

Brief Forms in
Medieval and
Renaissance
Hispanic Literature

Brief Forms in Medieval and Renaissance Hispanic Literature

Edited by

Barry Taylor
and Alejandro Coroleu

Cambridge
Scholars
Publishing



Brief Forms in Medieval and Renaissance Hispanic Literature

Edited by Barry Taylor and Alejandro Coroleu

This book first published 2017

Cambridge Scholars Publishing

Lady Stephenson Library, Newcastle upon Tyne, NE6 2PA, UK

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Copyright © 2017 by Barry Taylor, Alejandro Coroleu
and contributors

Cover illustration: Giulio Cesare Capaccio, *Trattato delle imprese in IV. Libri diviso* (In Napoli: ex Officina Horatii Salviani, 1592), III, 6. (London, Dr Williams's Library, 2009.D.1). The naturally noisy goose wisely escapes its pursuers by holding a stone in its beak to ensure its silence (Plutarch, *De garrulitate, Moralia* 510A-B).

All rights for this book reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the copyright owner.

ISBN (10): 1-4438-9139-8

ISBN (13): 978-1-4438-9139-4

CONTENTS

List of Illustrations	vii
Foreword	viii
Introduction	ix
Barry Taylor and Alejandro Coroleu	
The Reception of Ramon Llull's Collections of Proverbs from the Fourteenth to the Eighteenth Century: An Overview.....	1
Francesc Tous Prieto	
Ferrer Saiol's Fourteenth-Century Catalan Translation of Palladius' <i>Sententiae</i>	26
Raimon Sebastian	
On the Eastern Origin and Iberian Analogues of Geoffrey Chaucer's <i>The Canon's Yeoman's Tale</i>	44
Francesc J. Gómez	
Antonio Beccadelli il Panormita's <i>De dictis et factis regis Alphonsi Aragonum</i> : Text and Book	66
Barry Taylor	
On the Circulation of the Latin Miscellany in Renaissance Spain.....	89
Alejandro Coroleu	
The Enigmatic Mountain: Canigou's Black Lake and its Demonic Beings.....	100
Eulàlia Miralles	
The Epigram and Definitions of the Sonnet in Sixteenth-Century Spain, from Herrera to Garcilaso: Notes on an Historiographical Problem.....	114
Roland Béhar	

A Mirror for Mexican Princes: Reconsidering the Context and Latin Source for the Nahuatl Translation of Aesop's Fables.....	132
Andrew Laird	
On the Presence of Alciato's Emblems in the Work of Baltasar de Vitoria, Disciple of Francisco Sánchez de las Brozas.....	168
Cirilo García Román and Alejandro Martínez Sobrino	
Sixteenth- and Seventeenth-Century Spanish Collections of Brief Forms and the <i>ars excerpenti</i>	189
Iveta Nakládalová	
Index.....	204

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

Fig. 1 Andrea Alciato, *Emblematum liber*, Augsburg, 1531, fol. 67.

Fig. 2 Andrea Alciato, *Emblematum liber*, Augsburg, 1531, fol. 610.

Fig. 3 Andrea Alciato, *Emblematum liber*, Augsburg, 1531, fol. 247.

Fig. 4 Andrea Alciato, *Emblematum liber*, Augsburg, 1531, fol. 300.

Fig. 5 Andrea Alciato, *Emblematum liber*, Augsburg, 1531, fol. 40.

FOREWORD

These studies have their origin in a conference held at the Institute of Modern Language Research, School of Advanced Study, University of London, on 4 March 2016. We would like to express our gratitude to Professor Catherine Davies and Ms Jane Lewin for their moral and practical support during the course of the conference. To provide more complete coverage of the subject, an introductory note and two additional papers –“Ferrer Saiol’s fourteenth-century Catalan translation of Palladius’ *sententiae*” and “On the circulation of the Latin miscellany in Renaissance Spain”– were written specifically for the volume. Publication of this book is part of Project FFI2013-41056-P (*Scriptores Latini Minores*, 2014-2017) and of Project FFI2014-53050-C5-4-P (*Traducción al catalán y cultura latina en la Corona de Aragón, 1380-1530: obras de tradición clásica y humanística*, 2015-2018) awarded by the Spanish Ministerio de Economía, Industria y Competitividad.

INTRODUCTION:

SIMPLE FORMS, BRIEF FORMS

BARRY TAYLOR AND ALEJANDRO COROLEU

Simple Forms

In Halle in 1930 André Jolles (1874-1946) published his *Einfache Formen*. These ‘Simple Forms’ were

Legende (legend)¹
Sage (saga)
Mythe (myth)
Rätsel (riddle)
Spruch (proverb)
Kasus (case)
Memorable
Märchen (folk or fairy tale)
Witz (joke, witticism).

Jolles’s approach was that of the anthropologist. He viewed these Simple Forms as structuring principles operative in language before their actualization in specific legends, sagas, folktales, etc. (Schwartz, p. 728).

Indeed, Welck and Warren draw parallels with the taxonomy of orally transmitted works which began in the 1930s and culminated in Stith Thompson’s *Motif-index of folk-literature: a classification of narrative elements in folk-tales, ballads, myths, fables, mediæval romances, exempla, fabliaux, jest-books, and local legends* in 1955:

¹ Translations by Peter J. Schwartz: see André Jolles, “Legend: From *Einfache Formen*”, translation and introduction by Peter J. Schwartz, *PMLA*, 182.3 (2013), 728-43.

Jolles's list corresponds roughly to the list of folk-types, or 'forms of popular literature', studied by Alexander H. Krappé in his *Science of Folk-Lore*, London 1930: the Fairy Tale, the Merry Tale (or Fabliau), the Animal Tale, the Local Legend, the Migratory Legend, the Prose Saga, the Proverb, the Folk-Song, the Popular Ballad, Charms, Rhymes and Riddles.²

Brief Forms

One literary manifestation of Simple Forms was as Brief Forms. Brevity as a model of style has a long history in written literature.³ As Varro has it:

omnis oratio cum debeat dirigi ad utilitatem, ad quam tum denique pervenit, si est aperta et brevis, quae petimus, quod obscurus et longior orator est odio

[All speaking ought to be aimed at practical utility, and it attains this only if it is clear and brief: characteristics which we seek, because an obscure and longish speaker is disliked.]⁴

The medieval rhetoricians wrote of *abbreviatio*, which was conceived in two senses. First as a way of writing, and secondly as a process of reducing a long text to a short one: excerpting and epitomising.⁵

Although the Ancients did not consider Brief Forms a category, they do nevertheless describe them. Cicero, Quintilian and the pseudo-Ciceronian *Auctor ad Herennium* defined these brief forms:

sententia (*Ad Herennium*, 4. 17)

exemplum (*Ad Herennium*, 4. 49)

chria (Quintilian, *Institutiones oratoriae*, 1. 9)

² René Wellek and Austin Warren, *Theory of Literature* (Harmondsworth: Peregrine, 1976), pp.236 and 309.

³ Ernst Robert Curtius, "Brevity as an Ideal of Style", in his *European Literature and the Latin Middle Ages*, tr. Willard R. Trask (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1953), pp. 487-94; Barry Taylor, "La brevedad como ideal estilístico en la prosa temprana", ed. Juan Paredes, *Medioevo y literatura: actas del V Congreso de la Asociación Hispánica de Literatura Medieval* (Granada: Universidad, 1995), pp. 373-81.

⁴ *De lingua latina*, 8.11: Varro, *On the Latin Language*, with an English translation by Roland G. Kent, 2 vols (London: Heinemann, 1938) II, pp. 390-91.

⁵ Godofredo de Vinsauf, *Poetria nova*, ed. and Spanish tr. Ana María Calvo Revilla (Madrid: Arco/Libros, 2008), lines 695-741; text pp. 166-69; study pp. 85-88.

fabula (*Ad Herennium*, 1. 8).

Although epigraph and epigram were not theorised until the sixteenth century,⁶ Jolles's *Witz* appears among the Ancients as *facetia* and *dicacitas* (Cicero, *Orator*, 26, 87).

This corpus stayed constant until the appearance of Alciato's emblems in 1531.⁷ The pared-down quality of Simple Forms has given them the ability to recur across cultures. The studies gathered here focus on their reception in Hispanic culture from the Middle Ages to circa 1650. They scrutinise several of the simple forms which are also brief forms: the proverb (Jolles's *Spruch*, the rhetoricians' *sententia*) [Tous, Laird]; the tale (Jolles's *Märchen*, the rhetoricians' *exemplum*) [Gómez, Sebastian, Laird]; the apophthegm (a fusion of tale and proverb, the rhetoricians' *chria*) [Taylor]; the legend (Jolles's *Legende*, the rhetoricians' *fabula*) [Miralles]; epigraph and epigram (Jolles's *Witz*) the rhetoricians' *facetiae* and *dicacitas* [Béhar]; the creation of brief forms from longer works [Nakládalová, Coroleu, Sebastian]; and the more learned forms untreated by Jolles, the erudite emblem [García Román and Martínez Sobrino] and even more scholarly *adversaria* [Coroleu].

We close with Gracián's celebratedly brief encomium of the beguiling efficiency of the brief:

No cansar. Suele ser pessado el hombre de un negocio, y el de un verbo. La brevedad es lisongera, y más negociante; gana por lo cortés lo que pierde por lo corto. Lo bueno, si breve, dos veces bueno; y aun lo malo, si poco, no tan malo. Más obran quintas essencias que fárragos; y es verdad común que hombre largo raras vezes entendido, no tanto en lo material de la disposición quanto en lo formal del discurso. Ai hombres que sirven más de embaraço que de adorno del universo, alajas perdidas que todos las desvían. Escuse el Discreto el embaraçar, y mucho menos a grandes personajes, que viven mui ocupados, y sería peor desazonar uno dellos que todo lo restante del mundo. Lo bien dicho se dize presto.⁸

⁶ Sagrario López Poza, "Góngora en la trayectoria aureosecular", in ed. Juan Matas Caballero et al, *Góngora y el epigrama: estudios sobre las décimas* (Madrid: Iberoamericana, 2013), pp. 9-42 (pp. 11-12).

⁷ For the medieval antecedents of the emblem, see Alison Saunders, "Is it a Proverb or an Emblem? French Manuscript Predecessors of the Emblem Book", *Bibliothèque d'Humanisme et Renaissance*, 55 (1993), 83-111.

⁸ Baltasar Gracián, *Oráculo manual y arte de prudencia*, ed. Emilio Blanco (Madrid: Cátedra, 1995), no. 105 (pp. 159-60).

THE RECEPTION OF RAMON LLULL'S
COLLECTIONS OF PROVERBS
FROM THE FOURTEENTH
TO THE EIGHTEENTH CENTURY:
AN OVERVIEW¹

FRANCESC TOUS PRIETO
(CDRL – UNIVERSITAT DE BARCELONA)

1. The proverbial work of Ramon Llull

It is commonly acknowledged that Ramon Llull, who was born in Majorca in 1232 and died in 1315 or 1316, is one of the most outstanding and prolific authors of the late Middle Ages. Nowadays we know that Llull wrote more than 250 works. Some of them are brief monographs about specific theological, philosophical, moral or scientific matters, such as the set of books composed in Messina and Tunis between 1313 and 1315, but he also wrote very long compositions, often of encyclopaedic or compendious scope, such as the *Book of Contemplation* (1273-1274), the *Tree of Science* (1295-1296), novels like the *Romance of Evast and Blaqueria* (1276-1283) or the *Book of Wonders* (1287-1289), and even some of the formulations of his famous Art, such as the *Ars generalis ultima* (1305-1308).² One of the reasons why Llull wrote such an

¹ This article has been written in the frame of the Project FFI 2014-53050-C5-1-P, “Corpus Digital de Textos Medievales y Renacentistas”, from the University of Barcelona, funded by the Department of Economy and Competitiveness of the Government of Spain; and also within the activities of the Research Group “Grup de Cultura i Literatura de la Baixa Edat Mitjana” (2014SGR119), funded by the Government of Catalunya.

² For general information about any Lullian work—both authentic or spurious—, manuscript or edition cited in this paper, see the Ramon Llull Data Base (Llull DB; accessed February 16, 2017), <http://orbita.bib.ub.edu/llull/index.asp>.

extensive opus is his continuous drive for formal and generic variation and experimentation.

Llull was essentially a lay and non-scholar missionary who, after a striking spiritual conversion circa 1262, had assumed the responsibility of preaching to Muslims, Jews or other groups of infidels to convince them that the Christian faith was the only truth. In addition, he claimed that he had received a divinely inspired intellectual method or technique, that he called the Art, which enabled Christian preachers to prove by “necessary arguments”, that is, by rational rather than by “authoritative” means, the articles of their faith. When Llull first taught the Art at the University of Paris (1287-1289), the teachers and scholars of the Sorbonne considered it an eccentric and useless intellectual tool made up by an autodidactic and untrained layman. Llull's peripheral position within his world—both geographical and intellectual—compel him to great and constant efforts throughout his career to find new ways and instruments to propagate the Art and his ideas. This effort includes the aim to connect with all kind of audiences. Llull sought the favour of scholars, popes and the church hierarchy, some of the most powerful rulers of his time—beginning with the French kings—, but he also wrote many works addressed to laymen or even to the Muslim sages he intended to convert. Each of these audiences had their own cultural and literary background, and therefore Llull was aware that he had to use their own codes, languages or genres.³

Therefore, in order to achieve his goals and reach these audiences, Llull was not only a plurilingual author—he could write in Catalan, Occitan (for poetry), Latin (usually with help) and Arabic, and he commanded translations of some of his prose works into Occitan and French—but also a very versatile one. Within his opus, we can find theoretical, complex and speculative works—for example the different versions of the Art, from the *Ars compendiosa inveniendi veritatem* (1276) to the *Ars generalis ultima*—, but at the same time, there are encyclopaedias for laymen (*Tree of Science*); pedagogical treatises for young people

³ The most up-to-date recent introduction to Llull's biography, works and thought written in English can be found in Alexander Fidora and Josep E. Rubio, ed., *Raimundus Lullus. An Introduction to his Life, Works and Thought*, trans. Robert D. Hughes, Anna A. Akasoy and Magnus Ryan (Turnhout: Brepols, 2008). A complete account of the evolution and operation of the Art is provided by Anthony Bonner, *The Art and Logic of Ramon Llull. A User's guide* (Leiden / Boston: Brill, 2007). For an overview of Llull's literary work, the techniques he used to disseminate it and his lay condition, see Lola Badia, Joan Santanach and Albert Soler, *Ramon Llull as a Vernacular Writer: Communicating a New Kind of Knowledge*, trans. Robert D. Hughes (London: Tamesis, 2016).

(*Children's Doctrine*, 1274-1276; *Book of the Intention*, 1276-1283); novels; didactic, liturgical, autobiographical or Mariological poems (*Hours of Our Lady*, 1292; *One Hundred Names of God*, 1292; *Song of Ramon*, 1301; *The Counsel*, 1311); dialogues such as the *Book of the Gentile and the Three Sages* (1274-1276) or the *Liber disputationis Petri et Raimundi* (1311); mystical works (*Book of the Lover and the Beloved*, 1283; *Tree of the Philosophy of Love*, 1298); or collections of short narratives (*Tree of Examples*, 1295-1296). Most of these last books were composed originally in Catalan and, in some cases, subsequently translated into Latin. Llull was able to compensate for his lack of formal education and the peripheral position that we have described with an uncommon intelligence and exceptional creativity. Literary genres, even though Llull had rejected them at the beginning of his career,⁴ played a far from negligible role in his programme of disseminating the Art and his thought. Llull the writer, who himself had been a troubadour before his spiritual conversion, shows us in his works that he was very familiar with the secular literature of his time.⁵ The disdain he felt towards it from 1263 on did not prevent him from restoring and transforming it into a useful tool for the correct education of laymen or a powerful instrument to catch the attention, interest or support of his addressees.⁶

Another didactic and literary genre that Llull cultivated intensively was the proverb. Although he had been much attracted by brief forms and concise and laconic style since his first works, most of his collections of proverbs and other kinds of sentences series were composed between 1290

⁴ In chapter 118 of the *Book of Contemplation*, Llull demonstrates a general and radical repulsion towards the practices of the “joglers”—a concept in which the author fuses the figures of the jongleur (the performer) and the troubadour (the composer). He states that their words promote wars, disputes and battles between princes, knights and people, and encourage women to lust and to deceive their husbands. See Ramon Llull, *Llibre de contemplació*, ed. Miquel Ferrà (Palma de Mallorca: Comissió Editora Lul·liana, 1910), vol. 3, p. 98.

⁵ In 1311 Llull dictated an autobiography to a Carthusian monk of the Parisian monastery of Vauvert, the *Vita Coaetanea*. The text begins with the following revelation: “Ramon, while still a young man and seneschal to the king of Majorca, was very given to composing worthless songs and poems and to doing other licentious things”, Ramon Llull, *A Contemporary Life*, ed. and trans. Anthony Bonner (Barcelona / Woodbridge: Barcino / Tamesis, 2010), p. 31.

⁶ Llull dedicated some of his works—or his manuscripts—to the sovereigns he wanted to influence, such as James II of Catalunya-Aragon (1291-1327), Philip IV of France (1285-1314) or Pietro Gradenigo, doge of Venice (1291-311).

and 1309.⁷ Although the most famous and well-considered literary texts, such as the novels or certain poems, had eclipsed this area of his work, Llull also proved incredibly prolific and singular in this field. The Lullian proverb corpus is formed by the following five collections:

Table 1: Ramon Llull's collections of proverbs.

Title	Number of proverbs	Year	Place
<i>Tree of Examples</i>	approx. 450	1295-1296	Rome
<i>Proverbs of Ramon</i>	approx. 6000	1296	Rome
<i>Proverbs of the New Rhetoric</i>	50 + 11	1301	Cyprus
<i>The Thousand Proverbs</i>	approx. 1000	1302	At sea ⁸
<i>Proverbs of Teaching</i>	175	?	?

One of the most outstanding features of Lullian proverbial corpus is its formal, stylistic and thematic variation and richness. Each of these works has its own characteristics, scope and aims. However, we can use different kinds of criteria to classify them. In the first place, we can distinguish the “pure” collections from the “mixed” ones. Both the *Tree of Examples* and the *New Rhetoric* place the series of proverbs in a vaster context where proverbs share space with other rhetorical and exemplary devices, mainly short stories. In fact, the *Tree of Examples* is the first work where Llull uses proverbs explicitly. In the prologue the author explains that the collection—in fact, the fifteenth section of the *Tree of Science*—contains two different kinds of *exempla*: short narratives (“recontaments” in

⁷ For a complete survey and analysis of these series, see Francesc Tous, “Les col·leccions de proverbis de Ramon Llull: estudi de conjunt i edició dels *Mil proverbis* i dels *Proverbis d'ensenyament*,” PhD. diss., University of Barcelona, chapter III. 2, <http://hdl.handle.net/10803/300593>.

⁸ The colophon of the text states that the author wrote it “vinent d’oltra mar” (“coming from overseas”). In 1301-1302 Llull travelled to the eastern Mediterranean and visited Cyprus, Lesser Armenia, and perhaps Jerusalem. See Tous, “Les col·leccions de proverbis,” chapter V.1, and Jordi Gayà, “Ramon Llull en Oriente (1301-1302): circumstancies de un viatge,” *Studia Lulliana*, 37 (1997), 25-78.

Catalan) and proverbs.⁹ The *Tree of Examples* is really a very singular text within the frame of late medieval exemplary literature, one of the most relevant and accomplished products of the Lullian “alternative” or “new” literature.¹⁰ As Robert Pring-Mill stressed some years ago, in this “mixed” collection Lull “transforms the science into literature”,¹¹ because he shows the reader how to transfigure the matters and subjects of the encyclopaedia in the characters of short narratives and dialogical proverbs. The text is a thematically arranged collection that follows the symbolic structure, based on the morphological parts of a tree—roots, trunk, branches, leaves, flowers, etc.—, of the preceding fourteen sections of the *Tree of Science*. On the other hand, the *Proverbs of the New Rhetoric* appears in section 2.7 of the treatise. The second chapter offers an overview of the rhetorical figures or resources that the writer or the orator can use to embellish his discourses.¹² After the *exempla* and other elements like the comparisons or what Lull calls the “ornaments”, the author defines the proverb and exemplifies its use with an anthology of fifty proverbs in octosyllabic couplets.¹³ In addition, the last section of the

⁹ The Catalan version of the text is published in Ramon Llull, *Obres essencials* (Barcelona: Selecta, 1957), vol. 1, pp. 799-842. For the Latin version, see *Raimundi Lulli Opera latina, Tomi XXIV-XXVI*, 65, *Arbor scientiae*, ed. Pere Villalba (Turnhout: Brepols, 2000).

¹⁰ See Lola Badia, “La literatura alternativa de Ramon Llull: tres mostres,” in ed. Santiago Fortuño Llorens and Tomàs Martínez Romero, *Actes del VII Congrés de l’Associació Hispànica de Literatura Medieval* (Castelló de la Plana: Publicacions de la Universitat Jaume I), vol. I, pp. 11-32.

¹¹ Robert Pring-Mill, “Els «recontaments» de l’*Arbre exemplifical* de Ramon Llull: la transmutació de la ciència en literatura,” in *Actes del Tercer Col·loqui Internacional de Llengua i Literatura Catalanes* (Oxford: Dolphin, 1976), pp. 311-23. See also Albert Hauf, “Sobre l’*Arbor exemplificalis*,” in ed. Fernando Domínguez, Pere Villalba and Peter Walter, *Arbor Scientiae: der Baum des Wissens von Ramon Llull. Akten des Internationalen Kongresses aus Anlass des 40-jährigen Jubiläums des Raimundus-Lullus-Instituts der Universität Freiburg i. Br.* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2002), pp. 303-42.

¹² The text can be read both in Latin and in a modern Catalan translation in Ramon Llull, *Retòrica nova*, ed. Josep Batalla, Lluís Cabré and Marcel Ortín (Turnhout / Santa Coloma de Queralt: Brepols / Obrador Edèndum, 2006). There is an English translation by Mark D. Johnston in *Ramon Llull’s New Rhetoric: Text and Translation of Llull’s «Rhetorica nova»* (Davis, CA: Hermagoras Press, 1994). See also Mark D. Johnston, *The Evangelical Rhetoric of Ramon Llull. Lay Learning and Piety in the Christian West around 1300* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996).

¹³ This was a common practice in the rhetorical treatises of the Middle Ages. See John Ward, “Rhetoric and the art of *dictamen*” in ed. Olga Weijers, *Méthodes et*

New Rhetoric, in which Llull addresses the principle of charity—he considers it as one of the indispensable bases of rhetoric—, is made up, as in the *Tree of Examples*, of ten proverbs and ten short stories. In this case, the *exempla* are obviously an application or an amplification of the principles expressed in the proverbs.

For their part, the *Proverbs of Ramon* (“Proverbis de Ramon”), *Thousand Proverbs* (“Mil proverbis”) and *Proverbs of Teaching* (“Proverbis d’ensenyament”) are “pure” collections because their contents are strictly proverbs. The first one is a gigantic compilation of six thousand proverbs, distributed in three parts of one hundred chapters each—so around twenty proverbs per chapter. It goes without saying that, as in the *Tree of Examples*, the *Proverbs of Ramon* are a large encyclopaedic and compendious book that synthesises in very laconic statements many theological, philosophical, scientific, and moral matters. Although Llull chooses the term *proverb* to identify these statements,¹⁴ there are a lot of them that we must consider rather maxims or propositions than proverbs. In fact, the *Proverbs of Ramon* are not simply “a text which gives advice on conduct, expressed in brief sentences paratactically arranged”,¹⁵ but also a text which gives insight into all the fields we have mentioned above, much closer to a philosophical and scholarly *florilegium* like the *Auctoritates Aristotelis* than a plain parenetical collection of proverbs.¹⁶ However, the most striking feature of this book is that it is not a real compilation of *auctoritates*, as were all the other *florilegia* of the time, but rather the personal Lullian contribution to the genre. The only authority that Llull invokes in the prologue of his collection is—no surprise for those who

instruments du travail intellectuel au moyen âge. Études sur le vocabulaire (Turnhout: Brepols, 1990), pp. 20-61; and the anthologies in Sibylle Hallik, *Sententia und Proverbium: Begriffsgeschichte und Texttheorie in Antike und Mittelalter* (Cologne: Böhlau, 2007), pp. 464-621.

¹⁴ It seems clear that Llull has chosen it because it is linked with an influential and authoritative pedagogical tradition that has its roots, obviously, in biblical wisdom. Moreover, we could even say that the title of the collection emulates that of King Solomon’s book and other well-known and widespread masterworks of the genre such as the *Proverbia Senecae*.

¹⁵ This is the “working definition” of a proverb collection stated by Barry Taylor in his “Medieval Proverb Collections: The West European Tradition,” *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes*, 55 (1992), 19.

¹⁶ See Jacqueline Hamesse, *Les “Auctoritates Aristotelis”, un florilège médiéval: étude historique et édition critique* (Louvain / Paris: Publications Universitaires / Béatrice-Nauwelaerts, 1974).

know his other works—himself.¹⁷ The *Thousand Proverbs* and *Proverbs of Teaching* do not follow the way of the *Proverbs of Ramon*. They are strictly moral collections of proverbs that aim to offer guidelines to orient the reader's path to salvation. Nevertheless, the first one is a new thematically arranged book, formed of fifty-two chapters of twenty proverbs, whereas the latter has the same formal features of the *Proverbs of the New Rhetoric*.

Therefore, we can link the five collections of the corpus in multiple ways. We have already differentiated the “pure” collections from the “mixed” ones, but we can use other criteria. For example, the chronology of composition, which is in addition connected with the scope, content and even the purpose of the collections. In effect, the data displayed in Table 1 reveal clearly that Llull wrote practically all the corpus in two different periods. Firstly, in Rome, in 1295-1296. It seems as if after the *Tree of Examples* Llull discovered that the proverb was a powerful tool to fix and memorize all kinds of knowledge and used it in an autonomous way in the *Proverbs of Ramon*. Even if we must admit that these two works differ undoubtedly in structure, form and style, Llull himself remarks in the prologues that his compilations are worthy of preachers. The *Tree of Examples* also provides a method to revise and memorize the content of the encyclopaedia, whereas in the *Proverbs of Ramon* Llull states very clearly that the maxims are also intended as a disputation tool: they may be used in theological or philosophical *disputationes*, probably including those between Christian and infidels. Secondly, Llull wrote the *New Rhetoric* and the *Thousand Proverbs* between 1301 and 1302, during his mission in the eastern Mediterranean. The relationship between these two books is very similar to the preceding: they differ in formal and stylistic features, whereas they share the same rhetorical orientation. It is true that the prologue of the *Thousand Proverbs* presents the text as a book which gives advice on conduct, but it also points out that it is noteworthy for those willing to begin their speeches with suitable words.¹⁸ Although the *Thousand Proverbs* is a much longer and more structured and detailed collection, the subjects we can find in both works are more or less the same.

¹⁷ Llull states in the prologue that he is going to manifest great “science and contemplation” through proverbs and that he is going to follow the doctrine of the *General Table*, a formulation of Art composed in 1294. He also cites *The Hundred Names of God*, written slightly earlier. See Ramon Llull, *Proverbis de Ramon. Mil proverbis, Proverbis d'ensenyament*, ed. Salvador Galmés (Palma de Mallorca: Obres de Ramon Llull, 1928), p. 1.

¹⁸ See Tous, “Les col·leccions de proverbis,” p. 389.

Finally, we can establish a different classification if we pay attention to the form and structure of the Lullian collections. On the one hand, there are the prose collections. Actually, we have just seen that the architecture of the *Proverbs of Ramon* and *Thousand Proverbs* is essentially the same—a succession of thematic chapters of twenty proverbs. It is true that the complexity and nature of certain subjects of the *Proverbs of Ramon* often require, compared with the latter, a greater length and a logical formulation of the proverbs, totally absent in the collection of 1302. Nonetheless, the rhetorical devices used in both works are usually very similar. The *instruction proverbs* appear obviously when Llull deals with moral matters.¹⁹ After all, the two collections only differ in scope and partially in content. The proverbial sections of the *Tree of Examples* usually contain ten proverbs—with some exceptions—, but the form and even the genre of them are very variable. There are dialogical and narrative proverbs, as noted above, but also logical or scientific maxims, interrogative and exclamative sentences, rhymed couplets and classical *sentence proverbs*.²⁰ And on the other hand, there are the versified collections. As we have already pointed out, the *Proverbs of the New Rhetoric* and the *Proverbs of Teaching* share the same metrical form, the octosyllabic couplet.

2. A general survey of the reception of the Lullian proverbial corpus

This proverbial corpus, composed by a layman in the late thirteenth century and the beginning of the following, is in fact one of the most impressive and original gnomic and sententious ensembles of the late Middle Ages. During the next centuries, a far from negligible number of Lullists, scholars, writers or simple readers appreciated the value and pedagogical potentialities of these works. We can attempt to retrace the history of the reception of these texts thanks, mainly, to the study of the textual witnesses and the identification of notices in surviving inventories and catalogues. The following study of first two “pure” collections of proverbs just described will show that the panorama changes greatly from

¹⁹ For the distinction between *instruction proverb* and *sentence proverb*, see James G. Williams, “Proverbs and Ecclesiastes,” in ed. Robert Alter and Frank Kermode, *The literary guide to the Bible* (Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1987), p. 270.

²⁰ For a complete description and discussion of the different modalities of proverbs found in Lullian collections, see Tous, “Les col·leccions de proverbis,” chapter III.2.4.

one collection to another, depending of course on the features, the linguistic versions and, perhaps, the circumstances of transmission of each one.²¹

Firstly, we must be aware that the whole work of Llull has been transmitted in more than one thousand manuscripts and hundreds of printed editions.²² Obviously, as happens with the proverbial works, there are some huge hits—for example the *Ars brevis* (1308), the pocket version of the *Ars generalis ultima*: seventy-three manuscripts and twenty-one printings from the fourteenth to eighteenth centuries, practically all of them in Latin—and, on the other hand, books preserved in a very few witnesses—such as the *Flowers of Love and Flowers of Intelligence*, which have been transmitted by one single Catalan manuscript and a late Latin translation from the eighteenth century. It goes without saying that the works with a Latin tradition could usually reach a larger audience. Until the nineteenth century the most appreciated Lullian books were normally the formulations of the Art or their satellite texts. If we take a quick look at the statistics published by Anthony Bonner some years ago,²³ we will realise that the most transmitted Lullian works were read primarily in Latin—even if they are also preserved in Catalan or other vernacular languages. As Elena Pistolesi has recently pointed out after having studied the whole plurilingual transmission of Lull’s works,²⁴ there are a set of works, written firstly in Catalan and translated later into Latin, that present a prominent asymmetric tradition between Latin and vernacular witnesses. It is the case, for example, of the *Ars brevis*—three Catalan manuscripts against seventy Latin— and of the *Tree of science*—two Catalan medieval manuscripts, one lost, against almost twenty Latin. Nevertheless, we must not despise the fortune of some texts that have circulated mainly in vernacular languages. The most striking example is the famous *Book of the*

²¹ We will first present the statistics of the three collections, and will go on to discuss essentially the case of *Proverbs of Ramon* and mainly of the *Thousand Proverbs*. For the special textual transmission and edition of the *Proverbs of Teaching*, see Tous, “Les col·leccions de proverbis,” pp. 277-311 and Francesc Tous “«Cascun proverbi és escrit / per ço que en son lloc sia dit»: els proverbis rimats de Ramon Llull”, *Mot so razo*, 15, in press.

²² The Manuscripts section of Llull DB now has a register of 1631 manuscripts, but it includes those which preserve pseudo-Lullian works and books written by Llull’s disciples and followers. In the Bibliography section, there is a list of around forty incunabula.

²³ Anthony Bonner, “Estadístiques sobre la recepció de l’obra de Ramon Llull,” *Studia Lulliana*, 43 (2003), 83-92.

²⁴ Elena Pistolesi, “Tradizione e traduzione nel corpus lulliano,” *Studia Lulliana*, 49 (2009), 3-50.

Order of Chivalry (1274-1276), with a wholly vernacular tradition.²⁵ According to Bonner's statistics, this work is the eleventh most copied text of all Lullian works.

Regarding the "pure" collections of proverbs, we can affirm that, with the exception of the *Proverbs of Teaching*, only recorded in three sixteenth-century witnesses, they reached a notable and constant circulation from the fourteenth to the eighteenth century. Tables 2 and 3 schematize the textual tradition of the three collections organizing the witnesses by date and language:

The data displayed in the Tables show that the ensemble of Llull's proverbial works has been preserved in nearly fifty manuscripts and seven editions. Of course, most of these witnesses belong to the *Proverbs of Ramon*, a book which is in fact, always according to Bonner's statistics, the sixth most widespread of any Lullian work. As we can see, the principal set of witnesses—more than two-thirds of the total—is formed by fourteenth- and fifteenth-century manuscripts of the *Proverbs of Ramon* and of the *Thousand Proverbs*. In the sixteenth century, a remarkable feature is the three editions of the *Proverbs of Ramon* and the only three witnesses preserved of the *Proverbs of Teaching*. Interest in the proverb collections decreases radically in the following centuries, although there is a modest revival in the eighteenth century with three manuscripts and three editions of the *Proverbs of Ramon* and the *Thousand Proverbs*, but restricted geographically to Majorca and chronologically to the thirties and forties.

Table 2: The manuscripts of the *Proverbs of Ramon*, the *Thousand Proverbs* and the *Proverbs of Teaching* from the fourteenth to the eighteenth century (L = Latin C = Catalan S = Spanish).

	XIV		XV		XVI			XVII		XVIII		Total
	L	C	L	C	L	C	S	L	C	L	C	
<i>ProvR</i>	7	2	19	0	1	0	1	4	0	2	0	36
<i>ThPov</i>	0	2	0	4	0	1	0	1	0	0	1	9
<i>PofT</i>	0	0	0	0	0	3	1	0	0	0	0	3
Total	7	4	19	4	1	4	2	5	0	2	1	48
	11		23		6			5		3		

²⁵ Llull wrote this book in Catalan, it was translated into French in the fourteenth century, into English, by William Caxton, in the fifteenth and into Scots the same century. See Ramon Llull, *Llibre de l'orde de cavalleria*, ed. Albert Soler (Barcelona: Barcino, 1988); and the corresponding bibliographic entries in Llull DB.

Table 3. The editions of the *Proverbs of Ramon*, the *Thousand Proverbs* and the *Proverbs of Teaching* from the fourteenth to the eighteenth century.

	XV		XVI		XVII		XVIII		Total
	L	C	L	C	L	C	L	C	
<i>Proverbs of Ramon</i>	1	0	3	0	0	0	2	0	6
<i>The Thousand Prov.</i>	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	1
<i>Prov. of Teaching</i>	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total	1	0	3	0	0	0	3	1	7
	1		3		0		3		

Note: The statistics of the two Tables come from the data available today in Lull DB. The numbers in bold belong to bilingual manuscripts or editions and consequently we have not added them to the total.

Otherwise, Table 4 offers an overview of the records of the three books found in inventories and catalogues.

Table 4: Mentions of the *Proverbs of Ramon*, the *Thousand Proverbs* and the *Proverbs of Teaching* in inventories and catalogues.

	XIV	XV	XVI	XVII	XVIII	Total
<i>Proverbs of Ramon</i>	2	13	19	16	10	60
<i>The Thousand Proverbs</i>	0	1	2	6	5	14
<i>Proverbs of Teaching</i>	0	1	0	0	0	1
Total	2	15	21	22	15	75

Source: Lull DB.

The sixty references to the *Proverbs of Ramon* confirm the widespread circulation of this most ambitious Lullian collection. They make clear that it was a very well-known and much used book in Lullian circles. The presence of the *Thousand Proverbs* in these documents is clearly less important, probably in accordance with its almost exclusively vernacular

diffusion, but some of the most remarkable Lullian catalogues of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, such as those of Arce de Herrera, Arias de Loyola, Luke Wadding, Nicolas de Hauteville or Nicolás Antonio, unequivocally record it.²⁶ It must be said that some of these mentions are ambiguous and sometimes it is not clear if they should be assigned to the *Proverbs of Ramon* or to the *Thousand Proverbs*. To begin with, the earliest and one of the most important Lullian catalogues of all time, the *Electorium* (1311-1314) of Thomas Le Myésier (d. 1336), records two successive references to proverbial works, items 43 and 44.²⁷ The first one is identified with the title *Liber proverbiorum* and there is no doubt that it must refer to the *Proverbs of Ramon*. Even though Llull had designated his collection with the most specific *Proverbia Raymundi*,²⁸ Le Myésier's new title was taken up by many later catalogues—obviously beginning with those which are, directly or indirectly, copies of his. In fact, the second one records the same title, but with the addition of the word *alius*. It is not sure if we should interpret this term as a reference to another proverbial work of Llull's or to another copy of the *Proverbs of Ramon*. Hillgarth considers that the second possibility is more likely because there are no medieval Latin copies of the *Thousand Proverbs*.²⁹ Furthermore, as Hillgarth points out, the first list of the *Electorium*—that records Lullian books written until 1311—was probably an inventory of the Lullian volumes of the Carthusian monastery of Vauvert, but Le Myésier also notes, with a dot, the books that he possesses. The dot appears on both numbers of the *Proverbs of Ramon*, so it is evident that

²⁶ Complete information and sources of these catalogues can be found in the corresponding section of Llull DB.

²⁷ The *Electorium* has been preserved in MS lat. 15450 of the Bibliothèque Nationale de France and has been published by Jocelyn N. Hillgarth, *Ramon Llull and Lullism in Fourteenth-Century France* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1971), pp. 335-47.

²⁸ This heading appears in the invocation of the text. For the Catalan text, see Llull, *Proverbis de Ramon*, 1. For the Latin one, see for example MS. Vat. Lat. 4850, fol. 4r. Not all the manuscripts and editions of the collection preserve the original invocation. For example, the Mainz 1737 edition, still the most recent one, eliminates the name of the author: "Deus cum tua Virtute incipiunt *Proverbia*", *Beati Raymundi Lulli Opera*, vol. 6 (Mainz: Häffner, 1737), int. vi, 1.

²⁹ However, there are other works without Latin medieval textual tradition in the *Electorium*, such as the *Book of the Order of Chivalry* (number 56, *Liber de militia*), the *Romance of Evast and Blaquerna* (*Liber Bracherne*, number 15) or the *Book of Wonders* (*Liber de mirabilibus*, number 16). Hence, the lack of Latin manuscripts it is not conclusive evidence to assign reference 44 to the *Proverbs of Ramon*.

we are dealing with copies rather than with works. There are other similar couples in the inventory, like *Liber gentilis* and *Alter Liber gentilis* (numbers 1-2), *Liber contemplationis* and *Alius Liber contemplationis* (numbers 3-4), or *Ars compendiosa* and *Alia Ars compendiosa* (numbers 5-6). There is no doubt that at least the first and the second represent two copies or volumes of the same work, so it would not be strange if the two mentions of *Liber proverbiorum* refer both to the *Proverbs of Ramon*. This hypothesis can be supported by the exclusively Catalan circulation of the *Thousand Proverbs*, as we will see below.

In later inventories and catalogues, even if we can usually find indications to decide whether a mention must be assigned to one or another proverbial work, we should be at least cautious. Sometimes the authors of these lists have been accurate and they have recorded the incipit and explicit of the works or books that they inventory, or they have chosen clear titles that allow us to identify them—perhaps following the scribes that had copied the texts. For example, in the case of the *Proverbs of Ramon*, there are some catalogues that list it as *Liber sex mille proverbiorum* or *Libre dels sis milia proverbis*—and other variants—, a heading that clearly distinguishes it from the *Thousand Proverbs*.³⁰ Unfortunately, the most common titles found in catalogues, such as *Liber proverbiorum* or *Proverbia (magistri) Raymundi (Lulli)*—regardless of the language in which they are recorded—, even if usually they correspond to the *Proverbs of Ramon*, could also name, specially the second, the *Thousand Proverbs*, such as the remaining textual tradition suggests.³¹ Thus, the two books that we find in the inventory of Joan Reig (1478)—priest of Pollença, in Majorca—, entitled *Los proverbis de mestre Ramon*, one on parchment and the other on paper, are most probably two copies of the *Proverbs of Ramon*—either in Latin or in Catalan, because the language of the entry does not always coincide with that of the work—, but we cannot dismiss the possibility that one or both of them correspond in fact to the *Thousand Proverbs*.³² In conclusion, even though

³⁰ It is the case, for example, of the sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Lullian catalogues compiled by Alfonso de Proaza, Arias de Loyola, Juan Arce de Herrera, Nicolas de Hauteville, Jean-Marie Vernon or Nicolás Antonio; but also of the fifteenth-century inventory of the hermit Martí de Vilaragut, who owned a Latin and Catalan copy of the work entitled *Libre dels sis milia proverbis*.

³¹ In one of the medieval copies of the *Thousand Proverbs*, MS. III of the Ateneu de Barcelona (see Table 5, below), the first rubric of the text, which precedes the index of chapters, reads simply “Proverbis de mestre Ramon Lull”.

³² It is true that the study of the circulation of the *Thousand Proverbs*, as described below, teaches us that most of the medieval readers of this book were probably

we have attributed—usually following the Llull DB data—all the mentions in the inventories and catalogues to one of the two works in order to draw up Table 4, we have to bear in mind that, at least in some cases, the assignment is hypothetical.³³

3. An overview of the reception of the *Proverbs of Ramon*

Given the complexity and the very remarkable spread of the *Proverbs of Ramon* from the fourteenth to eighteenth centuries, it is impossible to analyse here in detail its complete circulation and reception. In addition, there is still much research to be done in this field. Nonetheless, we can attempt to highlight some of the principal issues. Firstly, it is clear that the *Proverbs of Ramon*, as with the other most celebrated works of Llull, reached a large, diverse and international audience. If we survey the geographical location of the scribes, the patrons and the early readers or owners known to us of the manuscripts of the text, we will see that it seems that in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries the two main foci of copying and reading the *Proverbs of Ramon* were the Catalan area and the north of Italy.

One of the oldest witnesses to the text is the only complete Catalan copy that has survived (MS. Hisp 59 [603], Bayerische Staatsbibliothek of Munich).³⁴ It is a codex from the beginning of the fourteenth century and, thanks to the catalogues of the Lullian School from Barcelona (17th century) and Ivo Salzinger (1718), we know that it belonged to this important institution.³⁵ Indeed, the Lullist circles of Barcelona appear to

laymen. Nevertheless, this should not imply that a priest or a friar could not possess a work like the *Thousand Proverbs*, clearly conceived for a non-scholarly and lay audience. Joan Reig, for example, also owned books that Llull had addressed principally to laymen, such as the *Tree of Science* and the *Tree of the Philosophy of Love*.

³³ In the statistics of the *Thousand Proverbs*, in accordance with the hypothesis we have just presented, we have not included the references in the *Electorium* and the later catalogues derived from it that today are attributed to this book in Llull DB.

³⁴ This codex belongs to the first generation of Lullian manuscripts studied by Albert Soler, “Els manuscrits lul·lians de primera generació,” *Estudis Romànics*, 32 (2010), 179-214.

³⁵ On fol. 1v there is this note: “Aquest libre es de la scola” (“This book is from the school”). In the inventory of Salzinger’s manuscripts there is an epigraph called *Libri Barcinonenses in compactura numeris signati*. The fourth item is a copy of the *Proverbs of Ramon*. On the same folio as the note there is a large figure 4, so there is no doubt that the manuscript today in Munich was the one listed in Salzinger’s inventory.

have been the most interested in the *Proverbs of Ramon*. The book is present in the three inventories of the property of the school and in those linked to important members or partners of it, such as Antoni Sedacer (d. 1444), priest and lecturer of the school; Martí de Vilaragut, hermit of Caldes de Montbui, near Barcelona, who donated his Lullian books to the school in 1434; Bartomeu Bols, priest of Santa Maria del Mar related to Antoni Sedacer who at his death (1439) possessed more than thirty Lullian works; and Bernat Frigola, another priest of Santa Maria del Mar, also a student of the school in 1434 and finally its rector and administrator at least since 1444. There are other early manuscripts whose composition can be located in the Catalan area. This seems to be the case, at least, of MS. 337 of the Biblioteca Riccardiana of Florence, MS. lat XVI, 57 [=4329] of the Biblioteca Marciana of Venice, MS. Clm. 10546 of the Bayerische Staatsbibliothek and MS. Vat. lat. 4850. Gabriella Pomaro's palaeographical analysis of the first witness shows that it may have been copied in north Catalonia.³⁶ The second one was copied by a scribe called Guillem de Reus, and the last one by another called Bernat Guasch. The copy of the Munich codex was made by a hermit who, having transcribed the whole Latin text of the work and its colophon, wrote this note in Catalan: "Pregats per lo pobre ermità qui aquest libre escrit ha a fi que Déus per ell sia loat, servit, conegut e amat" ("Pray for the poor hermit who has written this book in order that God be praised, served, known and loved by him").³⁷

There are three other codices that have a precise Majorcan origin: MSS. 1025 and 991 of the Biblioteca Pública of Palma—the first records only chapter 199 of the *Proverbs of Ramon*—, and MS. 36.E.34 of the Biblioteca Corsiniana of Rome. It is not known who copied or ordered the compilation of the first one, but its history is totally linked to Majorca.³⁸ The last one includes an annotation at the end of the work (fol. 200v) that

³⁶ Gabriella Pomaro and Viola Tenge-Wolf, "Primi passi per lo «scriptorium» lulliano, con una nota filologica," *Studia Lulliana*, 48 (2008), 9-10.

³⁷ See Josep Perarnau, *Els manuscrits lul·lians medievals de la «Bayerische Staatsbibliothek» de Munic. II. Volums de textos llatins* (Barcelona: Facultat de Teologia de Catalunya, 1986), pp. 149-52.

³⁸ In the eighteenth century the codex belonged to the convent of Saint Dominic in Palma—there are two ex-libris that date from this century. In fol. 117r there is a drawing that Maribel Ripoll has identified with the Majorcan dance of *cossiers* (see Maria Isabel Ripoll, "Edició crítica i estudi introductor del Llibre d'intenció de Ramon Llull", PhD diss., Universitat de les Illes Balears, 2012, pp. 26-38).

places the copy on the island in 1484.³⁹ Finally, MS. 991 was copied by a *civis* and merchant of Mallorca, Antonius Sparech, in 1457. This last codex was completed in the seventeenth century by the rector of the parish church of Calvià, in Majorca, and professor of Lullian philosophy, Josep Gili. The major circulation of the text in the Catalan area is confirmed by the references found in other inventories, beginning with the list of twenty Lullian works condemned, according to the inquisitor Nicolau Eimeirc, by a bull of Pope Gregory XI. Eimeric intensively persecuted some groups of Lullists in the second half of the fourteenth century. As Hillgarth remarks, the appearance of the *Proverbs of Ramon* in this list clearly demonstrates that it was a well-known and much read book. It seems that the text also had a quite acceptable circulation in Catalan, much richer than the surviving textual tradition might lead us to think.⁴⁰ Joan Desbrull, a Majorcan bachelor of medicine and *civis*, had a *Llibre de proverbis* written in the vernacular on parchment when he died in 1417. There was also a Catalan copy of the text in the Royal Palace at the death of King Martin (1410). We have already seen that Martí de Vilaragut had two copies, one in Catalan, and there is another reference to a vernacular version of the *Proverbs of Ramon* in an inventory from Perpignan dated 1435.

On the other hand, there is evidence that the collection had a good reception in northern Italy. Miquel Batllori had already listed the copies of Italian origin in his classic study of Italian Lullism.⁴¹ However, the only fourteenth- or fifteenth-century manuscript that makes explicit its Italian origin and the name of the scribe is MS. 10001 of the Biblioteca Riccardiana of Florence, which contains a large anthology of philosophical and theological Lullian works, most of them authentic but some not.⁴² On fol. 166v the scribe, a monk called Nicolaus Muckenwalt, from Prussia, states that he copied the manuscript in 1417 and 1418 at the monastery of Saint Jerome of Cervara, in the region of Genoa. We have seen that MS.

³⁹ This annotation has not been recorded by the scribe and perhaps is due to the Sicilian Lullist Leonardo d'Ortiglia, a disciple of Majorcan Pere Dagui, one of the most important Lullists of the fifteenth century. Leonardo copied on the same date two other codices containing Lullian works (see the corresponding entry in the section "Lullists" of Lull DB).

⁴⁰ Jocelyn N. Hillgarth, *Readers and Books in Majorca, 1229-1550* (Paris: Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, 1991), vol. I, pp. 204-5.

⁴¹ Miquel Batllori, "El lulismo en Italia. Ensayo de síntesis," *Revista de Filosofía*, 2 (1944), 291-92.

⁴² This codex has been studied by Francesco Santi, "Osservazioni sul manoscritto 1001 della Biblioteca Riccardiana di Firenze, per la storia del Lullismo nelle regioni meridionali dell'Impero nel secolo XIV", *Arxiu de Textos Catalans Antics*, 5 (1986), 231-267; and Pomaro & Tenge-Wolf, "Primi passi", pp. 21-8.

337 of the same library was copied by a Catalan hand, but it is annotated by an Italian one of the early fifteenth century. There are two codices in the Canonici collection of the Bodleian Library in Oxford (MS. Canon. Misc. 299 and 332), copied in the fourteenth century, which come from Italy and were most probably compiled there. In fact, the first one shows an ex-libris in fol. 1r, now partially erased, probably of the fifteenth century: “Iste liber est monacorum congregationis sancte justine ordinis sancti benedicti deputatus [...]”.⁴³ The current state of this annotation does not allow us to know exactly which of the abbeys of the congregation of Saint Justine possessed the manuscript, but at least it locates the codex in Italy in the late Middle Ages.⁴⁴ Another witness that was probably copied in Italy is MS. III, 116 [=2208] of the Biblioteca Marciana of Venice. It includes four Lullian works apart from the *Proverbs of Ramon*, all in Latin—the *Liber apostrophe* (1296), the *Liber super Psalmum “Quicumque vult”* (1288), the *Liber de amico et amato* (1283) and the *Disputatio quinque hominum sapientium* (1294)— and a non-Lullian item. In a catalogue of some Venetian libraries published in 1650 by Giacomo Filippo Tomasini,⁴⁵ we find a mention of an identical codex containing exactly the same works, in the list of books located in the library of Sant’Antonio di Castello, a church built in the fourteenth century and demolished in 1810. This library was donated in 1523 by Domenico Grimani, patriarch of Aquileia (1497-1517) and son of the doge Antonio Grimani. Since most of the books of this library were destroyed in a fire that affected the church in 1636,⁴⁶ it is more likely that the codex described by Tomasini in the early seventeenth century was perhaps a copy of the Marciana manuscript. In any case, whether we have to identify the two manuscripts or not, it is almost certain that the surviving one was in Venice at least at the end of the fifteenth century. But we have to say that in the same period the *Proverbs of Ramon* had also travelled to Sicily,

⁴³ This transcription comes from J.M Batista, “Catàlech de les obres lulianes d’Oxford,” *Boletín de la Real Academia de Buenas Letras de Barcelona*, 8 (1915-1916), 11-12.

⁴⁴ There is a similar note of ownership in MS. C.79 of the Biblioteca Capitolare of Padua. According to Pomaro & Tenge-Wolf, *Primi passi*, pp. 17-19, it comes from the monastery of Saint Justine of Padua.

⁴⁵ Giacomo Filippo Tomasini, *Bibliothecae venetae manuscriptae publicae et privatae, quibus diversi scriptores hactenus incogniti recensentur* (Udine: typis Nicolai Schiratti, 1650), 11.

⁴⁶ See Marino Zorzi, *La Libreria di San Marco. Libri, lettori, società nella Venezia dei Dogi* (Milan: Arnoldo Mondadori Editore, 1987), p. 103.

because we find it in the library of a teacher from Termini called Nicolas de Rabuazio, with seven other Lullian or pseudo-Lullian works.⁴⁷

Even though we have reviewed only a small portion of the textual tradition and archival notices of the *Proverbs of Ramon*, mainly from the fifteenth century, it is patent that the collection was able to reach a large audience of great social diversity. The book has been appreciated by teachers and scholars like those of the Lullian School of Barcelona, the Majorcan bachelor Joan Desbrull, Mario de Passa or the Sicilian teacher just mentioned. Many priests and friars possessed it or referred to it (Nicolau Eimeric, Antoni Sedacer, Martí de Vilaragut, Joan Reig, Domenico Grimani, etc.), at least one copy was written by a monk and a Benedictine Italian monastery owned another one. It appears that the book, as with other Lullian works, gained the attention of spiritual friars and laymen in the fourteenth century, as the identity of the scribe of MS. Clm. 10546 from Munich suggests and Josep Perarnau has pointed out.⁴⁸ Finally, there are also jurists and *cives*, such as Francesc Sirvent (doc. 1422) or Antonius Sparech, interested in the *Proverbs of Ramon*. And we cannot forget that the book also reached the Catalan royal library. If we were to pursue its itinerary we would see that the *Proverbs of Ramon* had eminent readers, beginning with the cardinal and philosopher Nicholas of Cusa (1400/1401-1464),⁴⁹ the doctor of emperors Maximilian and Charles V Nicolaus Pol (d. 1532), who possessed a rich Lullian library,⁵⁰ the French humanist Jacques Lefèvre d'Étaples (ca. 1455-1536), who published the work in

⁴⁷ See Henri Bresc, *Livre et société en Sicile (1299-1499)* (Palermo: Centro de studi filologici e linguistici siciliani, 1971), pp. 138-39.

⁴⁸ Josep Perarnau, "Consideracions diacròniques entorn dels manuscrits lul·lians medievals de la «Bayerische Staatsbibliothek» de Munic", *Arxiu de Textos Catalans Antics*, 2 (1983), 131-35.

⁴⁹ One of the Lullian manuscripts from his library, the MS. 85 of Hospital of Saint Nicholas, in Kues, includes the *Proverbs of Ramon*. See Gabriella Pomaro, "I manoscritti Lulliani di Cusano: lo status quaestionis," in *Niccolò Cusano, l'uomo, i libri, l'opera. Atti del LII Convegno storico internazionale. Todi, 11-14 ottobre 2015* (Spoleto: Centro Italiano di Studi sull'Alto Medioevo, 2016), pp. 183-222.

⁵⁰ An important part of the manuscripts owned by Pol entered the Biblioteca della Collegiata d'Innichen, South Tirol, Italy, thanks to the canon Johann Prey. That which preserves the collection of proverbs is MS. VIII.B.16. These codices had been studied by Jordi Rubió, "Los códices lulianos de la biblioteca de Innichen (Tirol)," *Revista de Filología Española*, 4 (1917), 303-40; collected in Jordi Rubió, *Ramon Llull i el lul·lisme* (Barcelona: Publicacions de l'Abadia de Montserrat, 1985), pp. 380-429.