

The Belligerent Prelate

The Belligerent Prelate:
An Alliance between Archbishop Daniel Mannix
and Eamon de Valera

By

Patrick Mannix

**CAMBRIDGE
SCHOLARS**

P U B L I S H I N G

The Belligerent Prelate:
An Alliance between Archbishop Daniel Mannix and Eamon de Valera,
by Patrick Mannix

This book first published 2012

Cambridge Scholars Publishing

12 Back Chapman Street, Newcastle upon Tyne, NE6 2XX, UK

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Copyright © 2012 by Patrick Mannix

All rights for this book reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the copyright owner.

ISBN (10): 1-4438-3499-8, ISBN (13): 978-1-4438-3499-5

I dedicate this book to my family & friends who have provided the hours of countless support that made this dream become a reality.

Omnia Omnibus – All Things to All Men

—Archbishop Daniel Mannix's Episcopal Motto

TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Illustrations	ix
Foreword	xi
Dr. Ruan O'Donnell	
Preface	xiii
Acknowledgements	xv
Abbreviations	xix
Introduction	1
Chapter One.....	17
Community Politics (1845-1882)	
Chapter Two	29
Maynooth, a Gaelic Institution? (1882-1913)	
Chapter Three	49
Building a New Life in Ireland and Australia (1913-1919)	
Chapter Four.....	71
The Belligerent Prelate (1919-1920)	
Chapter Five	93
Unchanged and Unchangeable: Forever Anti-Treaty (1920-1925)	
Chapter Six.....	115
A Continuing Presence (1925-1960)	
Conclusion.....	139

Appendix A	159
Archbishop Mannix Speech at the Opening of a Floral Fete at West Melbourne Sunday 30 th April 1916	
Appendix B.....	161
Archbishop Mannix Speech at the Opening of a New Christian Brothers' School at Brunswick 28 th January 1917	
Appendix C.....	163
De Valera Speech at Fenway Park, Boston 29 th June 1919	
Appendix D	167
Australian Hierarchy Letter to <i>The Times</i> 13 th August 1920	
Appendix E.....	169
Irish Hierarchy Letter during the War of Independence	
Appendix F.....	171
Archbishop Mannix Homecoming Speech at the Exhibition Building Melbourne 13 th August 1921	
Appendix G	179
Eamon de Valera Letter to Archbishop Mannix 6 th November 1922	
Appendix H	183
William T. Cosgrave Letter to Archbishop Mannix 17 th December 1923	
Appendix I.....	189
Killarney Urban District Council Address to His Grace The Most Rev. Daniel Mannix D.D Archbishop of Melbourne on the Occasion of his Visit to Killarney, 1 st July 1925	
Bibliography.....	191
Index.....	201

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

Front Cover: President of The Irish Republic Eamon De Valera & Archbishop Daniel Mannix of Melbourne, Australia during their visit to Boys Town, Omaha, Nebraska – June 1920	
3-1. St. Patrick's Cathedral, Melbourne, Australia	51
3-2. Raheen, Melbourne, Australia - Former Residence of Archbishop Daniel Mannix of Melbourne	54
3-3. Archbishop Daniel Mannix Postcard 1920	62
4-1. Father Flanagan, founding director of Boys Town, standing left of visitors: Archbishop Daniel Mannix of Melbourne, Australia, unknown, President of Irish Republic Eamon De Valera and Bishop Foley of Ballarat, Australia during their visit to Boys Town, Nebraska, USA 192074	
4-2. Signed photograph of Eamon de Valera.....	75
5-1. Archbishop Mannix (date/location unknown).....	112
6-1. Archbishop Mannix aboard the Oceanic Liner June 15 1926	118
7-1. Archbishop Daniel Mannix, Raheen 1963	148
7-2. Autograph signature of Eamon de Valera and Archbishop Daniel Mannix on Archbishop Mannix's Episcopal Golden Jubilee Commemoration Luncheon leaflet.	149
7-3. Archbishop Daniel Mannix statue Melbourne, Australia sculpted by Nigel Boonham.....	155
7-4. Archbishop Daniel Mannix statue inscription Melbourne, Australia.....	156

FOREWORD

De Valera and Mannix: two leaders, one vision?

More than any other figure Eamon de Valera can be considered the architect of modern Ireland. A role at the forefront of revolutionary politics in the early Twentieth Century entailed direct engagement in several key stages of Ireland's emergence from the United Kingdom and British Empire. American citizenship and good fortune enabled de Valera to survive the bloody aftermath of the 1916 Rising when all other leaders of his stature were executed by the British military. By no means merely the last man standing, he steered the reorganization of militant Irish republicanism with skill, vision and determination and helped achieve the landslide democratic endorsement of the project in the 1918 General Election. Victory paved the way for the creation of the first Dáil, which, although unrecognized by Westminster, comprised the most democratic and sovereign authority in Irish history. Britain's repudiation of the will of the Irish electorate set the stage for the War of Independence and the dispiriting Civil War which ensued.

By then de Valera's path had already crossed that of the ascendant Daniel Mannix, who from 1917 served as Archbishop of Melbourne, a stronghold of Irish-Australian power and influence. Mannix shared de Valera's Munster origins, devout Catholicism and dynamic ambition. Physical detachment did not prevent the causes of Irish sovereignty and national identity providing common ground for two of the main voices on Ireland's destiny in the 1910s into the 1960s. The robust leadership of Mannix drove Australia's ethnic Irish and Catholic communities into the political centre of a new nation enjoying the benefits of 'home rule' from 1900. Achieving comparable advances in his native country was a life long goal which he addressed primarily through support for de Valera.

The personal bond between the two leaders was all the more striking for spanning the globe and multiple decades. Contexts inevitably shifted over time yet the common ground remained and this rare sense of international joint interest matured. Concurrent involvement in major campaigns against conscription in 1918 in both Ireland and Australia evidenced an early

manifestation of this phenomenon. At the same time that de Valera became globally prominent as the public face of Sinn Fein, Mannix consolidated his position with the Catholic church in Australasia and used his growing religious constituency and temporal authority to bolster Ireland's nascent republican democracy.

A characteristically bold attempt at personal intervention was only prevented in August 1920 when British authorities seized Mannix in order to prevent him landing in Ireland during the War of Independence. The archbishop, however, could not be silenced and maintained his firm and open identification with the agenda of de Valera's clique. Both men experienced detention for their political activities, weathered the challenges of negotiating their ideological objectives with determined opponents and survived the general travails of occupying high office in restive times. De Valera, although defeated in a Civil War which claimed the lives of many close associates, rose to the office of President of Ireland and a leading position in the League of Nations. Mannix, perpetually controversial in Australian society, was unquestionably the country's most pre-eminent churchman when he died in office in Melbourne in 1963.

Patrick Mannix explores the origins of an unusual and complicated relationship in this compelling, detailed and nuanced new account. He draws on many new strands of analysis and information to provide a highly readable yet authoritative study of leadership, comradeship and power in the Irish world.

Dr. Ruan O'Donnell
University of Limerick
May 2012

PREFACE

This book is an examination and evaluation from a historical perspective of the alliance that was established and forged between the former taoiseach and President of Ireland, Eamon de Valera and the former president of Maynooth and archbishop of Melbourne, Australia, Dr Daniel Mannix.

Both men played a significant role, through their intervention in both the political and clerical fields, in the most formative years of Ireland's fight for independence and subsequent goal to stabilise the new state during the years 1916 to 1948. As relating to this period this book will examine how de Valera often turned to Mannix as a sort of fatherly figure for advice on a number of issues relating to Ireland's push for independence. These issues included the influence of the Irish diaspora, the taking of the oath of allegiance and the future of partition in Ireland. The vast Irish diaspora worldwide including Dr Mannix, through their support, both financially and physically, and through demonstrations held for Ireland, helped keep the push for autonomy alive.

Having examined the role the archbishop played through his relationship with de Valera and the clergy the book will appraise how Dr Mannix, so revered at one stage in Irish society, later became such an isolated and neglected figure in Irish history. This historical analysis will be grounded in research of both primary and secondary sources including previously undocumented oral evidence, archival papers, written public and private correspondence between the two characters and a range of visual sources.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book originated during my Leaving Certificate year in the Intermediate School Killorglin. Therefore, my first debt is to my then history teacher Mr Shane O'Shea who first informed me of the connection between Archbishop Mannix and Eamon de Valera. This book would not have come to fruition; however, had it not been for the considerable support, guidance and perceptive criticism received from my supervisor Dr Ruan O'Donnell over the past number of years. I would also like to thank the staff and members of the History Department at the University of Limerick, especially Dr Bernadette Whelan, Dr John O'Callaghan, Dr Mícheál Ó hAodha and Paul Hayes for their help and support. I would also like to thank Dr John Logan and Dr Mary Harris for their constructive roles as examiners during my research masters degree.

In the process of researching and writing this book, I have greatly benefited from the kind and generous assistance of many people and institutions. Firstly, to Mr Jeremiah O'Callaghan who so kindly allowed me to use some of his own personal resources to help with the final fruition of this book. Sincere thanks also to Fr Brian Murphy for the numerous occasions he offered advice to me and pointed me in the right direction. I am extremely grateful to the Sisters of Mercy in Charleville for all their help, support and advice particularly Sr Mary Lyons and Sr Mary Coleman. To Brenda Niall for her advice, help and direction following on from her recent excellent research on Fr Hackett along with Danny Cusack for his help with sourcing material. To Val Noone & Rachel Naughton in Australia for providing me with useful information from the Australian perspective along with Jim and Helga Griffin for their warm support and advice. To the staff and my friends in the Houses of the Oireachtas – Committees and Library & Research sections who were always very supportive and helpful over the years with my numerous queries, especially Art, Eileen, Mary, Anna and Seamus.

Thanks to the exceptionally helpful staff of the University College Dublin Archives especially Mrs Kate Manning and Mr Seamus Helferty; the Director of the National Archives of Ireland and the staff especially Elizabeth McEvoy and Aideen Ireland; the staff of the National Archives of England, Kew; Archbishop Diarmuid Martin and Noelle Dowling at the Dublin Diocesan Archives for their help and permission; Penny Woods

and Susan Durack at the Russell Library and Collections Library in Maynooth; the Central Catholic Library especially Mrs Teresa Whittington; Limerick County Library, Limerick Local Library in Dooradoyle and the staff at Limerick City Museum especially Brian Hodkinson. My thanks also to Ken Bergin of the Special Collections Department of the Glucksman Library at the University of Limerick; the staff and Director at the National Library of Ireland. My gratitude to Vicky Moran and John Glendon of RTÉ Library & Archives for their endless perseverance. The staff at Trinity College Dublin Library particularly Trevor Peare for allowing me to use Patrick Murray's theses. ABC Australia, in particular, Amy Donald.

Thanks to Mrs Margaret Pigott of Killarney Town Council for her kind assistance in acquiring the Killarney Urban District Council Minutes for me. The staff at Killarney town library especially Mrs Mary Murray as well as the staff at Kerry Local Studies & Archives in Tralee.

Sincere thanks to the Columban Fathers in the USA for sending me the account of their former Regional Director Fr McCarthy. My gratitude also to the Provincial Minister of the Order of Friars Minor Capuchin, Ireland as well as archivist Dr Brian Kirby. I am very grateful to the co-operation of Mr Henry Scannell of the Boston Public Library's Microtext Department and Mrs Anne Butler of U.L.'s Glucksman library for sourcing de Valera's speech at Fenway Park in 1919. A very special heartfelt thanks to Mr Martin Fagan and the Rector of the Irish College in Rome. Joe Fanning in particular at Getty Images for his patience and help during the publication process. Mr Tony Grieve for his information on the Archbishop Mannix foundation. To Karan Oberoi, Sarah Callanan, Pádraig Ó Mairtín, Barry Finnegan, Anthony Cawley and anyone else I have forgotten to mention. Thanks to all these friendly, helpful and courteous people, this piece of historical research was able to come to fruition.

During the many draftings of the final text, I have had the benefit of constructive criticism from many people, but I would especially like to thank Mrs Mary Guerin and Fr Tom Looney for their detailed and helpful comments.

I would especially like to thank my publishers, Cambridge Scholars Publishing and the very helpful, friendly and patient staff including Soucin Yip-Sou, Amanda Millar and Carol Koulikourdi. Thank you all.

To the extended surviving family of Archbishop Mannix especially Mrs Patricia Wallis-McCombe and Mr McCombe for welcoming me into their home and being so kind and generous throughout my research, my heartfelt thanks. Also to Mrs Winifred Cross and Mrs Mary Ellen McCarthy in America for sending me excellent material and providing

useful links to Dr Mannix's past. To Jim Leo for his time and assistance in unlocking aspects of the Archbishop's childhood. Thank you all sincerely.

Finally to my family and my girlfriend for their support, love, and ability to tolerate the trials and tribulations that come with undertaking such a book – my girlfriend Anna, my brother John Paul, my brother-in-law Chris, my sisters Norita and Helen, my niece Molly Lucia and most importantly my parents John and Christina. This book is dedicated to them.

Patrick J. Mannix, April 2012

Permissions

I am grateful to the publishers, archivists and editors who granted permission to reproduce here material that originally appeared in their scholarly journals, collections or other publications. These include the National Library of Ireland, National Archives of Ireland, National Archives of England, RTÉ Library & Archives, Limerick City Museum, ABC Australia, Oxford University Press, Cork University Press, The Orion Publishing Group, Continuum International Publishing Company, Transaction Publishers, Taylor & Francis Ltd. (www.tandfonline.com), Sage Publications, Edinburgh University Press (www.euppublishing.com), HarperCollins Publishers Ltd., Random House Group Ltd., Order of Friars Minor Capuchin, Ireland, Cambridge University Press and Irish American Cultural Institute, UCD School of History & Archives, Dublin Diocesan Archives and the Maynooth College Archives. Milo Spillane of Crom Abú, Tom O'Donovan of the Old Limerick Journal, Philip O'Connell of the Charleville and district historical journal and finally the Irish National Association of Australasia.

T. M. Healy, *Letters and Leaders of My Day*; John, O'Sheehan, *Archbishop Mannix: A Sketch of His Life and Work*; Cearbhall O'Briain, *Dr. Mannix in Australia*; Dr. Daniel Mannix, *Speeches of His Grace* are courtesy of the National Library of Ireland. The quotation from the Turbulent Priest is courtesy of RTÉ Library & Archives. Archbishop Mannix on the campaign against the oath is courtesy of Limerick City Museum. "The Riddle of Father Hackett", *Late Night Live*; Archbishop Mannix during an interview with Gerald Lyons are reproduced by permission of the Australian Broadcasting Corporation and ABC Online. (c) (2009) ABC. All rights reserved. B.A., Santamaria, *Santamaria: A Memoir* is reproduced by permission of Oxford University Press Australia

& New Zealand. © Oxford University Press. Whyte, J. H., 'The Influence of the Catholic Clergy...' is reproduced by permission of Oxford University Press. Dermot Keogh, *Ireland and the Vatican*; Senia Paseta, *Before the Revolution*; Patrick O'Farrell, *The Irish in Australia*; Corkery, Daniel, *Synge and Anglo-Irish Literature*; John A. Murphy, 'The Achievement of de Valera'; Printed with the kind permission of Cork University Press, Youngline Industrial Estate, Pouladuff, Togher, Cork. Elias Canetti, *Crowds and Power* is printed with permission from Weidenfeld & Nicolson, an imprint of The Orion Publishing Group, London. Moirin Chavasse, *Terence MacSwiney* and Davis, Graham, 'The Historiography of the Irish Famine' are printed with permission from the Continuum International Publishing Company. Sidney Hook, *The Hero in History* Copyright © 2012 by Transaction Publishers. Reprinted by permission of the publisher. *British Journal of Ethnomusicology* publisher (Taylor & Francis Ltd, www.tandfonline.com) Reprinted by kind permission of the publisher. *Journal of Contemporary History* and Duck, Steve, *Human Relationships* publisher Sage Publications. Reprinted by kind permission of the publisher. *Irish University Review* publisher (Edinburgh University Publishing, www.euppublishing.com). *Collins English dictionary* reprinted by permission of HarperCollins Ltd. © (1991).

Eamon de Valera by Thomas O'Neill and the Earl of Longford; *De Valera: Long Fellow, Long Shadow* by Tim Pat Coogan, published by Hutchinson. Reprinted by permission of The Random House Group Limited. *Inventing Ireland: The Literature of a Modern Nation* by Declan Kiberd published by Vintage Books. Reprinted by permission of The Random House Group Limited. The Capuchin Annual © Capuchin Provincial Archives, Dublin, Ireland. *Placing Friendship in Context* reprinted by kind permission of Cambridge University Press. Rev. Ebsworth, *Archbishop Mannix*; James Murtagh, *Australia: The Catholic Chapter*; *Footprints: Quarterly Journal of the Melbourne Historical Commission* reprinted by kind permission of the Catholic Archdiocese of Melbourne ©. In the absence of clear copyright ownership, the publishers, the Catholic Archdiocese of Melbourne have given permission to use Frank Murphy, *Daniel Mannix. Éire Ireland* reprinted by kind permission of the Irish American Cultural Institute. *The Irish Uprising, 1914-1921* Contains public sector information licensed under the Open Government License v1.0. www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-license/

ABBREVIATIONS

GAA	Gaelic Athletic Association
GPO	General Post Office
FOIF	Friends of Irish Freedom
ICA	Irish Citizens Army
INA	Irish National Association
IPP	Irish Parliamentary Party
IRA	Irish Republican Army
IRB	Irish Republican Brotherhood
IRPDF	Irish Republican Prisoners Dependant Fund
UVF	Ulster Volunteer Force

INTRODUCTION

Historian Joe Broderick first highlighted a “special” relationship that existed between Eamon de Valera and Archbishop Daniel Mannix in 1994, fourteen years after de Valera’s death. Broderick wrote how:

Nowadays Daniel Mannix merits no more than a footnote – often a misleading one – in texts on the War of Independence and its aftermath. Yet his performance had considerable bearing on the course of events. And for a moment at least, in 1921, he played a starring role on the stage of Irish history.¹

Broderick recast Archbishop Daniel Mannix of Melbourne, who had been a vital player in the War of Independence, back into the central pages of Irish history. Archbishop Mannix’s relationship with de Valera is a significant component of modern Irish history that needs to be investigated in depth, due to its historical importance and that is what this book will aim to achieve. The alliance de Valera had with Mannix is a significant connection that historians have often overlooked in their analysis of the Irish independence movement. This book will assess and analyse that alliance for its importance and relevance to Ireland’s fight for freedom and for the subsequent effect it had on both men’s distinguished careers.

This book will be able to offer an analysis of key events that took place in Ireland during the years 1920 to 1925, through the medium of de Valera and Mannix’s special relationship. Although de Valera is one of the two protagonists of this book, the investigation into their alliance will not be symmetrical. The book will rather consider the forgotten character of Archbishop Mannix and portray how his relationship with de Valera helped influence Irish affairs during the years 1920 to 1925. These years generate the core argument of the book, as the alliance between the two men was most active during this period. The primary evidence for this period of the alliance is also more abundant than for the latter period of their friendship, the years 1925 to 1963.

¹ Joe Broderick, ‘De Valera and Archbishop Daniel Mannix’ in *History Ireland*, 2 (3)1994, p. 37.

Why should their relationship be deemed as special? This book will suggest different reasons for this historical debate. Having been the first to acknowledge a special relationship, Broderick's work will be built on in detail. The discussion will offer an analysis of the impact the alliance between Eamon de Valera and Archbishop Mannix had on Irish national aspirations. One particular example why their relationship may be deemed special and merits further historical investigation, is that Mannix was the only member of the Irish clerical hierarchy, at home or abroad, who supported de Valera both during and after the Civil War, even though he received fierce criticism for doing so.² The primary objective of this book is to pick Mannix from the footnotes of history and replay the role his character had in the history of Ireland's fight for independence and allow the reader rediscover just how influential both he and de Valera were in their respective callings. This was largely due to each other.

Both men have had many critics and devotees over the years. Therefore, both have had two very different epitaphs written for them in the annals of Irish history. De Valera is a not-too-distant figure in the memory of the Celtic Tiger generation. He has drawn numerous publications on all aspects of his political career. The most recent, by Diarmuid Ferriter and John J. Turi, and the publicity that they generated, show just how controversial a character de Valera remains for Irish historians.³ De Valera kept a colossal archive of his life, now housed at University College Dublin and open to scrutiny and interpretation. Mannix, in stark contrast, has been kept within a Vatican-like sealed box, particularly the matter of his relationship with the Roman Catholic Church in Ireland and his role during the War of Independence. Mannix's part in the war has largely been consigned to certain biographies especially those of his close friend de Valera. Some of de Valera's key biographers, including the Earl of Longford and Thomas P. O'Neill, T. R. Dwyer, Tim Pat Coogan and most recently Diarmuid Ferriter, make only fleeting mention of any relationship between de Valera and Mannix.⁴ Only Longford and Coogan mention a connection between the two characters,

² *ibid*, p. 38.

³ Diarmuid Ferriter, *Judging Dev* (Dublin: Royal Irish Academy, 2007) and John J. Turi, *England's greatest spy: Eamon de Valera* (London: Stacey International, 2009).

⁴ T. R., Dwyer, *Eamon de Valera: The Man & the Myths* (Dublin: Paperview/Irish Independent, 2006) and T. P. Coogan, *De Valera: long fellow, long shadow* (London: Hutchinson, 1993) and The Earl of Longford and Thomas P. O'Neill, *Eamon de Valera* (London: Hutchinson, 1970) and Ferriter, *Judging Dev*.

both describe Mannix as an “old friend” of de Valera.⁵ In other works such as Dermot Keogh, *Ireland and the Vatican*, Mannix is described as “a strong supporter of Eamon de Valera”.⁶ The alliance that existed between the men is a chapter of Irish history, which needs to be written, and that is what will be achieved here as both men contributed immensely to the historical legacy of Ireland and, in Mannix’s case Irish Australia.

De Valera’s prominent position at the centre of Ireland’s fight for independence has been subjected to extensive analysis. Mannix for his part has largely been forgotten by Irish historians, but on the other hand, his legacy has been celebrated by the vast majority of Australian historians. Irish literature on de Valera views him either as the main catalyst behind the schism in Irish politics or, as the great leader of a revived Catholic Gaelic Ireland. Mannix is also seen as a divisive figure by some, particularly during his early years in Australia where some judge him of fomenting tension between the pro-Commonwealth Protestants and the anti-empire Catholics, primarily the ethnic Irish. Mannix, like de Valera, has had numerous biographies. However, the main difference between the two is that while de Valera’s papers survive, Mannix’s have been lost, because of his order to have them destroyed after his death. For this reason, the historian is now faced with a more difficult task of de-constructing a caricature. Historian T. P. Boland has correctly argued that ‘Mannix is responsible for the caricatures of himself that pass as history. He has left no one the wherewithal to correct the distortions of his character that are currently accepted.’⁷

The most extensive study of Mannix’s life was undertaken by Rev. Walter Ebsworth.⁸ His book provides the result of extensive research into every detail of his life. However, while it is extensive in detail it lacks analytical discussion and instead leaves that to others. The biographies by Frank Murphy, Colm Kiernan, B. A Santamaria and Michael Gilchrist all

⁵ Earl of Longford & O’Neill, op. cit., p. 204 and Coogan, op. cit., p. 639.

⁶ Dermot Keogh, *Ireland and the Vatican: the politics and diplomacy of church-state relations 1922-1960* (Cork: Cork University Press, 1995), p. 16.

⁷ T. P Boland, *The ascent of Tabor: writing the life of Archbishop Duhig* (Queensland: Aquinas Library, 1986). Aquanus Memorial Lecture, p. 5. http://library.acu.edu.au/other_collections_and_catalogues/aquinas_memorial_lectures/?a=49310

Date accessed 1 September 2010.

⁸ Rev. Walter Ebsworth, *Archbishop Mannix*, (Armadale, Vic.: H. H. Stephenson, 1977).

offer the analytical discussion that Ebsworth lacks.⁹ Santamaria's books on Mannix are written in a hagiographic style. A reason for this is that Santamaria was very much influenced by Mannix during his political life in Australia, as leader of the Democratic Labor Party. However, no work focuses on Mannix's relationship with de Valera as thoroughly as Kiernan does. In his *Daniel Mannix and Ireland*, he argues, "no one was more important than Mannix in promoting de Valera's cause and in its eventual triumph".¹⁰ Although outlining the key meetings between the two men and providing analysis of these it does not seek to develop further on the alliance that existed between de Valera and Mannix. He does argue however, "de Valera did what he could to develop his friendship with Mannix and to exploit it".¹¹ Kiernan was the son of former Irish ambassador to Australia, Mr T.J. Kiernan and would have been well placed to comment on Mannix's life due to his father's regular interaction with Mannix. Santamaria however, would also claim this right as he would later become the lay protégé of Mannix and, as will be argued later, became closer to Mannix as Mannix's relationship with de Valera became more distant and cordial. Santamaria's book, *Daniel Mannix: the Quality of Leadership*, maintains the respect and esteem that Santamaria held for Mannix during their friendship and finds it hard to offer a conflicting viewpoint on his former confidant. An objective middle ground will thus be sought through a range of sources, instead of through the medium of hyperbolic biographies of Mannix, alone, in order to offer the reader a more rounded insight into how their partnership developed.

This will be achieved firstly through surviving correspondence between the two men. The primary source that is most valuable is the "Mannix file" within the "Eamon de Valera Papers" at University College Dublin.¹² This collection provides this book with the best material for the alliance. However, the collection also has its limitations as only cordial handwritten letters from Mannix exist after 1932 suggesting the key correspondence between 1920 and 1932 has been lost forever. To compensate for the lack of correspondence with de Valera during the key

⁹ Frank Murphy, *Daniel Mannix: Archbishop of Melbourne 1917-1963* (Melbourne: Advocate Press, 1948) and Colm Kiernan, *Daniel Mannix and Ireland* (Morwell, Victoria: Alella Books, 1984) and B. A. Santamaria, *Archbishop Mannix: his contribution to the art of public leadership in Australia* (Melbourne: Melbourne University Publishing, 1978) and Michael Gilchrist, *Daniel Mannix: wit and wisdom* (Melbourne: Ihs Press, 2nd ed., 2005).

¹⁰ Kiernan, op. cit., p. 223.

¹¹ *ibid*, p. 187.

¹² UCD Archives: De Valera papers, P150.

period, 1920 to 1925, The Monsignor John Hagan papers stored at the Irish College in Rome play a valuable role.¹³ These papers highlight Mannix's significance in the talks that took place in Rome in 1924, paving the way for the formation of Fianna Fáil and its entry into Dáil Éireann. Historian Richard J. Evans acknowledged effectively the essential role that such letters and correspondence play in historical research by commenting:

A text is always written for a readership and framed according to the writer's expectations of how the intended readers will take it. Similarly, the reader is always mindful of the purposes and intentions of the writer during the act of reading. All this remains true even when people read a document not addressed to them – people like historians, in fact.¹⁴

Other key archives used to indicate Mannix's influence on Irish affairs from 1920 to 1925 include files on Mannix at the National Archives of Ireland.¹⁵ These files provide us with key views from the former Taoiseach, William T. Cosgrave and shed light on the reaction of other bishops in the antipodes to political developments in Ireland. The National Archives of the UK at Kew, London also house files on Mannix relating to the views and worries of the British Foreign Office on key incidents involving Mannix between the years 1920 to 1925.¹⁶ Other key deposits, including those of Archbishop William Walsh in the Dublin Diocesan Archives, throw light on the kind of president Mannix was at Maynooth.¹⁷ Some primary sources relating to the archbishop are contained here. The Maynooth College Archives have a file relating to Mannix but unfortunately, it does not contain any new primary accounts relating to his alliance with de Valera.¹⁸

This book will offer an analysis of how the alliance between these two men was formed. Two main themes will also dominate this book, church-state relations in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century Ireland and the relationship between the fledgling Irish state and its wider Irish diaspora. The book will use the two men as "markers" for their respective fields to highlight the dominant themes. Mannix will be viewed as a symbol of the Irish diaspora particularly in Irish Australia along with the

¹³ Irish College Rome: Msgr. Hagan papers, HAG1.

¹⁴ Richard J. Evans, *In defence of history* (London: Granta Books, 1997), pp 106-107.

¹⁵ National Archives of Ireland/NAI, D/Taoiseach, S1369.

¹⁶ National Archives of the UK, CO537/1144.

¹⁷ Dublin Diocesan Archives, AB6/336 (uncatalogued)

¹⁸ Maynooth College Archives, 20-7-16.

Roman Catholic Church in Ireland. De Valera will be used as the symbol of the Irish State particularly once he was elected to power in 1932.

The theme of church-state relations has always played a part in Irish society but from the early nineteenth century, as Whyte argues, the church:

... no longer felt that political action was necessarily and in all circumstances wrong; and as the main issue in Irish affairs at this period was one which clearly concerned them – Catholic emancipation – it was likely to be only a matter of time before they began to intervene in politics.¹⁹

In the early part of the nineteenth century, church-state relations moved from the clergy taking a laissez-faire attitude to politics, to taking a more pro-active interest in events, particularly those relating to religious matters. Although the famine did untold damage to the congregation of the church through death and emigration, the church from the 1850s onwards, with Cardinal Paul Cullen leading from the front, would once again rise to the question of political involvement of the clergy. Cullen would become one of the most influential men of the Roman Catholic Church in Ireland in the second half of the nineteenth century. Dermot Keogh argues that, “no other cleric in the nineteenth century did more to reform and Romanise the Irish Church.”²⁰ As the church moved into the twentieth century, others such as Cardinal D’alton and Logue and Archbishops Croke and Walsh took up the mantle of Cullen. However, with the rise of the Irish parliamentary party under Parnell, the church’s influence began to decline. The church threw whatever weight it had left behind the anti-Parnellite party and as Whyte suggests:

... the violence with which so many clergy threw themselves into the struggle against the Parnellites can at least partly be ascribed to a feeling that this was their last chance to restore their now rapidly waning authority in political matters.²¹

The Irish church was peculiar in its relationship with the state at this period compared to other European countries. As Miller argues:

¹⁹ J. H. Whyte, ‘The influence of the Catholic clergy on elections in nineteenth century Ireland’ in *The English Historical Review*, 75 (295) 1960, p. 240.

²⁰ Dermot Keogh, *Ireland and the Vatican: the politics and diplomacy of church-state Relations 1922-1960* (Cork: Cork University Press, 1995), p. 3.

²¹ Whyte, *op. cit.*, p. 257.

... the fact that the Irish Church had not enjoyed a privileged position under the State in the centuries prior to the appearance of the Nation as a meaningful political force both strengthened her positive moral influence over the people and partially shielded her from the kind of attacks which several continental States were making upon the Church at this time.²²

In the period when Mannix and de Valera were born, towards the latter half of the nineteenth century, the dominant trends in church-state relations were that the:

... state would respect the Church's vested interests, especially in the area of publicly financed education, and that the Church would use her very considerable influence to curb direct challenges to the State's monopoly of physical force.²³

This position would change with the formation of the Irish Free State when Mannix and de Valera's capacity to influence Irish national affairs was most dominant.

The characters' relationship also provides valuable insight into the relationship between Ireland and its diaspora. In emphasising the role of the Irish diaspora with particular focus on the Irish-Australian community, Mannix is an important example of the diaspora's influence and contribution to Irish affairs, even from countries as far away as Australia and the U.S.A. The relationship will highlight the part, which the diaspora played in Irish affairs during the struggle for independence. Australia will play a big part in this book as the adopted home of the main character Archbishop Mannix. Not alone would it become his home, but it would also become home for many Irish who had emigrated there from the early nineteenth century onwards. As Oliver MacDonagh notes, "in no other region of settlement did the proportion of Irish among the immigrants equal – or nearly equal – Australia's during this century and a quarter".²⁴ The Irish would gain a foothold much more easily in Australia than in any other country. Historian David Fitzpatrick argues that, "the Irish had the advantage of being in on the act first, and never let the English or Scots

²² David W. Miller, *Church, state and nation in Ireland, 1898-1921* (Dublin: Gill & Macmillan, 1973), p. 3.

²³ *ibid.*, p. 4.

²⁴ Oliver MacDonagh, 'The Irish in Australia: a general view' in Oliver MacDonagh & W.F. Mandle (eds.) *Ireland and Irish-Australia: studies in cultural and political history* (London: Croom Helm, 1986), p. 159.

secure a monopoly of economic or political power”.²⁵ This Irish community, however, lacked social and political direction and Archbishop Mannix’s arrival gave the Irish-Australians this direction, as O’Farrell argues: “Mannix amounted to an Irish delegation that would not go away as the other had done, a permanent outside force that made Irish issues unavoidable”.²⁶ He kept alive support of the Irish cause with the diaspora in Australia and elsewhere even though, as MacDonagh suggests, considering the distance involved, the feelings were that “the separation was permanent and the disruption irreversible”.²⁷ This claim is re-enforced by prominent Irish-Australian historian Patrick O’Farrell who claims that by the time of the 1948 anti-partition tour, Irish-Australians interest in Irish national affairs had diminished. The 1948 anti-partition tour would be undertaken by de Valera to secure worldwide support for an end to partition in Ireland. O’Farrell argues that, “de Valera’s language was not the language of Australian politics, and by 1948 very few Irish Australians believed that Australia had anything to learn from Ireland”.²⁸

President Mary Robinson in her speech to a special joint sitting of the Houses of the Oireachtas, in 1995, gave an accurate summary of the story of the diaspora: “Emigration is not just a chronicle of sorrow and regret. It is also a powerful story of contribution and adaptation.”²⁹ The total figure the president gave for people with Irish descendants was seventy million.³⁰ However, back at the beginning of the twentieth century, “good authorities have estimated that between 1901 and 1921, at least eight million Irish men, women and children left Ireland”.³¹ Australia, America and Britain became the key destinations for Irish emigrants and would hence become solid bases for Irish national support in the years ahead. Mannix, like so

²⁵ David Fitzpatrick, ‘The settlers: immigration from Ireland in the nineteenth Century’ in Colm Kiernan (ed.) *Ireland and Australia* (Cork: The Mercier Press Ltd., 1984), p. 27.

²⁶ Patrick O’Farrell, *The Irish in Australia* (Kensington NSW: New South Wales University Press, 1987), p. 261.

²⁷ MacDonagh, op. cit., p. 162.

²⁸ Patrick O’Farrell, *The Irish in Australia: 1788 to the present* (Cork: Cork University Press, 2001), p. 304.

²⁹ Mary Robinson, ‘Address by Uachtarán na hÉireann Mary Robinson to joint sitting of the Houses of the Oireachtas, 2 February 1995, <http://www.oireachtas.ie/viewdoc.asp?fn=/documents/addresses/2Feb1995.htm> Date accessed 30 August 2010.

³⁰ Michael O’Sullivan, *Mary Robinson: the life and times of an Irish Liberal* (Dublin: Blackwater Press, 1993), p. 213.

³¹ Donald Harman Akenson, *The Irish diaspora: A primer* (Belfast: The Institute of Irish Studies, 1993), p. 15.

many before him, would set out on a voyage into the geographical unknown, for him, to Melbourne, Australia. Victoria's capital city would become the centre of Daniel Mannix's life for the next fifty years. In Melbourne, he would become the beacon of hope for Irish Australians. Mannix would articulate the views of the Irish diaspora and keep alive their interest in Irish national affairs.

The key tool of the Irish nationalist has always been rhetoric particularly, when aimed at garnering international support. Both Mannix and de Valera realised this at a very early stage, most notably during the American tour of 1920. The discourse used by both men in various public speeches and statements offer the historian a portal into a wide range of issues such as conscription, religion and independence. Both men focused on the most pertinent political and social questions of their day and were never afraid to challenge the accepted norm.

What this book will offer, and which differs from previous literature, is an exploration of the development of their alliance. It will show how through their correspondence and interaction they influenced each other's actions from the years 1920 to 1925. It will also examine how they influenced one another's respective opinions on the Irish cause and the diaspora. The examination of these two characters may lead to problems, as discussed previously by historians Boyce and O'Day when they commented; "revising national history is perilous, especially if cherished legends are debunked or heroes pushed off their pedestals".³² However, this book is not a revisionist examination of church-state relations but an analysis, ground in the present understandings of opinion on church-state structures and national acceptance of the Irish diaspora.

Church-state relations have changed dramatically in the period since the dawn of the Celtic Tiger economy in the late twentieth century, right up to the revelations in the Murphy Report in 2010.³³ Archbishop Mannix's life can be used to exemplify how the role of the prelate has changed in modern society with particular regard to church-state relations. The role of the state has also changed to an all-embracing attitude by the Irish government in its relationship with the wider diaspora, exemplified most effectively in the call for its expertise at the Global Irish Economic

³² D George Boyce & Alan O'Day, "Revisionism and the "revisionist controversy"" in D. George Boyce and Alan O'Day (eds.) *The making of modern Irish history*. (London: Routledge, 1996).

³³ Judge Yvonne Murphy, 'Report by Commission of Investigation into Catholic Archdiocese of Dublin', July 2009, <http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/PB09000504>, Date accessed 1 March 2010.

Forum at Farnleigh in 2009.³⁴ Using the vehicle of both public and political change in attitudes towards the diaspora and in church-state relations, this book will attempt like, “a generation of historians before it”, and in the words of T.W. Moody, “to interrogate the Irish past and, if necessary, the current public misunderstanding of it”.³⁵ The book will aim to draw a conclusion that should offer the reader a window into the past as objectively as possible and reconstruct the stage that allowed both actors to be so influential. The object of this analysis is to open up historical discussion on a chapter of Irish history that has largely been forgotten.

Historian Ian McBride believes that “in Ireland, as is well known, the interpretation of the past has always been at the heart of national conflict. Indeed the time-warped character of Irish mindsets has become a cliché of scholarly and unscholarly writing”.³⁶ This book will contribute to the understanding of the influence certain foreign prelates held over Irish affairs, men who were sometimes almost renegades battling against the church’s hierarchy. The Catholic Church in Ireland held significant influence over its clergy and their actions in the early twentieth century. Its authoritarian and disciplinarian manner had an influence not alone on Archbishop Mannix, but also on the ultra-Catholic de Valera. When they failed to accept the church’s early line on Irish national affairs and began to speak out, they threatened the accepted social doctrine and risked isolation. Keogh would argue that “it was through both their rhetoric and actions that this isolation manifested itself and quite possibly drove the two men closer together”.³⁷ Previous literature including works by Broderick and Keogh has touched on how Mannix brought high-profile clerical backing to de Valera during the Civil War. However, this discussion will focus on the relevance of Mannix’s support and whether it

³⁴ *The Irish Times*, ‘Martin hails ideas forum input’, 19 September 2009, <http://www.irishtimes.com/newspaper/breaking/2009/0919/breaking6.html>, date accessed 01 March 2010.

³⁵ T. W. Moody quoted in Declan Kiberd, ‘The elephant of revolutionary forgetfulness’ in Máirín Ní Dhonnchadha and Theo Dorgan (eds.) *Revising the Rising*. (Derry: Field Day, 1991), p. 6.

³⁶ Ian McBride, ‘Memory and identity in modern Ireland’ in Ian McBride (ed.) *History and memory in modern Ireland*. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), p. 1.

³⁷ Dermot Keogh, ‘Mannix, De Valera and Irish nationalism’, in John B. O’Brien and Paucic Travers (eds.) *The Irish emigrant experience in Australia* (Dublin: Poolbeg, 1991), p. 221.