rosaline Chan of the Department of Translation, The Chinese University of Hong Kong, who has given me help in more ways than one.

In the Introduction, I have quoted at great length Janet Sanders’s journal article, “Divine Words, Cramped Actions: Walter Benjamin—an Unlikely Icon in Translation Studies,” which I read in the library of Lingnan University, but which I could not find in the library of The Chinese University of Hong Kong. I would like to thank my former colleague Professor Chang Nam-fung of the Department of Translation, Lingnan University for xeroxing this important article for me.

From the moment I submitted my book proposal to the final stages of the book’s production, Ms. Carol Koulikourdi, Ms. Amanda Millar, Mr.

Sean Howley, Mr. Adam Terry, and Mr. Keith Thaxton, all of Cambridge Scholars Publishing, have impressed me with their exemplary efficiency and professionalism in matters relating to anonymous review, contract-signing, typesetting, and marketing. To all of them I would like to express my deep appreciation.

Needless to say, I am equally appreciative of Cambridge Scholars Publishing's acceptance of my book proposal, without which it would not have been possible for the most famous, most fascinating dream in Chinese literature to dream in a monograph across five languages and cultures.

Laurence K. P. Wong
May 2014

NOTE ON ROMANIZATION

Personal names, place names, and titles in Chinese are romanized according to the *Hanyu Pinyin Fang'an* 漢語拼音方案 (the Chinese Phonetic Alphabet). Thus “Cao Xueqin” stands for “曹雪芹,” “Changchun” stands for “長春,” “*Hong lou meng*” stands for “紅樓夢,” “Gao E” stands for “高鶚,” “Renmin wenxue chubanshe” stands for “人民文學出版社,” and so on. Where personal names and titles in Chinese appear in the Wade-Giles (or Wade) System or other systems on title pages, they are retained in brackets after their romanized forms in *Hanyu Pinyin*; e.g. “Cao Xueqin (Ts’ao Hsüeh-ch’in),” “Cao Xueqin (Ts’ao Siue-kin),” and so on. For authors whose names have all along been romanized in the Wade-Giles System, the Wade-Giles romanization is retained in references: e.g. “Wu Shih-ch’ang 吳世昌,” “Yang Hsien-yi 楊憲益, and so on. Well-known place names like Peking 北京 and Taipei 台北 are also retained when publications are cited. In the Wade-Giles System, aspiration is indicated differently by different scholars; thus the Wade-Giles romanization for “曹” can be “Ts’ao,” “Ts’ao,” or “Ts’ao.” In this study, the mark for aspiration is normally standardized, that is, only the apostrophe “’” is used.

According to *Hanyu Pinyin*, the name of a person, when it consists of two characters, such as “寶玉,” “黛玉,” “寶釵,” and “熙鳳,” is normally written as one word; thus, when romanized, “寶玉” is written as “Baoyu,” 黛玉 as “Daiyu,” “寶釵” as “Baochai,” and “熙鳳” as “Xifeng.” However, as my study takes David Hawkes’s version of the *Hong lou meng* as its frame of reference, when personal names are referred to in my discussion, “Baoyu,” “Daiyu,” “Baochai,” “Xifeng,” and so on are all written as hyphenated names (“Bao-yu,” “Dai-yu,” “Bao-chai,” “Xi-feng,” and so on), that is, following Hawkes’s practice. In direct quotations, though, the romanization systems of individual translators are retained. For example, in Tu Xi’s and Mirko Láuer’s versions, “寶玉,” “黛玉,” “寶釵,” and “熙鳳” are romanized as “Baoyu,” “Daiyu,” “Baochai,” and “Xifeng”; in direct quotations, these names remain unchanged. By the same token, in quoting Rainer Schwarz’s version, I have followed the practice of the German translator: “Bau-yü” for “寶玉,” “Dai-yü” for “黛玉,” “Bautschai” for “寶釵,” “Hsi-fëng” for “熙鳳,” and so on. The same rule applies to versions in other languages.

NOTE ON ABBREVIATIONS

For clarity and for ease of reference, the following abbreviations are used when words, phrases, sentences, or passages from the original *Hong lou meng* or from its translations are quoted:

Source Language (SL) Text:

- C. = Cao Xueqin 曹雪芹 and Gao E 高鶚, *Hong lou meng* 紅樓夢,¹ 4 vols., 1st ed. 1957 (Peking: Renmin wenzue chubanshe 人民文學出版社, 3rd ed. 1964).

Target Language (TL) Texts:²

¹ The romanized title of the Chinese novel can be written in three different ways: *Hong lou meng*, *Honglou meng*, or *Hongloulou meng*. In *Honglou meng*, the first two characters are taken as one word; in *Hongloulou meng*, all three characters are taken as one word; in *Hong lou meng*, each of the three characters is taken as an independent word. As the three characters normally function as independent words in the Chinese language, whether classical or modern, retaining their respective significations even when combining to form the title of the novel, I have regarded them as such, and followed Hawkes's romanization.

² In recent years, the terms *source text* (or *Source Text*) and *target text* (or *Target Text*) are often used instead of *Source Language (SL) text* and *Target Language (TL) text*. For general purposes, the popular and loose usages are convenient and acceptable; strictly speaking, though, *target text* is less accurate than *Target Language (TL) text*. This is because before the process of translation begins, the so-called *target text* is non-existent, whereas the Target Language (or target language) is always there, ready to become the target of the translator or of the translation process; to sustain the "target" metaphor, before the process of translation begins or when the process of translation is in progress, what is *targeted* by the translator is the language into which the original is translated, that is, the Target Language or target language, not the target text, which is still non-existent; only when the process of translation is completed will there be a target text. For this reason, I have followed J. C. Catford's more precise terminology, and avoided using only *target* to qualify *text*. See J. C. Catford, *A Linguistic Theory of Translation: An Essay in Applied Linguistics* (London: Oxford University Press, 1965), 20-21. Written more than forty years ago, Catford's slim volume of 103 pages has said so much about translation with so much clarity and precision (even

- B. = Clara Bovero and Carla Pirrone Riccio, trans., *Il sogno della camera rossa: romanzo cinese del secolo XVIII*, by Cao Xueqin, Italian version based on the German version, *Der Traum der roten Kammer: Ein Roman aus der frühen Tsing-Zeit*, trans. and adapted from the Chinese by Franz Kuhn (Torino: Giulio Einaudi, 1958).
- Birch = Cyril Birch, trans., “How to Be Rid of a Rival,” from *Red Chamber Dream [Hong lou meng, Chapters 63-69, extracts]*, by Cao Xueqin, in *Anthology of Chinese Literature: From the 14th Century to the Present Day*, ed. and with an Introduction by Cyril Birch (New York: Grove Press, Inc., 1972), Vol. 2 of *Anthology of Chinese Literature*, 201-58. 2 vols. Vol. 1, *Anthology of Chinese Literature: From Early Times to the Fourteenth Century*, compiled and ed. by Cyril Birch; Associate Editor, Donald Keene (New York: Grove Press, Inc., 1965).
- Chang = H. C. Chang, trans. and ed., “A Burial Mound for Flowers,” partial translation of Chapter 23 of the *Hong lou meng*, by Cao Xueqin (Ts’ao Hsüeh-ch’in), in *Chinese Literature: Popular Fiction and Drama* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1973), 387-403.
- G. = Armel Guerne, trans., *Le Rêve dans le pavillon rouge (Hong-leou mong)*, by Cao Xueqin (Ts’ao siue-kin), 2 vols., French version based on the German version, *Der Traum der roten Kammer: Ein Roman aus der frühen Tsing-Zeit*, trans. and adapted from the Chinese by Franz Kuhn (Paris: Guy le Prat, 1957).

in such apparently minor matters as terminology) that it is hardly rivalled by any one of the myriad monographs and collections of essays in translation studies published ever since. On Catford’s theory and on the linguistic approach to translation studies, I shall have more to say in the Introduction.

- H. = David Hawkes, trans., *The Story of the Stone*, by Cao Xueqin, Vols. 1-3, Penguin Classics (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1973-80).
- J. = H. Bencraft Joly, trans., *Hung lou meng*; or, *The Dream of the Red Chamber; a Chinese Novel*, by Cao Xueqin, 2 vols. (Hong Kong: Kelly and Walsh, 1892-93).
- K. = Franz Kuhn, trans. and adapted, *Der Traum der roten Kammer: Ein Roman aus der frühen Tsing-Zeit*, by Cao Xueqin, 1st ed. 1932 (Wiesbaden: Insel-Verlag, 1951).
- L. = Li Tche-houa and Jacqueline Alézaïs, trans., *Le Rêve dans le pavillon rouge*, by Cao Xueqin, revision by André d'Hormon, 2 vols. (Bourges, France: Gallimard, 1981).
- Láuer = Mirko Láuer, trans., *Sueño de las mansiones rojas*, by Cao Xueqin and Gao E, version castellana, Colección Fenix, ilustraciones de Liu Danzhai, 4 vols. (Peking: Ediciones en Lenguas Extranjeras (Foreign Languages Press), 1991).
- M. = Florence McHugh and Isabel McHugh, trans., *The Dream of the Red Chamber: A Chinese Novel of the Early Ching Period*, by Cao Xueqin, English version based on the German version, *Der Traum der roten Kammer: Ein Roman aus der frühen Tsing-Zeit*, translated and adapted from the Chinese by Franz Kuhn (New York: Pantheon Books Inc., 1958)
- Minford = John Minford, trans., *The Story of the Stone*, by Cao Xueqin and Gao E, Vols. 4-5, Penguin Classics (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1982-86).
- Schwarz = Vols. 1 and 2 of Rainer Schwarz and Martin Woesler, trans., *Der Traum der Roten Kammer oder Die*

- Geschichte vom Stein*, by Cao Xueqin (Tsau Hsüä-tjin), *Sinica* 《漢學論壇》叢書, Band / Vol. 14, 3 vols., Vols. 1-2 by Rainer Schwarz, Vol. 3 by Martin Woesler (Berlin / Bochum / Dülmen / London / Paris: Europäischer Universitätsverlag / European University Press, 2006).
- Tu Xi = Tu Xi, trans., *Sueño en el Pabellón Rojo*, 3 vols., by Cao Xueqin and Gao E, edición revisada, corregida y anotada por Zhao Zhenjiang y José Antonio García Sánchez, ilustraciones de Liu Danzhai, 2.a edición (second edition) (Granada: Servicio de Publicaciones de la Universidad de Granada; Pekin (Peking): Ediciones en Lenguas Extranjeras (Foreign Languages Press, 2nd ed. 1988).
- W. = Chi-chen Wang, trans., *Dream of the Red Chamber*, by Cao Xueqin (Ts'ao Hsüeh-ch'in), with a continuation by Gao E (Kao Ou) (New York: Twayne, 1958).
- Woesler = Vol. 3 of Rainer Schwarz and Martin Woesler, trans., *Der Traum der Roten Kammer oder Die Geschichte vom Stein*, by Cao Xueqin (Tsau Hsüä-tjin), *Sinica* 《漢學論壇》叢書, Band / Vol. 14, 3 vols., Vols. 1-2 by Rainer Schwarz, Vol. 3 by Martin Woesler (Berlin / Bochum / Dülmen / London / Paris: Europäischer Universitätsverlag / European University Press, 2006).
- Y. = Yang Hsien-yi and Gladys Yang, trans., *A Dream of Red Mansions*, by Cao Xueqin (Ts'ao Hsüeh-ch'in) and Gao E (Kao Ngo), 3 vols. (Peking: Foreign Languages Press, 1978-80).

The abbreviation “C.” is followed by a chapter (*hui* 回) number and a page number. Thus, “C., 9, 8” stands for “Cao Xueqin 曹雪芹, and Gao E 高鶚, *Hong lou meng* 紅樓夢, 4 vols., 1st ed. 1957 (Peking: Renmin wenxue chubanshe 人民文學出版社, 3rd ed. 1964), Chapter 9 (第九回), page 8.

With the translations, where the title consists of only one volume, the abbreviation is followed only by the page number. Thus, “W., 38” stands for “Chi-chen Wang, trans., *Dream of the Red Chamber*, by Cao Xueqin (Ts’ao Hsüeh-ch’in), with a continuation by Gao E (Kao Ou) (New York: Twayne, 1958), page 38.” Where the translation consists of more than one volume, the abbreviation is followed by a volume number, a colon, and a page number within that volume. Thus, “Y., 3:119” stands for “Yang Hsien-yi and Gladys Yang, trans., *A Dream of Red Mansions*, by Cao Xueqin (Ts’ao Hsüeh-ch’in) and Gao E (Kao Ngo), 3 vols. (Peking: Foreign Languages Press, 1978-80), Volume 3, page 119.”

NOTE ON GLOSSING

In glossing words, phrases, sentences, and passages in my study, I have consulted the following dictionaries:

English:

R. E. Allen, *The Concise Oxford Dictionary of Current English*, 1st ed. by H. W. Fowler and F. G. Fowler, 1911 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 8th ed. 1990).

Stuart Berg Flexner, et al., eds., *The Random House Dictionary of the English Language*, 2nd ed., unabridged (New York: Random House, Inc., 1987).

Philip Babcock Gove, et al., eds., *Webster's Third New International Dictionary of the English Language Unabridged* (Springfield, Massachusetts: G. & C. Merriam Company, 1976).

William Little, et al., prepared and eds., *The Shorter Oxford English Dictionary on Historical Principles*, 1st ed. 1933 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 3rd ed. with corrections 1970).

J. A. Simpson and E. S. C. Weiner, eds., *The Oxford English Dictionary*, first ed. by James A. Murray, Henry Bradley, and W. A. Craigie, 20 vols., combined with A Supplement to *The Oxford English Dictionary*, ed. R. W. Burchfield (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2nd ed. 1989). Also referred to as the *OED* for short.

John Sinclair, et al., eds., *Collins Cobuild English Dictionary* (London: HarperCollins Publishers, 1995).

French:

Faye Carney, et al., eds., *Grand dictionnaire: français-anglais / anglais-français / French-English / English-French Dictionary* unabridged, 2 vols. 1: *français-anglais / French-English*; 2: *anglais-français / English-French* (Paris: Larousse, 1993).

Abel Chevalley and Marguerite Chevalley, comp., *The Concise Oxford French Dictionary: French-English*, 1st ed. 1934 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, reprinted with corrections 1966). G. W. F. R.

- Goodridge, ed., *The Concise Oxford French Dictionary: Part II: English-French*, 1st ed. 1940 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, reprinted with corrections 1964).
- Marie-Hélène Corréard, et al., eds., *The Oxford Hachette French Dictionary: French-English • English-French / Le Grand dictionnaire Hachette-Oxford: français-anglais • anglais-français*, 1st ed. 1994, 4th ed. by Jean-Benoit Ormal-Grenon and Nicholas Rollin (Oxford: Oxford University Press; Paris: Hachette Livre; 4th ed. 2007).
- Louis Guilbert, et al., eds., *Grand Larousse de la langue française en sept volumes* (Paris: Librairie Larousse, 1971-1978). On the title page of Vol. 1, Vol. 2, and Vol. 3, the words indicating the number of volumes are “en six volumes” [in six volumes] instead of “en sept volumes” [in seven volumes]; on the title page of Vol. 4, Vol. 5, Vol. 6, and Vol. 7, the words “en sept volumes” [in seven volumes] are used. As a matter of fact, the dictionary consists of seven volumes instead of six. The publication years are 1971 (Vol. 1), 1972 (Vol. 2), 1973 (Vol. 3), 1975 (Vol. 4), 1976 (Vol. 5), 1977 (Vol. 6), and 1978 (Vol. 7).
- Paul Imbs, et al., eds., *Trésor de la langue française: Dictionnaire de la langue du XIX^e et du XX^e siècle (1789-1960)*, 16 vols. (Paris: Éditions du Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, 1971).
- J. E. Mansion, revised and enlarged by R. P. L. Ledésert, et al., *Harrap's New Standard French and English Dictionary*, 4 vols., 1st ed. 1934-1939 (London: Harrap, 1972-1980).
- Alain Rey, et al., eds., *Le Grand Robert de la langue française*, deuxième édition dirigée par Alain Rey du dictionnaire alphabétique et analogique de la langue française de Paul Robert, 6 vols. , 1st ed. 1951-1966 (Paris: Dictionnaires le Robert, 2001). In the list of “PRINCIPAUX COLLABORATEURS” [“PRINCIPAL COLLABORATORS”], however, the six-volume edition is described as “Édition augmentée” [enlarged or augmented edition] “sous la responsabilité de [under the responsibility of] Alain REY et Danièle MORVAN,” the second edition being a nine-volume edition published in 1985.
- Alain Rey, et al., eds., *Dictionnaire historique de la langue française*, 6 vols. (Paris: Dictionnaires le Robert, 2000).

German:

- Harold T. Betteridge, ed., *Cassell's German & English Dictionary*, 1st ed. 1957, based on the editions by Karl Breul (London: Cassell & Company Ltd., 12th ed. 1968).
- Günther Drosdowski, et al., eds., *DUDEN: Das große Wörterbuch der deutschen Sprache*, in acht Bänden [in eight volumes], völlig neu bearbeitete und stark erweiterte Auflage herausgegeben und bearbeitet vom Wissenschaftlichen Rat und den Mitarbeitern der Dudenredaktion unter der Leitung von Günther Drosdowski (Mannheim / Leipzig / Wien / Zurich: Dudenverlag, 1993-1995).
- Wolfgang Pfeifer, et al., eds., *Etymologisches Wörterbuch des Deutschen*, 3 vols. (Berlin: Akademie – Verlag, 1989).
- W. Scholze-Stubenrecht, et al., eds., *Oxford-Duden German Dictionary: German-English / English-German*, 1st ed. 1990 (Oxford University Press, 3rd ed. 2005).
- Gerhard Wahrig, et al., eds., *Brockhaus Wahrig Deutsches Wörterbuch*, in sechs Bänden [in six volumes] (Wiesbaden: F. A. Brockhaus; Stuttgart: Deutsche-Verlags-Anstalt, 1980-1984).

Italian:

- Maria Cristina Barreggi, et al., eds., *DII Dizionario: Inglese Italiano • Italiano Inglese*, in collaborazione con Oxford University Press (Oxford: Paravia Bruno Mondadori Editori and Oxford University Press, 2001).
- Salvatore Battaglia, et al., eds., *Grande dizionario della lingua italiana*, 21 vols. (Torino: Unione Tipografico-Editrice Torinese, 1961-2002). *Supplemento all'indice degli autori citati: autori, opere, edizioni che compaiono nei volumi X, XI e XII per la prima volta; Supplemento 2004*, diretto da Edoardo Sanguineti, 2004; *Indice degli autori citati nei volumi I-XXI e nel supplemento 2004*, a cura di Giovanni Ronco, 2004; *Supplemento 2009*, diretto da Edoardo Sanguineti, 2008.
- Giorgio Cusatelli, et al., eds., *Dizionario Garzanti della lingua italiana*, 1st ed. 1965 (Milan: Aldo Garzanti Editore, 18th ed. 1980).
- Aldo Duro, et al., eds., *Vocabolario della lingua italiana*, 4 vols. (Roma: Istituto della Enciclopedia Italiana, 1986-1994).
- Catherine E. Love, et al., eds., *Collins dizionario inglese: italiano-inglese inglese-italiano*, imprint issued by HarperResource in 2003

(Glasgow / New York: HarperCollins Publishers; Milan: Arnoldo Mondadori Editore; 2000).

Vladimiro Macchi, et al., eds., *Dizionario delle lingue italiana e inglese*, 4 vols., Parte Prima: Italiano-Inglese, Parte Seconda: Inglese-Italiano, realizzato dal Centro Lessicografico Sansoni sotto la direzione di Vladimiro Macchi, seconda edizione corretta e ampliata, i grandi dizionari Sansoni / *Dictionary of the Italian and English Languages*, 4 vols., Part One: Italian-English, Part Two: English-Italian, edited by The Centro Lessicografico Sansoni under the general editorship of Vladimiro Macchi, second edition corrected and enlarged, The Great Sansoni Dictionaries (Firenze: Sansoni Editore, 1985). With Supplemento to Parte Prima a cura di Vladimiro Macchi, 1985.

Tullio de Mauro [ideato e diretto da Tullio de Mauro], et al., eds., *Grande dizionario italiano dell'uso*, 6 vols. (Torino: Unione Tipografico-Editrice Torinese, 2000).

Piero Reborá, et al., prepared, *Cassell's Italian-English English-Italian Dictionary*, 1st ed. 1958 (London: Cassell & Company Limited, 7th ed. 1967).

Spanish:

Martín Alonso, ed., *Enciclopedia del Idioma: Diccionario Histórico y Moderno de la Lengua Española (Siglos XII al XX), Etimológico, Tecnológico, Regional e Hispanoamericano*, 3 vols. (Madrid: Aguilar, 1958).

Joan Corominas and José A. Pascual, eds., *Diccionario Crítico Etimológico Castellano e Hispánico*, 6 vols., Biblioteca Románica Hispánica, dirigida por Dámaso Alonso, V. Dictionarios, 7 (Madrid: Editorial Gredos, 1980-1991).

Beatriz Galimberti Jarman, et al., eds., *The Oxford Spanish Dictionary: Spanish-English · English-Spanish / Gran Diccionario Oxford: Español-Inglés · Inglés-Español*, 1st ed. 1994 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 4th ed. 2008).

Real Academia Española, ed., *Diccionario de la Lengua Española*, vigésima segunda edición [22nd ed.] (Madrid: Real Academia Española, 2001).

Chinese-English:

Wu Jingrong, et al., eds., *The Pinyin Chinese-English Dictionary* (Peking / Hong Kong: The Commercial Press; New York / Chichester / Brisbane / Toronto: John Wiley and Sons, Inc.; 1983).

Greek:

Henry George Liddell and Robert Scott, compiled, *A Greek-English Lexicon*, 1st ed. 1843, new edition revised and augmented throughout by Henry Stuart Jones, et al., with a revised supplement 1996 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, new (ninth) ed. 1940).

Liddell and Scott, *Greek-English Lexicon*, abridged ed. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1989).

Latin:

Charlton T. Lewis and Charles Short, revised, enlarged, and in great part rewritten, *A Latin Dictionary*, founded on Andrews' edition of Freund's Latin Dictionary, 1st ed. 1879 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, impression of 1962).

D. P. Simpson, *Cassell's Latin Dictionary: Latin-English / English-Latin*, 5th ed. (New York: Macmillan Publishing Company, 1968).

A. Souter, et al., eds., *Oxford Latin Dictionary* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1968).

Russian:

Paul Macura, comp., *Elsevier's Russian-English Dictionary*, 4 vols., second, revised edition (Amsterdam / Lausanne / New York / Oxford / Shannon / Singapore / Tokyo: Elsevier, 1999).

E. Wedel and A. S. Romanov, *Romanov's Pocket Russian-English English-Russian Dictionary*, Part I by E. Wedel, Part II by A. S. Romanov, with special emphasis on American English, two volumes in one, pocket book edition (New York: Pocket Books, August 1964).

With the exception of English, when the study singles out a lexical item or lexical items for special discussion, the lexical item(s) will be glossed, normally as literally as possible, so as to highlight its / their

semantic content. When a gloss is added, it is put in single quotation marks.

In the case of Chinese lexical items in the Chinese script, their *pinyin* 拼音 (the Chinese Phonetic Alphabet) romanized forms are normally given first. As readers of *Dreaming across Languages and Cultures* are presumably conversant with at least two languages, namely, Chinese and English, Chinese quotations are not exhaustively romanized or glossed, so as to avoid distracting readers' attention unnecessarily. Except for the light tone (*qingsheng* 輕聲), tone marks are not given when Chinese lexical items are transliterated, unless the tones of the lexical items are relevant to the discussion. For convenience' sake, the gloss is normally given immediately after the lexical item(s) before the reference, for example: "liuto" 'lute' (B., 206), "laúd" 'lute' (Tu Xi, 1:488). In either case, "lute" is only the gloss, which, not being part of the quotation, does not appear in the version referred to.

INTRODUCTION

I. Translations of the *Hong lou meng* in the Major European Languages

This book is an attempt to study from the point of view of literary translation versions of the *Hong lou meng* 紅樓夢 ‘The Dream of the Red Chamber’ in five major Western languages, namely, English, French, German, Italian, and Spanish.

According to current bibliographies and research,¹ as far as the major Western languages are concerned, the first partial translation of the *Hong lou meng* 紅樓夢, “The Poetry of Chinese,” by John Francis Davis, appeared in 1830, that is, thirty-eight years after Gao E 高鶚 and Cheng Weiyuan’s 程偉元 120-chapter edition (1792) of the novel was published.² It was then followed by other partial translations, such as those by R. Thom (1842) and Edward Charles Bowra (1868);³ like

¹ See Wu Shih-ch’ang 吳世昌, *On The Red Chamber Dream: A Critical Study of Two Annotated Manuscripts of the XVIIIth Century* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1961), 359-60; Tsung Shun Na 那宗訓, *Studies on Dream of the Red Chamber: A Selected and Classified Bibliography* (Hong Kong: Lung Men Press, 1979), 159-63; Hu Wenbin 胡文彬, ed. and comp., *Hong lou meng xulu* 紅樓夢敘錄 (Changchun: Jilin renmin chubanshe 吉林人民出版社, 1982), 59-67; Yi Su 一粟, *Hong lou meng shulu* 紅樓夢書錄 (Shanghai: Gudian wenxue chubanshe 古典文學出版社, 1958), 82-84.

² This edition, published in 1792, is called the “*Cheng yi ben* 程乙本” (Cheng’s text B) of the *Hong lou meng*. The edition referred to in this study is the one published in Taipei: Cao Xueqin 曹雪芹, *Cheng yi ben xin juan quanbu xiuxiang Hong lou meng* 程乙本新鑄全部繡像紅樓夢, eds. Gao E 高鶚 and Cheng Weiyuan 程偉元 (Taipei: Guangwen shuju 廣文書局, 1977). The “*Cheng yi ben*” was in turn based on the “*Cheng jia ben* 程甲本” (Cheng’s text A) published in 1791.

³ For a general introduction to R. Thom (Glaswegian Robert Thom, 1807-1846) and Edward Charles Bowra (1841-1874) as well as an evaluation of their partial translations, see John Minford’s Foreword to H. Bencraft Joly, trans., *The Dream of the Red Chamber*, by Cao Xueqin (Tokyo / Rutland, Vermont / Singapore: Tuttle Publishing, 2010), xi-xxii. According to Minford, Robert Morrison

Davis's version, they were all limited in scope, ranging from one to only a few chapters.⁴

In 1892, a breakthrough was made when H. Bencraft Joly, an English consul in China, published Volume 1 of his *Hung lou meng; or, The Dream of the Red Chamber: A Chinese Novel*, which was followed by Volume 2 in 1893.⁵ This version went beyond the hitherto limited scope of its predecessors, and gave the reader a fuller picture of the original. However,

(1781-1834) did a translation of the fourth chapter of the *Hong lou meng*, and “offered it to his publisher in London for inclusion in a possible second volume of his anthology *Horae Sinicae* as an item ‘which may afford some amusement.’ [...] But his extract never saw the light of day” (Foreword, xiv). This “manuscript translation,” Minford says, “must surely be the earliest translated extract from the novel” (Foreword, xiv).

⁴ “Thom’s brief extract, taken from the sixth chapter of *Dream*, recounts the visit to the Rong-guo mansion of Dame Lew, or Goody Lew as Thom sometimes calls her—劉姥姥, Grannie Liu in the Penguin version. It is included in his little ‘Primer of Chinese,’ entitled *The Chinese Speaker, or extracts from works written in the Mandarin Language as spoken at Peking, compiled for the use of Students*, in Chinese 正音撮要” (Minford, Foreword, xiv). “Edward Bowra’s translation was a longer and more ambitious affair, comprising altogether eight chapters from the opening section of the novel” (Minford, Foreword, xv). He was indebted to Thom for “rendering Lao-lao-ly as Goody” as well as to his own teacher, “the pioneer sinologist W. F. Mayers (1839-1878), who had published some translated extracts from the novel” (Minford, Foreword, xv). Though only partial, Bowra’s version has been favourably assessed by Minford: “Bowra’s version was entitled *The Dream of the Red Chamber (Hung Low Meng): A Chinese novel literally translated*. It was carried in several instalments of the *China Magazine*, published by Noronha & Sons in Hong Kong, 1868-1870. He demonstrated great skill in translating into rhyming verse the many poetic passages that occur in the novel. He also captured with great sensitivity many of the innuendoes that have escaped other translators. [xvi] The Introduction (written either by Bowra himself or possibly by the magazine’s editor, C. Langdon Davis) allows us to observe immediately that Bowra was the first translator to view his subject primarily as a work of literature, not as an object of missionary zeal and indignation, or as a tool for language acquisition. [xvii] In general, the Bowra translation is astonishingly good for its date. It is stylish, eloquent, and witty, and does not shy away from the inherent difficulties of the text [xix]” (Minford, Foreword, xvi-xix).

⁵ H. Bencraft Joly, trans., *Hung lou meng; or, The Dream of the Red Chamber: A Chinese Novel*, by Cao Xueqin, 2 vols. (Hong Kong: Kelly and Walsh, 1892-93). Quotations in my discussion are from this edition. In 2010, this translation was reissued under a new title. See H. Bencraft Joly, trans., *The Dream of the Red Chamber*, with a New Foreword by John Minford and a New Introduction by Edwin Lowe (Tokyo / Rutland, Vermont / Singapore: Tuttle Publishing, 2010).

as it covered only the first fifty-six chapters, it was still incomplete, keeping the reader guessing as to what happens after Chapter 56.

This state of affairs continued until 1929, when Chi-chen Wang 王際真 published, in English, an abridged version of the novel, entitled *Dream of the Red Chamber*.⁶ In 1932, Franz Kuhn's German version, *Der Traum der roten Kammer: Ein Roman aus der frühen Tsing-Zeit* 'The Dream of the Red Chamber: A Novel of the Early Qing Period',⁷ followed. Though

⁶ Chi-chen Wang, trans., *Dream of the Red Chamber*, by Cao Xueqin (Ts'ao Hsüeh-ch'in), with a continuation by Gao E (Kao Ou), 1st ed. 1929 (New York: Twayne, 1958).

⁷ Franz Kuhn, trans. and adapted, *Der Traum der roten Kammer: Ein Roman aus der frühen Tsing-Zeit*, by Cao Xueqin, 1st ed. 1932 (Wiesbaden: Insel-Verlag, 1951). On the SL text of this translation, Kuhn has the following to say: "Meiner Übertragung lagen zwei Ausgaben des Orginaltextes zugrunde, eine ältere, im Besitz des Ostasiatischen Seminars der Universität Leipzig befindliche Ausgabe von 1832 (Tsui wen, »Literaturdickicht«-Verlag [萃文書屋]) und ein moderner, dreifach kommentierter [...] Schanghai Commercial Press [上海商務印書館]—Neudruck." See Kuhn, *Der Traum der Roten Kammer* (1951 ed.), 821. In English, the quotation reads: "My translation is based on two editions of the original text, an older one, which is an existing 1832 edition (Cuiwen 'Grove of Literature' Press) in the possession of the East Asian Institute of Leipzig University, and a modern reprint published by the Shanghai Commercial Press, annotated by three commentators [...]" (my translation). In his Preface to the German version by Rainer Schwarz and Martin Woesler, however, Woesler says that the two editions mentioned by Kuhn could not be located in China. In 1932, only an annotated edition of the novel by Wang Xilian 王希廉 (*Shuangqing xianguan ben* 雙清仙館本 [*Shuangqing xianguan* edition]) was published; as for the "modern [...] reprint" ("ein moderner [...] Neudruck"), Woesler thinks that Kuhn probably had in mind a newly published annotated edition by Wang Xilian 王希廉, Yao Xie 姚燮, and Zhang Xin 張新, entitled *Zengping buxiang quantu jinyuyuan* 增評補像全圖金玉緣, designated "*sanjia pingzhu*" "三家評注" ("annotated by three commentators," or "dreifach kommentierter" in Kuhn's words). Woesler believes that, in addition to the annotated edition, Kuhn appears to have used a Chinese edition which can be traced back to the "*Cheng jia ben* 程甲本" (Cheng's text A) of 1791. See Schwarz and Woesler, *Der Traum der Roten Kammer*, 1: v. Woesler points out that, as a matter of fact, as early as 1843, there was already a German translation of the first chapter of the *Hong lou meng* published. The relevant footnote on page v of Schwarz and Woesler's *Der Traum der Roten Kammer* (Vol. 1) reads: " 'Chun-lou-men ('Traumgesicht auf dem rothen Thurm') oder 'Geschichte des Steins'. Tschenschi-in erfährt im Traume die Wiederbelebung des Steins; Zja-jui-zun verliebt sich in seiner Armuth in eine schöne Magd.' Übers. A. I. Kovaňko (1808-1870). *Das Ausland* 1843, 198-199, 201-203." See Schwarz and

also abridged, it was, in some ways, an improvement upon Wang's version. In an Explanatory Remark ("Begleitwort") that accompanied his 1951 edition, Kuhn said:

Die Arbeit des Herrn Wang, dem Umfang nach kaum ein Viertel meiner Fassung, ist nur im Anfang Übertragung, zum überwiegenden Teil aber recht trockener, nüchterner Auszug, der uns nicht warm macht, uns keine rechte Vorstellung vom Geist des Originals vermittelt. Herr Wang läßt nicht nur zahlreiche Einzelheiten aus, die gerade für uns Europäer von höchstem Interesse sind, er überschlägt auch, was noch bedenklicher ist, vieles, was zum logischen Verständnis des Hauptgeschehens wesentlich ist. Ich könnte hundert Feinheiten aufzählen, die uns Herr Wang vorenthalten hat [...]⁸

Mr. Wang's work, barely one-fourth of my version, is a translation only at the beginning; the greater part of it is really a dull and insipid summary, which neither warms us up nor conveys to us the true spirit of the original. Mr. Wang not only leaves out numerous details, which are really of the greatest interest to us Europeans, but also omits—which is even more serious—a lot of things which are essential to the logical understanding of the major episodes. I could enumerate a hundred examples of his omissions [...]⁹

In 1958, Wang published an expanded English version of the novel,¹⁰ which "just about doubles the old one in the actual amount of significant material included, if not in the actual number of words";¹¹ with the episodes presented in a less sketchy manner, it was certainly an improvement upon his first attempt. Together with Kuhn's version, it represented a new stage in the history of *Hong lou meng* translation in the major Western languages, when readers could get hold of abridged versions in which the untranslated chapters were summarized.

Woesler, *Der Traum der Roten Kammer*, 1:v. In quoting Woesler, I have Anglicized the German quotation marks.

⁸ Kuhn, *Der Traum der roten Kammer*, 824.

⁹ My translation. In their English translation of Kuhn's Introduction, the McHughs (xiv) have rendered only part of the original, omitting some of its adverse criticism of Wang's version. In my rendering, I have followed Kuhn's original more closely. For the McHughs' translation, see Florence and Isabel McHugh, trans., *The Dream of the Red Chamber: A Chinese Novel of the Early Ching Period*, by Cao Xueqin, English version based on the German version *Der Traum der roten Kammer*, trans. and adapted from the Chinese by Franz Kuhn (New York: Pantheon, 1958), xiv.

¹⁰ Chi-chen Wang, trans., *Dream of the Red Chamber*, by Cao Xueqin, with a continuation by Gao E (Kao Ou) (New York: Twayne, 1958).

¹¹ Wang, *Dream of the Red Chamber*, xix.

Soon after the publication of Kuhn's *Der Traum der roten Kammer*, three other versions followed: a French version by Guerne (1957), an English version by two sisters, Florence and Isabel McHugh (1958), and an Italian version by Clara Bovero and Carla Pirrone Riccio (1958), entitled respectively *Le Rêve dans le pavillon rouge (Hong-leou mong)* 'The Dream in the Red Chamber (Hong lou meng)',¹² *The Dream of the Red Chamber: A Chinese Novel of the Early Ching Period*,¹³ and *Il sogno della camera rossa: romanzo cinese del secolo XVIII* 'The Dream of the Red Chamber: Chinese Novel of the Eighteenth Century.'¹⁴ But as they were all translations of Kuhn's version, apart from serving the purpose of introducing French, English, and Italian readers to the Chinese novel through German, they broke little ground which was not already broken.

In the same year in which the McHugh sisters' version and the version by Bovero and Riccio appeared, a breakthrough took place: a complete Russian version (also the first complete version of the novel in a Western language) by V. A. Panasyuk (В. А. Панасюк), entitled *СОН В КРАСНОМ ТЕРЕМЕ* 'Dream in the Red Chamber' was published. Then, in the 1970s and 1980s, four more complete versions, two in English, one in French, and one in Czech followed in its wake.

The first, entitled *The Story of the Stone*, in five volumes, appeared in 1973, 1977, 1980, 1982, and 1986 respectively. While Volumes 1 to 3, covering Chapters 1 to 80 of the original, were translated by David Hawkes,¹⁵ Volumes 4 and 5, covering Chapters 81 to 120, were translated

¹² Armel Guerne, trans., *Le Rêve dans le pavillon rouge (Hong-leou mong)*, by Cao Xueqin (Ts'ao Siue-kin), based on the German version, *Der Traum der roten Kammer*, trans. and adapted from the Chinese by Franz Kuhn (Paris: Guy le Prat, 1957).

¹³ Florence and Isabel McHugh, trans., *The Dream of the Red Chamber: A Chinese Novel of the Early Ching Period*, by Cao Xueqin, English version based on the German version, *Der Traum der roten Kammer*, trans. and adapted by Franz Kuhn (New York: Pantheon, 1958).

¹⁴ Clara Bovero and Carla Pirrone Riccio, trans., *Il sogno della camera rossa: romanzo cinese del secolo XVIII*, by Cao Xueqin, Italian version based on the German version, *Der Traum der roten Kammer*, trans. and adapted from the Chinese by Franz Kuhn (Torino: Giulio Einaudi, 1958).

¹⁵ David Hawkes and John Minford, trans., *The Story of the Stone: A Chinese Novel in Five Volumes by Cao Xueqin*, Penguin Classics, 5 vols., Vol. 1, 'The Golden Days,' Vol. 2, 'The Crab-Flower Club,' Vol. 3, 'The Warning Voice,' Vol. 4, 'The Debt of Tears,' Vol. 5, 'The Dreamer Wakes,' Vols. 1-3, trans. David Hawkes, Vols. 4-5, trans. John Minford (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1973-86). Hawkes and Minford's translation is based on various editions of the *Hong lou meng*, but

by John Minford. The reason for the division of labour is not too difficult to guess: like many Chinese scholars, Hawkes was of the opinion that Cao Xueqin wrote only the first eighty chapters of the *Hong lou meng*, while the remaining forty chapters were “by an anonymous author”,¹⁶ under this belief, he may have thought it fit to leave Chapters 81 to 120 to a different hand, so as to create, in the translation, structural features and stylistic effects that correspond to those resulting from the supposed “division of labour” in the original.

The second complete version, *A Dream of Red Mansions*, in three volumes, is also the work of two translators: Yang Hsien-yi and his wife, Gladys Yang.¹⁷ Like the version by Hawkes and Minford, it was also

largely on the “*Cheng yi ben* 程乙本” (Cheng’s text B) of 1792. Thus Hawkes writes in his Introduction to Volume 1: “In translating this novel I have felt unable to stick faithfully to any single text. I have mainly followed Gao E’s version of the first chapter as being more consistent, though less interesting, than the other ones; but I have frequently followed a manuscript reading in subsequent chapters, and in a few, rare instances I have made small emendations of my own” (Hawkes, *The Story of the Stone*, Introduction, 1:45-46). For other information on the SL text of Hawkes’s version, see the entry “Hong-lou meng” in *The Indiana Handbook to Traditional Chinese Literature*, ed. William H. Nienhauser, Jr. (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1986), 456, which gives detailed information about the SL text of Hawkes’s version), and David Hawkes, *The Story of the Stone: A Translator’s Notebooks* (Hong Kong: Centre for Literature and Translation, Lingnan University, 2000). In an audio interview conducted by Connie Chan with Hawkes in Oxford on 7 December, 1998, the translator says that the translation “follows one popular edition [Cheng-yi text] much more closely and gets more eclectic as it goes along.” The above quotation is cited by Fan Shengyu, “The Translator as Scholar and Editor: On Preparing a New Chinese Text for the Bilingual *The Story of the Stone*,” in *Style, Wit and Word-Play: Essays in Translation Studies in Memory of David Hawkes*, eds. Tao Tao Liu, Laurence K. P. Wong and Chan Sin-wai (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2012), 147. The square brackets in the quotation are Fan’s. Connie Chan’s interview was appended to her M. Phil. thesis at the Hong Kong Polytechnic University, 2000. The new bilingual edition, also in five volumes, was published in July 2012. See David Hawkes and John Minford, trans., *The Story of the Stone: A Chinese Novel by Cao Xueqin*, collated by Fan Shengyu, 5 vols., Vol. 1, ‘*The Golden Days*,’ Vol. 2, ‘*The Crab-Flower Club*,’ Vol. 3, ‘*The Warning Voice*,’ Vol. 4, ‘*The Debt of Tears*,’ Vol. 5, ‘*The Dreamer Wakes*’ (Shanghai: Shanghai Foreign Language Education Press 上海外语教育出版社, 2012). With this new bilingual edition published, it is now easier to relate Hawkes’s TL text to his SL text.

¹⁶ Hawkes, *The Story of the Stone*, Introduction, 1:18.

¹⁷ Yang Hsien-yi and Gladys Yang, trans., *A Dream of Red Mansions*, by Cao Xueqin (Ta’ao Hsüeh-ch’in) and Gao E (Kao Ngo), 3 vols. (Peking: Foreign

published in separate volumes over a long period: Volumes 1 and 2 in 1978, and Volume 3 in 1980.

While the versions by Hawkes and Minford and the Yangs are in English, the third, translated by Li Tche-houa and Jacqueline Alézaïs and revised by André d'Hormon, is in French. Entitled *Le Rêve dans le pavillon rouge* 'The Dream in the Red Chamber' and consisting of two volumes, it was published in 1981.¹⁸

Languages Press, 1978-1980). As for the SL text used, the Yangs have the following to say: "The numerous editions of this novel [*Hong lou meng*] can be divided into two main groups: those based on the early manuscript copies of the eighty-chapter version, and those based on the later 120-chapter printed edition. Our first eighty chapters have been translated from the photostat edition published by the People's Literature Publishing House [人民文學出版社], Peking, in September 1973 according to a lithographic edition printed by the Yu-cheng Press [有正書局], Shanghai, in about 1911. This Yu-cheng edition had been made from a manuscript copy kept by Chi Liao-sheng [戚蓼生] of the Chien-lung [乾隆] era. The last forty chapters are based on the 120-chapter edition reprinted by the People's Literature Publishing House, Peking, in 1959 from the movable-type edition of 1792 [the "*Cheng yi ben* 程乙本"]. The Chi Liao-sheng manuscript of the first eighty chapters is one of the earliest copies extant. In our translation certain minor errors and omissions made by the man who copied the original manuscript have been corrected according to other versions." See Yang and Yang, *A Dream of Red Mansions*, 1:ix.

¹⁸ Li Tche-houa and Jacqueline Alézaïs, trans., *Le Rêve dans le pavillon rouge*, revision by André d'Hormon, 2 vols. (Bourges, France: Gallimard, 1981). As indicated by the translators (Vol. 1, pp. cxxxvii-cxxxviii), this translation is based on more than one edition of the novel. Thus Li and Alézaïs write:

On dispose aujourd'hui, pour l'établissement du texte, de deux éditions critiques:

- celle de Qi Gong, publiée à Pékin, en 1957; elle est basée sur la version courante des cent vingt récits;
- celle de Yu Pingbo, publiée également à Pékin, en 1958; elle est basée sur la version des copies manuscrites des quatre-vingts premiers récits.

Aucune de ces deux éditions critiques ne nous paraît tout à fait satisfaisante. C'est la raison pour laquelle nous avons dû, dans notre traduction, établir nous-même notre propre texte, en choisissant les leçons qui nous ont semblé les meilleures dans les différentes éditions et les fac-similés des manuscrits en notre possession" (L., 1:cxxxvii).

[Today, to establish the text, one has at one's disposal two critical editions:

- Qi Gong's [啟功] edition, published in Peking, in 1957; this is based on the current version of 120 chapters;
- Yu Pingbo's [俞平伯] edition, also published in Peking, in 1958; this is based on the manuscript version of the first eighty chapters.

Then, a complete Czech translation entitled *Sen v rudém domě* by Oldřich Král, a Czech specialist in Chinese aesthetics and literature, was published in 1982 and 1984 in three volumes.

In the Spanish-speaking world, *Hong lou meng* translation began to make history when, in 1988, a complete version, entitled *Sueño en el Pabellón Rojo (Memorias de una roca)* ‘*Dream in the Red Pavilion (Memories of a Stone)*,’ in three volumes, translated by Tu Xi and revised, corrected, and annotated by Zhao Zhenjiang and José Antonio García Sánchez, was published in Peking and Granada, Spain.¹⁹

Three years after Tu Xi’s translation appeared, that is, in 1991, a second complete Spanish translation by Mirko Láuer, entitled *Sueño de las mansiones rojas* ‘*Dream of the Red Mansions*’ in three volumes was published by the Foreign Languages Press in Peking.²⁰ With two complete versions of the *Hong lou meng*, Spain had now excelled both the French- and the German-speaking world in respect of complete translations of the classic.

In 2006, a complete German translation of the novel, in three volumes, by Rainer Schwarz and Martin Woesler 吳漢汀, entitled *Der Traum der Roten Kammer oder die Geschichte vom Stein* ‘*The Dream of the Red*

Neither of these two critical editions seems to us entirely satisfactory. That is why we have been obliged, in our translation, to establish our own text by ourselves, choosing from the various editions and from the facsimiles of the manuscripts in our possession the readings which have seemed to us to be the best.] (My translation).

¹⁹ Tu Xi, trans., *Sueño en el Pabellón Rojo (Memorias de una roca)*, by Cao Xueqin, 2nd ed., edición revisada y anotada por Zhao Zhenjiang y José Antonio García Sánchez, Edición de la Universidad de Granada ‘University of Granada Edition’ and Ediciones en Lenguas Extranjera de Pekin ‘Beijing Foreign Languages Editions’ (Granada, Spain: Servicio de Publicaciones de la Universidad de Granada ‘Publication Service of the University of Granada,’ 1988). This translation is based on the Cao Xueqin-Gao E edition of the *Hong lou meng*. In other words, the original must be one of Cheng Weiyan’s editions (the 1791 or 1792 edition). The illustrations in the translation are by Liu Danzhai 劉旦宅. On the copyright page, the date of publication is 1988, though it is not clear whether this date refers to the first or the second edition.

²⁰ Mirko Láuer, trans., *Sueño de las mansiones rojas*, by Cao Xueqin, versión castellana, 4 vols. (Peking: Ediciones en Lenguas Extranjeras ‘Foreign Languages Press,’ 1991). The translation is based on the Cao Xueqin-Gao E edition. The illustrations are by Liu Danzhai. As there is no unambiguous information about the date of publication of the first edition of Tu Xi’s translation, more than three years may have elapsed before Mirko Láuer’s Spanish translation appeared.