

“Attached Files”

“Attached Files”

*Anthropological Essays on Body,
Psyche, Attachment and
Spirituality*

By

Imre Lázár

Cambridge
Scholars
Publishing



“Attached Files”:

Anthropological Essays on Body, Psyche, Attachment and Spirituality

By Imre Lázár

This book first published 2015

Cambridge Scholars Publishing

Lady Stephenson Library, Newcastle upon Tyne, NE6 2PA, UK

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Copyright © 2015 by Imre Lázár

All rights for this book reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the copyright owner.

ISBN (10): 1-4438-7223-7

ISBN (13): 978-1-4438-7223-2

CONTENTS

Foreword	vii
Invitation	xii
Micro-cosmologies: Bodies in Plural	
Chapter One.....	2
Body under Construction	
Chapter Two	20
Body Reinvented: Radical Eclecticism of Unconventional Medicine	
Chapter Three	40
The Reified Body: Initiation and Death in Becoming a Doctor Imre Lázár and Zoltán Zsinkó-Szabó	
Chapter Four.....	55
Dance as Drug, Dance as Medicine	
Chapter Five	79
Beyond the Body and Soul and their Metanarratives	
At the Cradle of the Love: Attachment, Soul and Body	
Chapter Six.....	94
Pregnancy: Risks and Rituals	
Chapter Seven.....	110
Birth and Attachment: Reproduction of the Person and the Culture	
Chapter Eight.....	135
Theories of Attachment and Personality Development	
Chapter Nine.....	149
A to A, C to C	

Chapter Ten	173
Adult Attachment and the Marital Crisis	
Chapter Eleven	196
Attachment, Spirituality and Health	
The Synergic Macrocosm and its Inherent Violence	
Chapter Twelve	218
The Divine Comedy and the Tragedy of Man	
Chapter Thirteen	244
Nature Reanimated	
Chapter Fourteen	260
Niche Construction and Human Ecoscape	
Chapter Fifteen	273
Economies of ARES and EROS	

FOREWORD

“*Attached Files*”: what a talking title! It may serve as a reliable compass in our efforts to appreciate this collection of a dozen meticulously selected, masterfully intertwined essays. They are the kinds of concise but highly informative *executive reports* on the particulars of Imre Lázár’s impressive interdisciplinary oeuvre. As a deserved reward of attentive, open minded, contemplative reading these examples of cultural anthropology’s *thick descriptions* (“monologues on dialogues”) a Gestalt on the author’s important messages concerning human conditions and human nature will unfold.

Imre Lázár’s ambitiously intent (borrowing Wilfrid Sellars’ observation) is “*to understand how things in the broadest possible sense of the term hang together in the broadest possible sense of the term*”. Being eager to find and show *the strengths of weak connections*, his text is characterised by quadrophony of different anthropological terms masterfully avoiding, however, the lingering danger of cacophony... Imre is well aware of Frigyes Karinthy’s sharp observation: “grabbing any part of a chain, you hold the whole chain”.

The twin phenomena of *attachment* and *neglect* are lifelong processes *from* the newborn/caretaker dyad of maternity ward *to* global processes sharing a pair of characteristics. They are *mutual*, social in character as well as *developmental*, i.e. process-like in their nature. Consequently, just like attachment/bonding, *neglect should never be neglected*. The widespread presence of serious, often devastating side effects of humankind’s increasing spiritual negligence over environmental problems (in Imre’s usage: *lack of “nature centred /green’/ theology”*) support the timeliness of that *bon mot*. Due to unintentional side effects of decontextualized social life, “the recent *economic development* might be considered as a *human ecological drama*”. Imre Lázár’s warning should be taken seriously: “It is really time to acknowledge, that ecological niches are parts and parcels the constructs of the organisms occupying them” through a process called *mutual niche construction*. The mother/infant dyad (being - literally - the *cradle of lifelong attachment processes*) is a prime example of developmental niches *in statu nascendi*. We also learn from well selected examples how deeply cultural activities affect the evolutionary process by modifying selection pressure. They *co-direct* the population’s

genetic evolution. We are also reminded to the highly emotional debate on *parity*, a view placing a gene into a set of equally indispensable extra genetic, “contextual” sources of development, ranging from *methylation* processes through *interpersonal bonding* to *social support*, just to name a few critical events.

Imre Lázár is referring to Kropotkin when pinpointing to “*mutual aid*” as a hitherto rather neglected moving force of evolution. This idea is to be emulated into Susan Oyama’s *developmental systems theory* in general with the above mentioned *mutual developmental niche construction*, in particular. It’ll help us to avoid the trap of *nature/nurture* fallacies.

Evaluating (and ranking) research findings recently became a stormy corner characterized by sharp quarrels, investing considerably more efforts *to convince* the others than *understand* the problem itself. One should realize, that valuable results of substantial impact must be evaluated. However, instead by the publishing periodicals’ IF, *by the number a meaningful new questions, they instigated...* Imre Lázár’s *MEO (Man/kind/ - Environment - Organization) model* rightfully placed by the author “instead of a summary”.

Attached Files avoids throughout the seducing trap of either/or view. Imre Lázár’s *multi-voice anthropology*, emphasizing instead the force of chaining, instigating his efforts to map human issues into a *four-vector space enriched with a transcendental fifth dimension - surrounding*, in the widest possible meaning.

Siding with those greeting the cultural phenomenon called by Chris Partridge *re-enchantment*, i.e. redoing what Max Weber called the *disenchanting character of* our world, aggravated by the *destructive decontextualizing, Prokrustes bed effects of modernity* at virtually all aspects of life and culture, Imre tends to look at *our body* as a permanently *re-conceived* and *re-constructed* (human) entity. He addresses this phenomenon of *the historical polisemy of human body*, being responsible for the heavy semantic loading of the term. One can glimpse into the complexity of this issue by reading his formal definition of our body as a “*polisemic and synchratic object of healing in the world of medical pluralism*”. His treating the *human psychosomatic ontology* is also of considerable interest to read.

Studying the temporal trajectories of the “‘big’ problems”, i.e the ways once meaningful questions turn meaningless, reveals several *slippery slopes* connecting senses to nonsenses. We still feel: question marks remain there, ready to resurface at other times and other places just like underground waters. Sometimes effective coping is to “*Abandon the name, but honour the same*”.

Mothering attachment, with special reference to “the meeting eyes of love” serves as a basic source of the blueprint of later *uniquely socialised personality*, the infant is heading for and will become. Referring to the later *social womb* and the *attachment ring* around the developing individuals, and showing his unique, generative creativity, the Author suggests that each person might be considered as a *palimpsest*, or *textual bricolage*. What a marvellous idea!

I was genuinely pleased when asked in an email with *attached file* of impressive size, from my old-time colleague and friend, Imre Lázár. His flattening request was to write a short introductory note - a kind of additional attached file...

Having myself a long-standing interest in understanding the developmental history of human attachment (with special reference to the early postpartum period /the first 6 to 8 weeks of life/) recently recognized as a potential source of our inborn sociality (or sociability, should you prefer so), as well as of socialised individuality, further, knowing the Author, as a *kindred spirit* for over three decades, I had good reasons to expect a peak experience when reading the manuscript. I was in no way disappointed.

His impressive creativity reflected in brilliant data handling when faced with the paralyzing richness of relevant studies, starting with meticulous “data mining” instigated and guided by his - sometimes slightly over-inclusive - multi- focused attention. Each Attached file is a *thick description* the meeting of an exceptionally creative mind with a task of appropriate complexity, instigating meticulously elaborated research aims and eminently executed studies. The consecutive periods of Imre Lázár’s longstanding activity on different (sub)fields are invariably dealing with *hard rows to plough*... As a logical consequence, anyone interested in attachment issues (should you feel to be an exception, please, listen more attentively to your heart...) will find this volume *a rich vein to mine*.

Sometimes one muses: how science proceeds in general and behavioural sciences in particular. We seem to have two options: either along well formed questions *or* through the historic chain of eminently reported results. While the answers - like always - must be partly credited to those, forming the proper questions, history of science shows that - as a kind of Hegelian “Aufhebung” mechanism - the most promising questions are always shaped by the results of previous activities in other labs, by other researchers, at other times. Just consider the case of 2014 Nobel Prize in Medicine. John O’Keefe’s ground breaking vintage recognition of *hippocampal place cells* from the early 70-ies in his London lab instigated

two of his young former Norwegian post-doc students, later colleagues of him to extend these efforts in Trondheim resulting in finding the *entorhinal "grid cells"*, nearly two scores of years later. By this the whole Gestalt (so far...) of the "*GPS in the brain*" became visible. Meanwhile, of course, an eminent scientific school - with impressive pedigree including Donald Hebb, Donald Melzack, Patrick Wall, Abe Black - further developed. So, a feasible answer to the above question might be: science proceeds through what Karl Popper calls in his intellectual autobiography *unended quest*, consisting of question/answer/new questions chain of activities. To get a sharper picture, Gertrud Stein's Last Words might be added here as a kind of gentle, supportive warning: "*the primary aim of your inquire shapes your questions, determining thereby the answers you'll get*".

By the way, talking about places: recently the *cultural flux* (as both cause and consequence of the globalization of culture) - elicited a *rebound effect*. "The quest of regional identity and regional culture has re-emerged in the field of academia and social inquires" as observed by Lez Cooke in his *The sense of place* monograph. While that particular book deals with the emergence of Regional British television drama, its message is interdisciplinary. Notably, each academic research programme, not unlike social inquires, is having *both global and "regional"* elements. The need of a clear stereo view through *semi-thick sections* (to borrow an analogy from histology lab) are visible nowadays. Imre Lázár's amazingly vivid, nearly picture-like palimpsest reminded me to Cooke's message on *the renaissance of the sense of place* in our globalized world.

Talents irreplaceable components are self-regulation and capacity to find appropriate tasks, matching one's potentials. This was called by László Németh - a 20th century Hungarian writer, himself an MD and polymath - of the efforts "*to find appropriate sky for one's wings*." These time- and energy-consuming assignments were eminently fulfilled by Imre Lázár, a brilliantly talented post-renaissance thinker. Anyone interested in attachment issues (should you feel to be an exception, listen please more attentively to your heart...) will find this volume *a rich vein to mine*. You might feel the task to follow the highly complex logic of this masterpiece highly challenging, but half of the task whenever you study a book, remains inescapably to you...

Those who tend to easily find simple answers to questions of this complexity, most probably just failed to fully comprehend the problem, with special reference to its rainbow - like intertwined nature. In his *tetrahedron model* Imre Lázár considers the intertwined relations with special reference to their *nature/sociality/technology/idea* components.

Glimpsed from different angles you'll get, however, differential mindscapes of our inner “worlds”. One should always “mind the gaps”. I consider the correlation of *attachment styles* and *personality patterns*, revealed by Imre and his associates is a finding of special importance. Referring to and based on “the long term influence of *internal working model* shaped by *attachment organizations*”, they uncovered a *developmental link* between A and C type *secondary attachment organizations* as well as A and C type *behavioural patterns*, respectively. **A to A and C to C** as suggested by the chapter title. According to my humble judgment, supporting a convincing logical theory, their finding is earmarked to have a substantial impact by instigating further fine grained data mining, meta-analyses and new-data generation. As we cited above: science is an *unended quest*.

What is the uniqueness, the *difference - producing difference* in Imre Lázár's approach? The answer is coming from an unexpected corner. When asked to define the essence of jazz, Louis Armstrong answered: “*If you got to ask, you ain't ever gonna get to know*”. A careful, contemplating reading of Attached Files you'll surely get from Professor Imre Lázár - at least temporary - answers. Do not forget, however, *half of the work remains the responsibility of the readers*, who - in exchange - could *claim and get half of the rewards*. The enfolding map of the field will be a *shared achievement* of the Author and the individual readers. To get to it you cannot save you from an uphill fight - no one can promise you a rose garden -, but the result will be appropriately rewarding.

The following *summary in nutshell* might help you to start:

Truly valuable books share a characteristic whereby the reader is tasked with half of the work. Imre Lázár's book will enlighten and challenge in equal measure. Its central tenet is attachment, offering multi-faceted explorations of human relationships based on cultural history, philosophy, literature and biomedical sciences. The book aims to facilitate our re-enchantment with each other, a very timely antidote in today's alarmingly isolationist world.

A must read for all “*helping professionals*” in the widest possible meaning of the term: Imre Lázár's work provides particularly valuable insights into the understanding of the riddle of body - mind interactions. Readers from all fields will gain new appreciations of the Shakespearean question “*What a piece of work is Man?*”

Lectori salutem!

Debrecen, November 2014.

Péter Molnár, MD, PhD,
Professor Emeritus

INVITATION

Allow me to invite the reader to follow the author on his journey, searching for a metaphor in the past twenty years. These papers, lectures, and Studies have been organized around one issue, the possibilities and impossibilities of relatedness.

I am searching for the Archimedean points and organizing frameworks, key elements and automatic logics which help to build up this cosmological frame. This trip includes papers and lectures of the past twenty years covered by the scientific jargon of behavioural sciences, medical anthropology and human ecology. There are various settings: Budapest, London, Florence, Tarragona, Copenhagen, Perugia, Bergen, Visegrád, Novi Sad, but the occasions are discrete elements of a chain, ordering themselves in the syntax of a long sentence about attachment and relatedness.

This long sentence has another personal meaning of homage and gratitude to Professor Peter Molnár with whom I started the long trip to establish medical anthropology in Hungary 33 years ago. His professional work - with other founders like Maria Kopp, Béla Buda - was one of the most influential in introducing Behavioural Sciences to Hungary. This master-novice relationship or attachment was “organized” around the subject of “attachment organization” in the early eighties and since then he and his colleagues have exerted a profound impact on issues of health psychology, in the widest sense; from everyday obstetrics with the introduction of rooming in and early child care practice to the public health aspects of nursery and pedagogical psychology.

My title *Attached Files* signifies simple things, shorter or longer messages, some files, pictures or music added to e-mails, a virtual presence of something woven into a pattern of bits, patterns of yes and no. Children of our age are engaged deeply in their “Facebook” cosmos by permanent agency, by sending and receiving. It has become part of their physiology, like breathing.

However, “attached files” also refers to a “file” as mythos-logos, knowledge of the phylum of tradition and adherence to this phylum. The word “file” is connected – at least etymologically – to phylogenesis, bringing back evolutionary wisdom into the anthropological scope. Phylum, mythos, attachment – they are all parts of the meaningful web of

relatedness. The task is not less than to uncover the hidden graphs in every unknown field. Phylum sounds like philia, and in this way one may find a common linguistic niche for relatedness, attachment, love, genealogy, mythos, human relationships, traditions, cultural worlds and patterns. Understanding is to find the causal link, the phylum between the significant elements, the statistical approach deals with route analysis, and the culture organizes patterns of files as cosmos instead of chaos. Culture is woven from files of communication, just like institutions emerge from networks of discourses. The human “physical” ontology is attached to structural wisdom of evolutionary organized networks of organic carbon files, and files of DNA transfer this wisdom through time and generations. The transfer managed through a phenomenological secret, the state of love.

We find files and attachment, attachments and philia again. I am looking at the Human being as (being) attached to culture, nature, technology, and attached to one another at the same time, and beyond these always attached to the origin, the almighty Surrounding, the Fifth. These remain key questions for the anthropologists in particular settings and with general relevance.

That is why I chose *attachment* as the “suchen Motiv” of this cognitive trip, a term for a more general, cosmic category, known as love, and the framework of M-E-O, -the tetrahedron model to make visible the otherwise chaotic nature of human co-ontology, universal relatedness.

The mythic consciousness – as other kinds of art helps us to replace the chaos of surrounding reality with pictures, narratives and cosmologies to gain a whole picture instead of fragments. Science with its paradigms offers the same semiotic-semantic magic via its mathematized, diagrammatical icons. The Wheel of Life may be such a mythical representation, an oriental image to the world of reverberating cycles of birth and death, fight and symbiosis woven into the arrhythmic dynamism of the Yin and Yang, light and shadow, periodicity and linearity, following the dualistic nature of the Human Being. Anthropologies of the Human Being are holistic upon their aim, but nevertheless usually turn out to be one-sided under the constraints of their immanent features derived from the background anthropological ideas, frameworks, professional registers and special fields. Evolutionary or neoevolutionary anthropologies (with their Naturalism) are in conflict with culturalist approaches, particularist, interpretive “semantics”, and one can soon reveal the difference between structural and biopsychological functionalism. Is there a common perspective for all, and if we try to create one, would this bricolage work at all? How can we apply a metatheory or rather a meta-representation to

create a quadrophony of different anthropological tunes? In this collection of divergent papers of the past twenty years, I tried to find such a multidimensional framework of interrelatedness to bring different discourses on a common ground of ecodynamic influences. This model helps the reader to square the circle to create a “tetrahedronic sphere” of basic ecological interrelations of Nature, Society, Technology and Ideas. This eco-logical display helps us to give a dynamic representation of "interconnectedness of all things". The above model gives a common anthropological framework of Naturalistic approaches of neo-evolutionary anthropological discourses, environmental and ecological anthropology, cultural materialism, human ethology with particularist and critical interpretive discourses, culturalist and postmodern anthropologies (Lázár, 2001). This “big picture” --including all sorts of human environmental relationships and *attachments* with key theoretical importance in this book--transcends the “nature - nurture” dilemma, a one-sided division of natural and social-cultural environment, weaving an eco-logic hermeneutic context of natural, social, technological and knowledge environments. This "squaring" of the sphere is not an art for art's sake. It helps to map human issues in a vectorial space of the four dimensions, where any phenomenon of cultural anthropological interest can be understood as natural, social, technological, knowledge and epistemological context at the same time. On the other hand, these human objects of inquiry, surrounded by coexisting factors are to be understood in a frame of co-ontology which calls for “multi-voice” anthropology. Is there a place in this model for the spiritual understanding of the world?

Another key issue of this book is, whether we can re-spherize this four-dimensional event-space with the transcendental Fifth dimension, to a *total* environmental sphere around the other Four, or not. This Fifth dimension - one might call the Lord, the Creator, the Transcendence, which may also be an object of attachment, or the ecodynamic other with which to be in symbiosis or to which to submit oneself.

Human ontology cannot neglect genetics and memetics; Nature, Society, Technology and the World of Knowledge frequently tend to favour one dimension with less emphasis on the others. Sociobiology and evolution have different ontological emphases, theological anthropology has another one, and understanding Homo Faber calls for a different ontology with additional stress on technology and environment of artefacts. Ecologizing the metaphysical frame of human ontology may be challenging, but the adoption of the supernatural as an independent environmental dimension may be part of Naisbitt's Megatrends, the spiritual Renaissance and religious revival or the cultural phenomenon

called "re-enchantment" by Chris Partridge. The postmodern turn of the end of millennia caused radical shifts in this tetrahedron human milieu. The high-tech revolution extended or almost totalized the power of technology over Human life and Nature itself with an extreme potential for destruction; transforming the social environment into a Risk Society as Ulrich Beck named it. This shift has transformed the world of Knowledge. The impact of information technology development and democratization (internet, WEB2, new social media), the postmodern turn of the knowledge sphere (Kuhn's scientific paradigm theory, postmodern epistemology, Feyerabend's relativism, critical cultural studies of science and technology), pluralization of cosmologies (decline of metanarratives, pluralization of the clinical realities, counterculture, subcultures) together signify the scale of change.

On the other hand, this shift of technological environment exerted a deep impact on the social world too. According to Hornborg, modernity decontextualized all aspects of life, culture and traditional societies. Decontextualization of human relationships, knowledge and identity production, the reification and fetishism of the individual ego can be grouped together. With the economic and scientific colonization of the human body, Nature created a strong, solid foundation for oppression and exploitation (Hornborg, 1996).

The human body is in the focus of the *tetrahedron model* with a spherical-spiritual metaenvironment. It creates a field of experience and behaves as an engaged actor of an environmental agency. The *first part* of this book deals with the human body as a permanently re-conceived and re-constructed human entity. The body as field of natural and supernatural experience; a tool and object of healing depending on different cosmologies opens our multidimensional and unified perception offered by our tetrahedron model. Chapter one, including a theoretical vision of the historical polysemy of the human body is followed by the description of the body as a polysemic or syncretic object of healing in the world of medical pluralism. The third chapter helps to understand how facing and dissecting the dead body as biomedical initiation ritual generates a pure, reified, objective and reductionist frame for the body to be understood in its deprived somatic reality.

The living body may emerge into the cultural and the social sphere via techniques of the body such as dance. Dance helps attach the body to culture and gender, or helps to transcend. Dance as a phenomenon is immersed into the intimate net of natural, social, technological and the infosphere. Dance as a medium of communication of a given, local culture, and as technology together may exert a deep natural, psycho-

physiological and somatic impact. This “tetrahedronic” understanding of the dancing body as an engaged agent of healing redirects our attention towards the human being with his or her environmental ontology. With a shift from the body to the psyche and soul implying psycho-soma and the culture around it, we try to explore the conflicts and convergences of two understanding sciences, two typical Twentieth-Century “hermeneutics” in the next chapter. The claim for universality emerges from the psychoanalytic “biology of the soul” and confronts with the relativist particularism of cultural understandings and with the “petit recits” of postmodernism’s common phobic attitude toward generalizing metanarratives. The analytic structuralist fantasy, the empathic-emic attention and the enigmatic transference are common in the case of the psychoanalyst and the anthropologist field worker, but the ‘habitus’ dealing with the *Dogma* is different. The last wing of modernity confronts with the forerunner of the postmodern reflections beyond the body and soul in *attached* metanarratives.

The second part of this book deals with birth, mothering and attachment as the basic source for a social personality blueprint. This internal working model determines the ability to love and be loved, to be created and protected by a social womb - the attachment ring. The first chapter of this part deals with pregnancy and childbirth as a cultural institution, while the next chapter examines the closed and mutual interrelationship between culture and child rearing; paying particular attention to the psychological and cultural consequences. Uncovering the conceptual background of attachment theory, we try to deconstruct the ideological dynamics of conflicts between psychoanalysis and Bowlby’s theory inspired by ethology. We extend our attention to its reception and relationship with other developmental approaches rooted in early mother-child relationships.

The next chapter deals with the developmental logic and controversies of A and C type personality theories and their unquestionable psychobiological significance borrowing the language and the results of behavioural sciences. Mapping the multidimensional and multi-environmental sequence of transcription of love as symbiotic, synergistic; affiliate relations from the biological and psychological level up to the economic and spiritual spheres, we can trace the consequences and concomitants of the deficits, gaps and distortions too. The psychobiological risks and psychosocial distortions, relational crises and social anomie rooting in failure of “philia” are to be analyzed in the next chapters with particular regards to the healing potential of spiritual attachment and religious dispositions. The fresh results and challenging

data of our behavioural epidemiological survey, Hungarostudy 2013, help us to examine the issue of attachment in the context of contemporary marital crises and the health protective aspects of spiritual attachment in the ongoing process of secularization in Hungary.

In the third part of the book I deal with the ethical consequences of deficits in affiliative attunements, love and *philia* at the level of environmental perceptions and adaptive behaviour in human ecological context with particular regards to human economic activity. Inviting Dante and Madách into our discussion, we may reveal the cosmic significance of the Divine and Earthly love as a moral imperative and ontological logic; and the same way we confront the limits of the intellectual and rational approach in our environmental, economical and ethical manners and conduct. The palimpsest-like textual bricolage of Dante's *Comedy* and *The Tragedy of Man* by Madách reveals their prophetic understanding of human fate under the guidance of eternal love versus Luciferian scepticism and intellect.

Disenchantment, despiritualization and submission of Nature led to a secularized, rational and bureaucratic attitude towards human environments as *ecological partners*, but the so-called re-enchantment creates a chance for a wider and deeper attunement towards the re-spiritualized environment, a reanimated Nature by a re-enchanted relatedness, via spiritual attachment.

The human being is embedded in its environments and shares them. Nature, social systems, technological dimensions, the noosphere and transcendental environment all generate a plural, but a common framework of hermeneutics. Even a focal, psychological understanding of human beings cannot be restrained into a purely analytical, experimental frame of reference. András Angyal offered his synergistic scope, referring to the person and its environment, "*as aspects of a single reality which can be separated only by abstraction*". Angyal's terms may be picked up by our anthropological efforts to find the keys to reattachment. In this way also Roy Rappaport wove the warp and woof of the ritual and the natural, the technical and the cognitive into one big picture of his theoretical tapestries of ecological anthropology.

Angyal sees the human being as a detached actor in his world and he is expressed by the term *autonomy* with the content of self-determination, an egoistic pole of the biosphere representing the tendency of mastering the environment, with a self-perception of separateness. Angyal also makes us remember that there is another relatively 'selfless', and *attached* status of *environmentality*, he calls *homonomy*, with the tendency to fit oneself to the environment by willingly subordinating oneself to something that one perceives as bigger than the individual self.

The concept of multidimensional reattachment to the natural, social, and spiritual environments and their elements, motivates us to investigate the consequences of disembeddedness in a Giddensian sense, where modernity includes mechanisms, which lifted out social activity from localised contexts, reorganizing social relations across large time-space distances leading to behavioural and psychological norms of detachment. It is even a challenging issue that disembedding mechanisms depend upon trust which is a crucial element of the phenomenology of *philia* as we uncover it in chapter eleven, dealing with attachment and the core values of the Christian faith. Money itself may generate a basic symbol, or according to Mary Douglas, the ritual element of trust, it might gain a deconstructive potential with the disembedding substitution of human attachment towards the local social and natural environments.

In the last two chapters, I try to map these (co)evolutionary routes. The analysis of human ecosystems from this point helps us to widen the scope of a spiritual approach in business and the economy in the context of love and attachment. Sustainable environmental cooperation of environmental actors--Nature, Sociosphere, Technology and Ideosphere (or using the term of Vernadski and Chardin: 'the Noosphere)--in our tetrahedron model, needs a symbiotic, synergistic turn and optimization of the peculiar dynamics of each environment. This process is supported by the achievements of ecological economics and environmental philosophy, ethics and law and the ecological visions of an extended and renewed social contract idea. In this process, our detached hero of late modernity, the "*egocitizen*" must evolve into a loving and compassionate "*ecocitizen*" (Rosnay, 2000).

The final chapters try to reconsider the role of attachment and love, mutualism and cooperation in the evolutionary frame of the human being and rethink its social-economical adaptive strategies, creating the binary opposition of metaphoric paradigms: ARES and EROS in the hope of a sustainable future.

**MICRO-COSMOLOGIES:
BODIES IN PLURAL**

CHAPTER ONE

BODY UNDER CONSTRUCTION

To Ronald Frankenberg

The socially constructed human body is always being processed due to the changing society, which superimposes its meanings and metaphors, hence shaping and regulating based on common values, and moral contents. Our bodies are reproduced by sexuality through chain of generations. This sexuality consists of gender, games and rite. Preferences of mating are coded and reproduced culturally; prohibiting incest and taking religious, ethnical, economical or sometimes diplomatic constraints into consideration when choosing a mate. The history is determined by the choice of the woman to receive the man in her bed - as Ortega Y Gasset writes. As Turner points at, human beings are part of Nature, and the concept of Nature is also a product of culture (Turner, 1984). As every society tries to control the human body through its own belief system, standards of health norms, ideologies, religious values and by its instrumentation, and institutional ways, the body is part of the social process, and its biological features reflect this too. The body is a hot field of the game played by memes and genes (Dawkins, 1982).

There is a double statement in the title about the endless process, and the impossibility of completing. As the body is an open homeostatic system with dynamic equilibrium, its working mode is a continuous and permanent struggle against entropy. The same is true for the body from the point of view of social science. The body bears signs and features, and types of habits of its historical time and place. The process how these 'forms of embodiment', or - using the term of Marcell Mauss (1973) - these 'techniques of the body' are changing with ideology, class structure, technology and mode of living and are hence re-forming the body (Mellor and Shilling, 1997). One finds the body continually in the process, as a subject of shifts in various dimensions of embodiment. Although these re-formations seem to be gradual, they have their time and space coordinates.

The body was the object of ontological anxiety from the beginning. Burials, as first proofs of the religious cosmology reflected double; terrestrial and celestial assignments of the human body with the basic anthropological dilemma, paraphrasing Teilhard de Chardin: Who are we:

human beings having a spiritual experience; or spiritual beings having a human experience? The human body is one the most important grounds for miracles, as in the case of levitation, stigmata, locution and glossolalia or other miracles. Even the dead body may be a permanent celestial surface for strengthening the faith of believers like in the case of incorruptible bodies of the Saints. Nevertheless, these facts can be excluded for the horizon of the majority who create secularist and materialist limitations to understand, use and enjoy their own body. Anyhow, the spiritual experiences are strongly attached to the body as the cultural phenomenological paradigm of embodiment helps to understand charismatic, mystical and other “supernatural” experiences (Csordas, 1999). Body as a bridge between Heaven and Earth means a source of attachment, a field of resistance, a pool of temptations and the chance for sacrifice at the same time. The body and its parts may be offered as food for the divine as the Aztec gods were thought to be hungry for human hearts, just as the victims of agricultural cults for the sake of the fertility of the land. However, one may, as Michael Harner (1997) and Harris (1997) did explain the whole “*Aztec cannibalism complex*” based on naturalistic considerations, including the one sided agricultural adaptation, repeated starvation due to the maize monoculture. Even the bloodthirsty pantheon of the Aztec gods and the terrifying rituals were explained by the low serotonin levels of the human brain as a result of a low rate of tryptophan availability, known as a form of strong protein hunger. The cultural materialist anthropology of Marvin Harris gives a panorama view of the *bodily*-explained culture. On the other hand, the mystical content of the human body reflects a sort of social inferiority on the flesh, and the ritualism, denial and biophobia inbuilt in human culture, as described by Williams in his convincing fieldwork among worshippers of Zion, a Black Pentecostal Church in Pittsburgh (Williams, 1996).

Mellor and Schilling discriminate three forms of Western-European embodiment, or re-formation of an ideal-type, the ‘mediaeval body’, the ‘Protestant modern body’ and the ‘baroque modern body’. In the medieval sacred Praxis of Catholicism, there is a special way of gaining carnal knowledge through bodily regimes. These included fasting and flagellating, which were aggressive ways to turn the bodily experience towards a religious one; practiced rather by monks and ascetics. *Fasting* may occur as a protest in a pathological and political sense, as well. The anorexia nervosa, or denial of eating as a form of strike and protest in prisons, shows the social content of fasting while this social-political content may be mixed with spiritual elements, like in the case of Gandhi. However, fasting may be a pure pathological issue in anorexia nervosa and

a tool of healing because fasting may enhance of apoptosis of atypical cells, or diminish obesity. In this way the sacredness of the spiritual body regime turns to be secular.

The medieval Carnivals (carnet- flesh) *reincarnating* the Dionysian context offered release from the disciplined state of the body. It was a channelled protuberance of sinful instincts like sexuality and abusive eating, consumption. The 'protestant modern body' of Mellor and Shilling is subordinated to the control of the mind. The anxiety of Pietism over the bodily self is sometimes extreme, and this extremism survived in censuring, and eradicating the *mammilla* in the movies played on television in some states of US in an age when media experts use a term *titi*-tainment. This body-view is a remnant of the original perspective on the 'protestant modern body'. The wish to behave 'self-disciplined' and hence to control the body is not extinct in the contemporary view of body consciousness. Analysing the health behaviours Crawford proves that the not releasing but self-disciplined 'neo-ascetism of fitness praxis may have protestant roots (Crawford, 1984). But in this re-forming of the body we find the secularization of religious anxiety, the shift from sacral to healthy, from the soul to the pure physiological. The 'baroque modern bodies' as corpses escaped from the sensual closeness. They are no longer merely 'disciplined, cognitively focused bodies' (Mellor and Shilling, 1997). The baroque and the modern together mean a parallel importance of the senses and the cognition. In the baroque response to Protestantism the sensuousness was subordinated to the sacral contents. Now this sensuous liberation of (usually naked female) body serves the interest of consumerism expressing a far-secularist cult of materialist worldview in the media ritualism understood in a Neo-Durkheimian framework. Following the logic of Mellor and Shilling we should carry on the list of re-forming the body by mentioning other instances like 'the totalitarian body of totalitarian states' and 'the narcissistic consumerist body' in the sense of Christopher Lasch, and Robert Crawford. The counter-deterministic cyborg socialist-feminist body visions of Haraway (1991), or the Islam fundamentalist submissive regulation of the female body, in the context of the social body depicted by Moore (1988), have their place in the line too. Queer studies opened a wider perspective on alternative corporealities. Bodies have become immersed into a paroxysmal trans-creative cultural space with diverse and perverse recreated bodily identities, multiple genders, or bodies absorbed into subcultural imaginations projected into techno, transhumanist, gothic or Steampunk dystopias. Step by step the body became a notebook of visions, political protest and emancipation movements far beyond the previously

imaginable frontiers. This creative space of embodied movements is populated by multiple bodies in all senses, because the body has become the vehicle of embodied sense of liberty and infinite potential.

The Body colonized

The body, which once used to be a subject of human biology and physical anthropology, became a conquered field of social sciences; opened up to sociology, queer studies, cultural anthropology, politology and history and critical sciences. This criticism deconstructed its perennial primordiality, its “*ding an sich*” nature. Grosz (1994) and Butler (2005) have taught us to see the body- at least in terms of gender, race and (dis)ability - as a product of discourses anchoring the body, filled with social and political meaning, to the battlefield of politics of language. Skeggs (1997) found the body itself a battlefield where discourses of class, gender and age are confronted and embodied becoming a ground of social praxis. Like Japanese body-books, the human body has been filled with texts. The body as a new continent for renewed interest is also an object of neo-colonization by media and marketing. As primordial and final reference of commodification-cosmos, it includes the frame of AIDA – attention, interest, desire and action. These are the bodily commandments of marketing, and the body like a coralreef absorbs and supports these virtualities and real acts of merchant intents. The body is also a coralreef of meanings, metaphors, patterns and values. If we explore it, we can submit the body in different frames of ideologies and technologies in order to transform and colonize it for the sake of profit. The media are central in this process from the beginning, as an electronic baby sitter, engraving the behavioural softwares and cultivating the psychophysiological corporeality. According to Festinger (1954) we shape ourselves following the blueprints of the screen. Gerbner (1994) draws a correlation between the expected body image and the impacts of the media reiterated by the framed and canonized social cognitions. The media shares something which is crucial in the politics of colonialization.

Foucault (1991) calls it “governmentality”, a compulsive-obsessive drive to control the object. It is primordially sacral as we described before, but the Enlightenment shifted this control into the secularized framework of Health as science, practice and industry. The materialist authorities, like biomedicine deprived body of its spiritual or pneumatic corporeality, via their hegemonic discourse. Governmentality implies the control of the body, the resources and conditions of subsistence, the customs, the thinking and praxis. Biomedicine as an almost almighty product of

modernity shared this governmentality and rendered the body: the reproduction, the birth and the death, the normal and the abnormal, the sin and the insane, the therapeutic choices, the terrenum of prevention and hermeneutics of the consequences under the power of medicalization. The phenomena beyond this control, like miracles and supernatural issues, outside of the validatable limits of Biostatistics have been disqualified.

The psychiatry and pharma industry have transformed shyness into sociophobia, melancholy into depression as well as: stage fright, loneliness, social isolation, grief and mourning into medicalized issues to be managed with psycho-pharmacoons. Medicine became a profit-making tool of social and economic control of the victims of the same social and economic system with an extended impact on deviant behaviours, unhealthy lifestyles, distorted forms of coping, addictions and passions. The winners were also submitted, as in the case of the 'beauty-industry', the mediated image conquered the mind, and the body: lips, breasts, face were submitted to the surgical knife or power of Botox. In the USA, there were 10 million cosmetic surgical interventions accomplished, and the rate of the Botox treatment has grown 23 times between 1997 and 2001.

We know that culture based mutilations and deformations of the body are not new at all. The Chinese customs of deformed legs, or the elongated neck Padaung women with their long brass coils, or the Mursi, Surma, Makunde and Botocudo people with their lip plates are striking examples, similar to that of the Western traditions, like the contemporary customs of piercing and tattooing the body.

Medical nosology may rewrite the "owner's" relationship with his "otherwise" colonized body. What was once aschesis, is now anorexia, hedonism is now called bulimia and the obsessive forms of physical training gained the term *exercise addiction* or *addiction of running*. Those who became preoccupied with their bodily perfection and controlling themselves with strict consumption of healthy food are diagnosed to have *Orthorexia nervosa*.

There is a growing tendency towards lack of male satisfaction with their body shape, by 1997 it has reached the 42% of the male population (Garner, 1997). Our knowledge of the body is constructed by classification frameworks, like biology and physiology produced by the culture, which create a permanent change in perceiving, and conceptualizing the body-in-process. These considerations and models are based on changing metaphors.

Symbolic bodies, postmodern corporealities of healing

The Western tradition establishes a gap between intentional mind and the instinctual body. As Ots (1990) describes: “*this dichotomy of psyche and soma implies the superiority of the intentional mind over the intentionless body*” alienating us from our submitted body. That is why symbolic anatomies of traditional healing heritage are so liberating, leading us to the embodiment of *terra incognita* of the body’s unfolded subtle reality. It is not an occult field with secret initiation rites; rather we may have access to culturally alternative bodies on the free-market of alternative medicine. One may choose an acupuncture body of meridians, and circulating *Qi* with the balance and unbalance of organs of Five Elements, and this body is alive while people consume the available healing practice of TCM (Traditional Chinese Medicine) widely. One might find the Ayurvedic body, or the body of the Tibetan medical tradition, or *Antroposophic body* with different, etheric, astral and mental layers of auras in this diverse class of healing. These new insights brought by the postmodern pluralization of body doctrines and metanarratives are founded on much older resources.

The four chakra system had been described in the eldest resource, the *Brahma-Upanishad*, which defines four places occupied by the Purusha (soul): the navel, heart, throat, and head which were identified by the divine presence of Brahma, Vishnu, Rudra and Akshara (Eliade, 1970).

A five-element chakra system had been presented in a later work, the *Yogatattva Upanishad*, where the “five parts” of the body correspond to the five great or cosmic elements - earth, water, fire, air, and space; linked to particular mantras and deities. The Tibetan Tantric Buddhism developed a rather different version of the chakra system with variations of four (navel, heart, throat, and head), five, seven, or even ten chakras or “channel wheels”.

The well-known seven chakra system is found in Shakta doctrine postulating seven chakras. These are called the Muladhara, the Swadhishtana as the chakra at the level of the genitals, the Manipura near to the plexus solaris, the Anahata at the heart, the Vishuddha at the throat, the Ajna chakra at the “third eye” while the Crown chakra at the top of the head.

The theosophical/anthroposophical version sees the chakras as energy/consciousness interfaces, which link subtle bodies by transferring the higher consciousness-energy to the lower somatic one. The chakras may be open or closed, blocked or clear, rotating clockwise or anti-clockwise causing difficulties of this transfer. According to some of the

dowsing healers and “extra sense” people in Hungary there is a growing number of people having twelve chakras already as a result of contemporary Spiritual Turn.

Following the “story” of the chakra-concepts we are tempted to draw a parallel with the development of musical systems based on three, then four sound systems or the pentatonic, the diatonic and the dodekaton systems, however there is also a similar logic to the step by step extended cosmologies based on the different number of implied celestial bodies.

Astrological medicine is based on a symbolic anatomy of astrological correspondences, a *micro*-cosmological system of analogies between the elements of the Zodiac signs and the human organs. The healing act is based on the sensation of given vibrations attached to the given Zodiac sign representing the organ in question. When the healer perceives the disturbance of the problematic resonance, beyond the somatic problems he may give psychosomatic or interpersonal advices and remedies correspondent with the patterns and contents connected to the given astrological sign. These alternative anatomies are not simply projections of the traditional beliefs, but embodied sensations of subtle changes and perceptions. Radiesthesia may help to re-embody the aura measurable by dowsing. Experiences in Prananadhi, Reiki or psychotronics also help to uncover the invisible, but sensible body of ours. There are some modernist attempts to comprehend these traditions in one integrative work, such a book is Gerber’s *Vibrational Medicine* (2001).

Even the biomedical body may be reconceptualised in post-modern ways whereby the “body mechanic” is substituted by chaotic or other models. Following the saga of exploration of the internal human world of the body; structure of the body – according to Foucault’s *The Birth of the Clinic* (Foucault, 1973), or Martensen’s article of historical perspectives on the *Architectonics of the Body* (Martensen, 1995) – we can see the changing contents of conceptual structuring of the body. We may realize, the traditional ‘*morphological*’ anatomic model can hardly deal with psychoneuroimmunological challenges. Creating an informational bridge between the wired neurological network and the diffuse immune cell society needs another metaphor offered by the cybernetics of neuropeptides and interleukins. Body of Vesalius versus the Cybernetic Body, mechologic versus ecologic of chaotic systems, hydraulic, thermodynamic, cybernetic, ecologic and micro social metaphors of the body prove “body metaphoric” recreated continuously.

The Unfinished Body

The other statement of the title also has more than one layer. The incompleteness induces us to search for synonyms. It brings the sense of imperfection into our mind, a state of lower rank, and body to work on, to develop, a raw material to work out, to make.

What a piece of work is man? Shakespeare asks. Incompleteness suggests a notion of making or evolving, progress and development. However, incompleteness may create the very basis of our sociality, too. The imperfection of the human body has greater importance in the ontology of Mankind than we could think upon first thought at the first glance. Our bodily imperfection, the shieldless surface of our skin, which does not protect us from heat and cold enough, the defenceless softness of the human body, show a very vulnerable creature. Perhaps this vulnerability induces a strong compensating drive that helps us to extend our body with artificial instruments, to create our technological body, a final metaphor of the mechanic-cybernetic order put on our own fearful chaos.

Lotka (1925) differentiates two kinds of human evolution, endosomatic and exosomatic. This exosomatic extension of human capacities by technological instruments is compensation for human biological inadequacies. As the wheel creates a continuous footstep on the road we wandering on, and the telescope brings the starry sky closer, so we extend our "*body instrumental*" continuously towards the untouchable horizon of perfection. The ancient drive to extend our body with our instruments creates the urge to establish the artificial Man as well, the Prague Rabbi's Golem, Kempelen's Chess-player automaton, Frankenstein, and Robocop and Donna Haraway's cyborgs, as well. We may extend this intellect beyond the human – as Gregory Stock did- to conceptualize the whole world with its world-wide-web artificial neurosystem of computers as a new Golem, as Metaman (Stock, 1993). This shieldless incompleteness makes the human being full of symbiotic drive. That is why, the human being weaves symbiotic connections with the cultivated nature in the Neolithic Revolution, these connections, are represented in the domestication, and the bionomics, the contemporary biotechnology. The bodies became symbiotic with abiotic machines and mechanical systems, houses, vehicles, organizations and ideas, concepts, theories and belief systems. The symbiotic man is the master of niche construction, a master to create mutualist strategies with Nature, Technology or the Infosphere. De Rosnay's vision about the Cybiont - a planetary intellect woven from billions of people attached together with infotechnology and high tech

cybernetics is something beyond the scope of the body, and far from the human soul or pneuma.

Sociality constructed by Incompleteness Premature nature of the human newborn

The size of the fetal human brain creates a spatial incongruence between the head and the birth-channel, which leads to a kind of functional premature birth. This establishes the extreme significance of the intimate, undisturbed mother-baby relationship called dual-union. This premature state, taken from a functional point of view, leads to the total dependence on the mother establishing this attachment as a cultural womb. In other words, the bodily incompleteness of a new-borne is an important source of high sensitivity to the social context. This vulnerable, early period of attachment imprints, and shapes the “internal working model” of sociality, which accompanies one’s adult behaviour towards the others according to Bowlby’s concept. This vulnerable early stage, including the birth as well, is considered to be a liminal state protected by a great deal of cultural prescriptions, technological protection and rites, too.

The bodily tensions – energized by culturally illegitimate sexual drives – create a strong controlling will to put an order on the dangerous and chaotic. Human bisexuality itself means a kind of incompleteness, the divided androgyny, and the two halves wishing to be one.

The bodily dependence on breastfeeding comes from our newborn immaturity (lack of teeth, immature absorption capacities, immunological incompetence), which creates constraints to the maternal sexual behaviour, too. The post-partum sexual taboos protect long-term breastfeeding with cultural inhibition of the conception.

The social construction of bodily imperfection

The conflict between the social body and the somatic body is the central issue of medical anthropology, and cultural anthropology in general. In the background of the illness-sanction model of tribal cultures, one can often find taboo breaking behaviour with instinctual drives and neglect of unwritten laws of the community. Among the Salteaux Indians, a prolonged occurrence of otherwise common symptoms may induce a type of panic behaviour, which leads the patient to ask the curative help of the Shaman (Hallowell, 1971). The rite of healing contains the public disclosure of violating and transgressing taboos, among which, one can frequently find sodomy, or breaking the incest rules. This means the

control of the body politic as well of psychosomatic body of the patient by the Shaman at the level of a small-scale society. The public confession strengthens the value of social rules in the audience and creates awareness of causal relation between sin and illness as a sanction. The healing process itself incorporates the restoring of the former state of the patient/transgressor.

The phenomenon of excommunication by a voodoo spell proves the reality of limited autonomy of the body and its incompleteness. The voodoo death is an example of the potential dominance of the body politic and the social body on body somatic. When social death precedes the biological death in time, social body also precedes the somatic body in importance, if one supposes causal relationship.

The inferiority of the body reflects the Ego interposed between the two environments, between the outer and the inner one. The body sensation based on proprioception creates a sensual framework of unity between the Self and its material vehicular, but this contract is extremely unstable because of pain, anxiety and other threatening signs, which are adaptive allies of the Self in the game with the challenging environment on one hand, but on the other they can, in some cases, emerge without explicit reason. The conflicts of the sexual instinct and the strict sexual regulation of the social body, and sometimes of body politics became the central issue of Freud's covert psychiatric anthropology, as well. The opposition of the Superego, the inbuilt agent of Body Social may suppress the Id, directing with its instinctual energy towards Somatic depth. It is not surprising that the liberation of sexual instincts based on Freud's theoretical framework became an important chapter in the process of secularization.

The imperfect body in sacral context

Although we deal with the Cartesian dualism mainly in the context of medical thinking now, the Mind-Body dualism has its sacral-religious roots, too. It was the trialism for a long while in most of the cultures. Ka, Ba and Va souls in Egypt, Ulem, Isa and Lil at the Ostiak people and Nefesh, Ruach, Hochma in the Hebrew Kabbalah. This primordial trialism of the human spiritual ontology was truncated in theological debates in the ninth century; the Fourth Synod in Constantinople in 870, when pneuma was cut off and the soul remained as the basis of dualism. The concept of conflict between Soul and Body is frequent but not universal theme of sacral-spiritual paradigms. Sexuality bears opposite meanings in the Tantra and the Christian tradition. The Taoist incorporates human sexuality while

the early Calvinists imposed serious penalty in the case of enjoyment sex at candlelight in Geneva. Such difference occurs between the Islamic and Hindu traditions, as well.

The Body has two faces in the early Christian thought too, on one side; it is the body, the temple of the soul and the flesh, which, -according to Nadia Tazi- is *“understood as an ontological leap into a mortal condition: the ‘becoming animal’ to which Origen applies the usual metaphors of the carnal body as a grave, a net or a weight bearing man down, chaining him to the process of corruption”* (Tazi 1989).

While Gnostics found the main source of sins in the Body, Origen considered the Soul to be the origin of sin. However, he freed the soul from its flesh-container and proposed the independent materiality of the soul. The Manichean heresies brought into Europe by Catars, Bogumils and Patharens denied the material and their sacral aim was to liberate the Light from the darkness of the material, the body - sometimes submitting the flesh by pornographic rituals. The Catholic and Protestant reformations of the body have been mentioned showing some lines of Mellor and Shilling’s theory. Some eating disorders like anorexia, or those forms of compulsive-obsessive dependence on “healthy foods” may have parallels compared to the sacred ways of disciplining a person like fasting and religious limitations guiding ritual and profane eating (Túry et al., 2013).

According to our opinion in the case of ‘cognitively oriented bodies’ there is a basic shift from transcendence-driven self-discipline towards an economic interest-driven, advertisement, and mass media modulated self-discipline. This preoccupation with dieting and fitness is not intimately tied to Christian attitudes to the care of the body (Mellor and Shilling, 1997) but reflects a total transcendental emptiness. The baroque corpus of Susanne and the senile voyeurs has totally different content and meaning comparing it with a Peep Show in Soho. These bodies are not the same, nor is the sensuousness of the bodies.

The Body Pneumatic – Attached to the Divine

Attachment to the Divine is an embodied relationship, expressed by body sensations and reactions like subtle feelings, osmic sensations, visions, and locutions and are expressed via glossolalia, stigmata, levitation and bilocation as well as other bodily miracles. The final bodily expression of divine attachment is the existence of incorruptible bodies. The Shamanic state of consciousness, or possessions, locutions, visions and prophecies